

THE STATES OF DELIBERATION
of the
ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

4th September 2019

Proposition No. P.2019/66

Committee for Education, Sport & Culture

**Transforming Education Programme & Putting into effect the Policy Decisions made
by the States in 2018**

AMENDMENT

Proposed by: Deputy G A St Pier
Seconded by: Deputy L S Trott

To amend Propositions 1 and 2, delete and substitute Proposition 3 and delete Proposition 6 b) as follows:-

1. Amend Proposition 1 so that it reads: "To note that the capital costs of the policy of organising secondary education in one 11-18 school operating in two colleges, which was agreed by the States on the 19th of January 2018, will be up to a maximum of £77.9 million; and to delegate authority to the Policy & Resources Committee to approve expenditure up to a maximum of £77.9million charged to the Capital Reserve (in respect of the total project costs comprising building, transformation and transition, and the accommodation of services to children and their families which would benefit from working in closer partnership with the school and colleges) subject to the approval of appropriate business cases submitted by the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture which must demonstrate that the financial resources requested for the construction and operation of the preferred option balance cost and outcomes and therefore represent value for money, in the development of the 11-18 school and colleges on the sites of the current Les Beaucamps High School and St Sampson's High School as part of the Transforming Education Programme."
2. Amend Proposition 2 so that it reads: "To note that the capital costs of the policy of organising further and higher education in purpose-built facilities on a

single site, which was agreed by the States on the 19th of January 2018, will be up to a maximum of £51.1 million; direct the Policy & Resources Committee to add this project to the capital portfolio 2021 – 2025; and delegate authority to the Policy & Resources Committee to approve expenditure up to a maximum of £55.1million charged to the Capital Reserve (in respect of the total project costs comprising building; transformation and transition) subject to the approval of appropriate business cases submitted by the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture which must demonstrate that the financial resources requested for the construction and operation of the preferred option balance cost and outcomes and therefore represent value for money in the development of The Guernsey Institute at Les Ozouets as part of the Transforming Education Programme.”

Delete Proposition 3 and substitute therefor:

- “3. To direct the Policy & Resources Committee to exercise the authority delegated to it through rigorous review and challenge of the business cases presented and, in particular, an assessment as to whether the final proposals balance costs and benefits and therefore use public resources in a way that creates and maximises public value, including:
- a. the full capital costs of the project consisting of transformation, transition and community co-location costs in addition to building costs;
 - b. a baseline costed staffing structure, appropriately benchmarked, and explaining any deviation from existing policies;
 - c. a cost benefit justification for any additional investment required to operate the proposed staffing structure for the preferred model;
 - d. a cost benefit justification for any increased space requirements above the agreed baseline;
 - e. a cost benefit justification for any proposed additional space above the baseline to accommodate any further projected increase in student numbers, including a justification as to why additional numbers cannot be accommodated within existing contingencies for student numbers;

- f. a cost benefit justification for any repurposing and refurbishment works proposed at the Les Beaucamps High School and St Sampson’s High School sites;
- g. detail as to how the savings on revenue costs of operating the new model contribute to the “Balance of Budget Reduction” of £2.3million expected to be remaining for the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture after 2021;
- h. how the integration of SEN provision within the schools has impacted the space requirements in the new schools and the special school.”

4. Delete Proposition 6b.

Explanatory note

The Policy & Resources Committee is supportive of implementing the policy changes agreed by the States in 2018 to secondary and post 16 education and investing in the built environment necessary to bring those policies into effect and realise the intended benefits of the change.

This Amendment seeks to ensure, while the States are being asked to approve the education proposals and the selection of the sites for the 11-18 school, that there is a shared acknowledgment that the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture should put forward in its Outline Business Case evidence based proposals which clearly demonstrate value for money.

This Amendment retains the overall cost envelope proposed by the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture for the capital developments. However, the limits proposed by the Policy & Resources Committee allocate all associated costs to the 11-18 or Institute projects, as per the table below, and identify a source of funding for the expenditure:

Cost Type	11-18 (Proposition 1)	Institute (Proposition 2)	Total
	£’000	£’000	£’000
Buildings	69,000	47,500	116,500
Transformation & transition costs	4,900	3,600	8,500
Community co-location	4,000	-	4,000

TOTAL (as per this amendment)	77,900	51,100	129,000
Primary			22,400
Digital	-	-	5,800
GRAND TOTAL			157,200

In Proposition 2, the Policy & Resources Committee is proposing that the Guernsey Institute project, which is not due to commence until 2021 according to the Policy Letter, be added as a project for the next capital portfolio which is due to commence in 2021 and that delegated authority to approve funding is given in exactly the same way as for the 11-18 school.

Proposition 3 seeks to clearly direct the Policy & Resources Committee to exercise the authority delegated to it through challenging the cost drivers making up the capital costs; understanding how proposals fit with existing policies and previous commitments; and ensuring that the ongoing revenue costs are affordable to the States.

For example, the Policy & Resources Committee and the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture worked together during 2018 to establish a baseline space requirement for the 11-18 school project, supported by a jointly appointed external specialist consultant (as set out in the policy letter). This work indicated the space required for the school extensions was 2,878m² for the St Sampson’s High School and 3,240m² for the Les Beaucamps High School. The Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture is now proposing extensions which are larger for several reasons. The Policy & Resources Committee is seeking to ensure that any additional space (and therefore cost) is justified against the additional benefits it will deliver.

Proposition 3 also seeks to ensure transparency over how these proposals will help deliver on the outstanding savings target of the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture which (as per the States of Guernsey Annual Budget for 2019, Page 51, Paragraphs 7.9 – 7.13) is anticipated to be £2.3million after 2021 which the Committee had indicated would be delivered through the transformation of Education.

The States are operating in an environment of limited resources and therefore it is incumbent on all Principal Committees, in designing and implementing policy, to ensure that they are balancing the benefits and outcomes from policy changes with the cost of implementing and running future services. Propositions 1 and 2 seek to ensure that, in finalising its proposals, the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture is required to seek value for money proposals which ensure *“all students in secondary and post-16 education must have access to the best facilities the Island can afford¹”*.

¹ Resolution 11 THE FUTURE STRUCTURE OF SECONDARY AND POST-16 EDUCATION IN THE BAILIWICK P.2017/110

The approach adopted by the Policy & Resources Committee in composing this Amendment is consistent with the approach taken by the Committee *for* Health & Social Care in seeking approvals in relation to the hospital modernisation project. The Resolutions of the States following that debate, directed the Committee *for* Health & Social Care to progress with the ten year programme; delegated authority to the Policy & Resources Committee (following approval of the necessary business cases) to open capital votes of up to £44.3million charged to the Capital Reserve; and noted that delivery of subsequent phases of the programme would be subject to prioritisation for inclusion in future capital portfolios.

On the basis of the Amendment, the monies referred to in Proposition 6 b) are incorporated in the £77.9 million included in the amended Proposition 1, as indicated in the table above in row 3 titled "Community co-location" and consequently P 6 b) is not required.