



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

STATES OF DELIBERATION

OF THE

ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

HANSARD

Royal Court House, Guernsey, Saturday, 17th October 2020

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Guernsey website www.gov.gg*

Volume 9, No. 44

ISSN 2049-8284

Present:

R. J. McMahon, Esq., Bailiff and Presiding Officer

Law Officers

M. M. E. Pullum, Q.C. (H.M. Procureur)

People's Deputies

S. E. Aldwell	C. J. Le Tissier
C. P. A Blin	J. P. Le Tocq
A. H. Brouard	D. J. Mahoney
Y. Burford	A. D. S. Matthews
T. L. Bury	L. J. McKenna
A. Cameron	C. P. Meerveld
D. de G. de Lisle	N. G. Moakes
H. L. de Sausmarez	R. C. Murray
J. F. Dyke	V. S. Oliver
S. P. Fairclough	C. N. K. Parkinson
S. J. Falla	R. G. Prow
P. T. R. Ferbrache	L. C. Queripel
A. Gabriel	P. J. Roffey
J. A. B. Gollop	H. J. R. Soulsby
S. P. Haskins	G. A. St Pier
M. A. J. Helyar	A. W. Taylor
N. R. Inder	L. S. Trott
	S. P. J. Vermeulen

Representatives of the Island of Alderney

Alderney Representatives S. Roberts and E. A. J. Snowdon

The Clerk to the States of Deliberation

S. M. D. Ross, Esq. (H.M. States' Greffier)

Absent at the Evocation

R. M. Titterington, Q.C. (H.M. Comptroller)
Deputy A. C. Dudley-Owen (*relevée à 9h 37*); Deputy A. Kazantseva-Miller;
Deputy M. P. Leadbeater

Business transacted

Evocation	5
Convocation	5
Billet d'État XX.....	5
I. Election of Members of the Policy & Resources Committee – Election commenced	5
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 10.24 a.m. and resumed its sitting at 10.32 a.m.</i>	<i>16</i>
Election of Members of the Policy & Resources Committee – Election continued.....	16
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 10.33 a.m. and resumed its sitting at 10.41 a.m.</i>	<i>17</i>
Election of Members of the Policy & Resources Committee – Election concluded – Deputies Soulsby, Le Tocq, Helyar and Mahoney elected	17
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 10.44 a.m.</i>	<i>17</i>

PAGE LEFT DELIBERATELY BLANK

States of Deliberation

*The States met at 9.30 a.m. in the presence of
His Excellency Vice-Admiral Sir Ian Corder, K.B.E., C.B.
Lieutenant-Governor and Commander-in-Chief of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE BAILIFF *in the Chair*]

The Bailiff: Good morning, Your Excellency, and welcome to this meeting of the States of Deliberation.

PRAYERS

The States' Greffier

EVOCATION

CONVOCATION

- 5 **The States' Greffier:** Billet d'État XX of 2020. To the Members of the States of the Island of Guernsey I hereby give notice that a meeting of the States of Deliberation will be held at The Royal Court House on Saturday 17th October, 2020 at 9.30 a.m. to consider the item listed in this Billet d'État which has been submitted for debate. Election of Members of the Policy & Resources Committee.

Billet d'État XX

I. Election of Members of the Policy & Resources Committee – Election commenced

Article I.

The States are asked:

To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the Policy & Resources Committee to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation, as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

- 10 **The Bailiff:** Well, good morning, Members of the States of Deliberation.

In a moment I will invite the President of the Policy & Resource Committee, Deputy Ferbrache, to propose eligible candidates for Membership of the Committee of which he is the President.

Each candidate must be proposed and seconded, nobody is entitled to speak about the candidates at that stage and if there were no further nominations then I would simply put the

15 election of those four candidates to you without further ado. However, other Members are entitled to propose candidates for Membership of the Committee and if there is to be a contest then there will be speeches and speeches will take place first by the proposer of the candidate and then the candidate themselves five minutes and 10 minutes respectively.

So Deputy Ferbrache.

20 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Thank you very much, sir, and welcome Members.

Sir, I am pleased to nominate the following four proposed Members of Policy & Resources: Deputy Soulsby, Deputy Le Tocq, Deputy Helyar and Deputy Mahoney. They will be seconded by Deputy Inder.

25 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Inder, are you seconding all four of those nominations?

Deputy Inder: I am, sir.

30 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Dudley-Owen, you have just arrived is it your wish to be relevée?

Deputy Dudley-Owen: Yes please, sir.

35 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much.
Are there any further nominations?

Deputy St Pier: Sir, I want to nominate Deputy Al Brouard.

40 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much Deputy St Pier.
Is Deputy Brouard's nomination seconded?

Deputy Falla: Sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Falla.

45 Any further nominations Members of the States?

Very well in that case we have five candidates. That is Deputy Soulsby proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, seconded by Deputy Inder; Deputy Le Tocq proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, and also seconded by Deputy Inder; Deputy Helyar similarly proposed and seconded by Deputies Ferbrache and Inder respectively; and Deputy Mahoney –

50 Deputy de Sausmarez.

Deputy de Sausmarez: Thank you, sir.

55 I am very sorry to interrupt proceedings at this stage but there is a question around whether proxy voting may be allowed and I just thought that it would be helpful to have that indication ahead of the speeches, the nomination speeches. I believe that is a question that has been put to you this morning, I could quote the Rules for that but I am sure you know them better than I do.

The Bailiff: Well, it would perhaps have been more appropriate to at least have allowed me to say who the nominations were.

60 In relation to the question of some absentees – and there are two Members who are not marked as present at the moment – in respect of Rule 26(3A) the entitlement to a proxy vote is where there is an authorised absence in respect of circumstances prevailing in the Island and potentially on representations from the Civil Contingencies Authority, and that will enable a vote to be cast by another Member acting as a proxy.

65 The difficulty with paragraph (3A) of Rule 26 is that when one goes back to Rule 16(3)(a) voting shall be carried out by secret ballot in an election and it is impossible therefore in my view for a proxy vote to be offered where voting is by secret ballot.

I have discussed this issue with HM Procureur. Madam Procureur, do you demur from that advice or is that the position?

70

The Procureur: Sir, I do not demur from that advice; that is the position in my view.

The Bailiff: So on that basis at the moment during these election meetings because of the need for voting to be carried out by secret ballot, authorised absences are unavailable. Once we get to an ordinary meeting then I will reconsider the position at that point.

75 So just to recap, Members of the States: four candidates proposed by Deputy Ferbrache and seconded by Deputy Inder – that is, Deputies Soulsby, Le Tocq, Helyar and Mahoney. They will be dealt with in the order in which they were proposed, so in that order, but Deputy Ferbrache will speak for up to 20 minutes because it is four times five minutes for the four candidates and then each of the candidates themselves gets 10 minutes.

80 In respect of the fifth nomination by Deputy St Pier seconded by Deputy Falla of Deputy Brouard, Deputy Brouard will speak again for five minutes – Deputy St Pier will speak for five minutes and Deputy Brouard for up to 10 minutes.

So I invite Deputy Ferbrache to commence.

85

Deputy Ferbrache: Thank you very much, sir.

In the order that I nominated them: Deputy Soulsby – very well known to pre-Members of this Assembly and known I think to the public of Guernsey. She was a truly excellent and very able Health President for the last four and a half years. She has been a Member of the States for two terms. Her abilities, she is a chartered accountant and she has a distinguished record before she came into the States.

90 It would be my intention if she is elected as a Member of Policy & Resources to say to my colleagues next week when we have our first formal meeting that a person of her considerable ability should be the Deputy Chief Minister. This is a new role for me, she is a very experienced person, and of course she has dealt with Civil Contingencies.

95 I do not think I need to say much more about her, she is so well known and so able. I think anything else I would say would be a detraction and I do not want to detract from her considerable abilities.

100 Deputy Le Tocq – again extremely well known, a former Chief Minister, a former Home Minister, he has been External Relations minister, representative, whatever title you want to give him for the last four or so years and a role that he has discharged commendably in exceedingly difficult times. He is a person again of considerable ability, his reputation goes beyond this Assembly today. He is a person of strong beliefs as we know.

105 I am so pleased indeed that he has agreed to have his name put forward, because I know that he would have in an alternative situation sought another office, but in the best interests of Guernsey and that was his phrase, I was very grateful to hear it because, as I said yesterday, my intention is to hold out for a unified Committee, a unified States, a cohesive Committee, that he agreed unreservedly to allow his name to be put forward. So I am very grateful to him.

110 Now again, Deputy Helyar – now Deputy Helyar is a person I have known him for a long time as an advocate and sometimes he argued with me and those are the only occasions he was ever wrong, but in relation to that he set up the Guernsey Party from zero within a period of 10 weeks and it was a very effective parliamentary political machine, if I can say that most respectfully.

115 I first met him when I was a member of Sea Fisheries very many years ago, my first term in the States, and he was a Sea Fisheries Officer and I thought what a confident young man, in those days; what a young man of rare ability – perhaps that is a very vital and important role. I thought he could go on and do even greater things but little did I know that is what he would do.

A very successful corporate lawyer, a very able corporate lawyer who was thought of very highly and that will give the experience. People say, oh, he is a brand new Deputy, he has only been a Deputy now for a day. Well of course, that is true, but he has had a life that has lasted more than a day, he has been a person that if you were to ask and look where he came in the Election, he came fourth in the Election. He projected himself because he is a man of ability, he is a family man, he has got lots of interests outside of the States, which again is important.

Again, if elected, he would amongst other things take on responsibility for dealing with Alderney and Sark. I would be very grateful, I know he is very familiar with those Islands and would devote considerable time and attention to them. – in addition to his general experience.

Now the last but certainly by no means least nominee is Deputy Mahoney. Again, a brand-new Deputy, but Deputy Mahoney is 54 years of age he has lived in these Island for 34 years, he has run a trust company, he is still managing director of a trust company, he knows people, he is very much part of our society.

He is a Director of the Guernsey Rugby Academy, he is a rugby referee, he told me he used to be a fly-half and anybody who has played rugby knows that fly-halves are fleet of foot and deft of movement and that is certainly what he will have to be in the States of Guernsey.

He also, with his fiancée, runs another business, a coffee business that some of you may know. I am not allowed to advertise that business but I am sure some of you have drunk his coffee over the past few years.

Again what I have tried to build is a team of talents, a team of different interests, a team of different opinions. He would represent 'the independents' because of course Deputies Le Tocq and Soulsby are experienced able Members of our States; these other two people that I have nominated are also experienced able Members of our States, but they come from slightly different perspectives. Deputy Helyar, as I have said, has set up this political party which has been a great success; and Deputy Mahoney is an independent, but an independent with his own thoughts, his own processes and again he is a person that I would have confidence in.

I am asking the Members of the States to say, 'Ferbrache is the new President of P&R, he is putting forward what he regards as a balanced team of different skills, different abilities but all with a common purpose of working together in making this States work over the next four years.' I commend all four of them to you.

The Bailiff: Now I invite Deputy Soulsby, as the first of the candidates proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, to speak for up to 10 minutes.

Deputy Soulsby please.

Deputy Soulsby: Mr Bailiff, fellow States' Members, what I have heard overwhelmingly throughout this Election and listening to many of you these last few days, is a desire both for change and unity. Yesterday you voted for change, today I ask that you vote for unity.

I am sure it will come as no surprise to anyone here that I supported Deputy St Pier for the top job and I would like to take the opportunity now to thank him for the hard work he put in last term and particularly this year as we worked closely together to manage the Bailiwick's response to the Covid pandemic. (**Several Members:** Hear, hear.) I thank him for the support and leadership he has provided in what has been an incredibly stressful and exhausting time.

However, I am not tribal, I do not do 'us and them', except when it comes to football and on that Deputy Ferbrache and I are very much on the same side – not necessarily the winning one but on the same side nonetheless.

We must move on and all of us work together in an atmosphere of trust and mutual respect. We need to make decisions and action them whether we all agree with them or not. It is needed now more than ever before. We literally cannot afford the division that characterised the last States; indeed it is one of the reasons why I seriously decided not to stand again. However, what changed my mind was I knew that the next four years were going to be critical for Guernsey's future and I

could not walk away from the challenges that face us. Public service, not self-service, as Deputy Le Tocq used as a slogan back in 2012 and which has always resonated with me.

170 I have a proven track record of adding value through leading teams, achieving efficiencies, enabling transformation and developing opportunities, all of which will be needed on the Senior Committee of the States this term.

I have also worked hard – something I promised I would do four years ago. I said in my speech back then when I was elected as HSC President that when the work gets hard you see three sorts of
175 people: those who turn up their sleeves, those who turn up their noses and those who do not turn up at all. I promised to work hard as HSC President work with people not against them and bring people with me on a journey of transformation, a journey that like a Guernsey road would have some potholes, a few piles of manure, a diversion but hopefully not a dead-end.

It has indeed been a rough road and we may have made some wrong turns along the way but
180 four years later I am proud of what the Committee *for* HSC achieved last term, not least of which was financial control, reversing a £4½ million deficit when we took office to making a small surplus by the end of the year, and laid firm foundations for the new model of Health and Care, the Partnership of Purpose. It is not the poisoned chalice it used to be. But for that to continue and for other Principal Committees like Education, Sport & Culture to succeed in their plans it will need
185 P&R support.

When he stood for a place on P&R last term Deputy Brouard likened the Policy & Resources Committee to the bridge of a ship steering the States on the right course. In my speech on becoming HSC President the next day I said he was half right and my view has not changed, it may be the bridge when it comes to policy but it is the engine room when it comes to the support it
190 needs to provide to the rest of the States. As a bridge I would want to see P&R provide better collaboration with the Principal Committees.

Last term it felt like P&R was dominated by its Treasury function acting as a scrutineer rather than as part of the solution helping to develop policy.

So much of what we all need to do will require joint working between committees. Last term
195 HSC and ESS were the shining examples of cross-Committee collaboration but this was not reflected to such an extent elsewhere, and I think this is where P&R needs to have a greater role.

We had a Policy & Resource Plan that ended up as a giant unachievable wish list taking officers months to put together, diverting them from doing the actual of the Principal Committees, we cannot afford to do that any more, Covid has changed all that. Revive and Thrive cannot be a long
200 set of ideas. Our focus should be on setting actions for the short, medium and long term and all of us agreeing what the focus should be and sticking to it.

Having headed the largest and most complex part of the States of Guernsey, I probably have more insight than most into how the current machinery of Government works or more to the point does not. It was this experience that led me to lay a requête, with others, seeking to make
205 Government act better and faster which includes the role of P&R and I hope this is something that we can progress at speed this term.

When it comes to the engine room we need real public service reform. Slow progress has been made to date and it seems to have been more about moving the deckchairs at the top rather than any substantive change.

210 Whilst many of us last term were sceptical over the ambitious statements made what we probably all agreed was that key to reform would be increased digitisation and getting value for money from the contract with Agilisys.

We need to develop the function that we have created in HSC that monitors States' contracts and holds third parties to account, be they private businesses or the third sector. At the same time
215 we need to work with the third sector by improving communication and supporting greater collaboration, but at the same time encouraging more effective working.

But there are also going to be so many other challenges this term: Brexit right here right now, nurses' pay, the health and care funding gap, and the reducing tax base as the population ages. It

will be difficult, it will be hard work, whether we will sort it I do not know, but I will do my best to work with you to make it happen.

At the same time I appreciate how many of you are new to the States. I know when I was first elected it was an incredibly steep learning curve and there was so much to get my head around. Indeed I am still learning now. But what I did have back then was a mentor in the shape of the late Dave Jones who really was a heavyweight Member of Policy Council in both senses of the word. He took me under his wing and gave me the confidence to make my mark, I will always appreciate what he did, even though we very often disagreed in this Chamber. In that same spirit as a Member of P&R, I would want to reach out and mentor those of you as the next generation of presidents and P&R Members as we owe it to each other to make it the best States ever.

In particular I support the future President of HSC to get their feet under the table and make their mark.

So finally, a governance review of the Committee *for* Health & Social Care was undertaken in 2019 and the resultant report stated and I quote:

It was evident from interview responses and observation that the leadership provided by the President is exemplary. Committee members reported that she listened to them and respected their individual views and contributions while maintaining momentum in the work of the Committee. She actively supports the Committee to build good governance into their work and leads by example.

Those that have worked with me know I do not really ever blow my own trumpet, but I thought it relevant quoting that today. Of course I am not going for the top job but the leadership is at all levels and I promise if you elect me, I will continue to provide leadership for the benefit of the States and the people of Guernsey.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Next Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: Monsieur le Bailli, je suis ni anglais ni français, je suis un vrai guernésiais.

I am neither English nor French, I am a real Guernseyman – it is something that I use particularly when representing Guernsey overseas.

I think that particular ability to recognise and represent our Islands, our Bailiwick, as different is really important at this moment.

I cannot add, sir, to the comments made by Deputy Ferbrache, or indeed Deputy Soulsby, and I do not want to take up any more of this Assembly's time than necessary because the real work needs to be done now, and it is largely outside of this Assembly at the moment, certainly in terms of the threats to our constitution, to our relationships, and that is where I can provide a degree of continuity, a degree of being able to hit the ground running.

I am, as Deputy Ferbrache said, committed to work for the good of Guernsey. Like Deputy Soulsby I thought at the end of last year of not standing this time. However, the situations that have occurred rapidly during this year and the ongoing situation with the withdrawal of the UK from the EU means that we do need some continuity and immediately.

Sir, there are others in this Assembly, Deputy St Pier and Deputy Trott particularly who could do I think an even better job than me, but we need one of us to do that and I am willing to step up to the plate to do it. So I ask this Assembly to give me the chance to do that.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Next we turn to Deputy Helyar.

Deputy Helyar: Sir, Members of the Assembly.

As an entirely new Member I was flattered yesterday to hear both candidates mention my name as part of their P&R team. I would like to thank and credit them both for the way in which they

conducted themselves during the contest yesterday and also for featuring me in their plans. They both have huge experience and skills which are necessary to help Guernsey in its hour of need and I really do hope they maintain the commitment to work together which they gave the Assembly yesterday. Guernsey cannot afford another four years of conflict.

270 In normal circumstances, sir, like any new Member I would have been very happy to take a Committee slot under the leadership of Deputy St Pier or Deputy Ferbrache and learn the ropes, mentored by one of the senior Members of the Assembly with a view to perhaps a seat on P&R at some point in the future. But these are not normal circumstances, we must all pull together for Guernsey's sake and we must ensure we get the right Deputies in the right Committees, as Deputy
275 St Pier said yesterday, including a broad range of views experience and skills.

Our Bailiwick faces significant ongoing and imminent risks from Covid, Brexit and concomitant global recession. We need to get our economy going and to support and enhance our transition to a strategically independent carbon neutral economy based on renewable energy and we must start doing that now. I believe our energy transition policy needs to be far more aspirational.

280 We must also get ourselves ready for the physical and geopolitical challenges which climate change will bring us, our children and our grandchildren.

The message left ringing clearly in my ears from the Election is that the public wants us all to stop bickering, work positively and collaboratively and to get things done. Some of them may take 20 years or more to achieve so we must start down the road now.

285 Many Members will know I have tried my very best to broker a consensus over the past week, not in my own or party interest, but in the interest of Guernsey. I hope that I have already been able to demonstrate to many of you a real commitment towards achieving honest consensus, however naïve that may have been. I really believe that if we set a good example in our behaviours this term our work will become easier and that this will become a happier, friendlier and therefore more
290 dynamic place in which we can get things done.

Sir, members of the public will want to know how the party element may play out in terms of P&R, committees and in the work of the States. The honest answer to that is I do not know, but a group of six votes in the context of the closeness of voting in the last term is obviously a significant number and it is therefore important for our party to be interwoven as closely as possible in setting
295 priorities and budgets so that we are all moving in the same direction.

Sir, I believe I have numerous transferable skills which would be of benefit on many States' Committees and particularly on P&R. In my career as a scientist, civil servant and lawyer I have drafted policy letters, legislation, regulations, prepared prosecutions, defended criminal matters, and brought and defended civil litigation matters of all types and sizes.

300 As a Sea Fisheries Officer in the 1990's I was responsible, as you know, for conservation enforcement and liaison with the offices of the Lieutenant Governor, MAF, the Home Office and the British Embassy in Paris, as well as co-ordinating with Royal Naval patrols, Watchdog aircraft patrols and HM Customs and related issues. This also involved liaison with Alderney and Sark and I am pleased to say I still have many friends in both Islands which I made 25 years ago whilst doing this
305 work.

My detailed knowledge and experience of this sector and the complex constitutional and legislative arrangements which support it could be of significant assistance to Policy & Resources at this time and going forwards.

I have advised several foreign governments on drafting of their legislation and regulations and
310 have appeared as an expert witness in foreign arbitration. I have bought and sold Guernsey businesses large and small on behalf of clients everything you could imagine from the North Side Chip Shop to Condor Ferries. I have very detailed knowledge and experience of every branch of our main industry the financial services sector. I have formed and managed my own businesses as well as forming and leading teams of peers in law firms and administration businesses in numerous
315 jurisdictions and with hundreds of staff.

As well as spending a short time in my career as an auditor my legal specialisation lies in the creation of complex financial instruments involving the use of insurance, re-insurance and life

insurance, involving actuarial analysis and the assessment and management of risk. As a director and company secretary over many years I have sat on the board and or been chairman of many of Guernsey's largest companies. Although I am not accountant qualified, I am highly familiar with accounts, accounting and investment processes and management functions and financial services best practices and regulation.

Sir, I believe all of these skills as well as my inter-personal skills and commitment to generating consensus and therefore better co-ordinated government are directly relevant to a role on P&R.

If I am elected I would particularly like, as Deputy Ferbrache has said, to take responsibility for the relationships with Sark and Alderney.

I please ask the Assembly to vote for me as a Member of P&R.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Next we turn to Deputy Mahoney.

Deputy Mahoney: Thank you, sir, and thank you, Peter, for your earlier comments.

Those who know me best will know that plaudits do not sit very easily with me. I have always felt better just getting on with it quietly in the background. So fear not, I will not be taking 10 minutes of your time this morning. I have sat through far too many board meetings where people have said in 10 minutes what could have been said in five. Perhaps more States' business could be done if this becomes a guiding principle over the next States' term. (**Several Members:** Hear, hear.)

People have asked me why I stood for election and it is all about change, isn't it? I wanted change, the people wanted change, and the people voted for change. I campaigned on it, a change in the way States' business is done and equally as important is seen to be done. I cannot overstate that.

I am pleased to now call all of you colleagues and from reading many of the manifestos of the people sat before and around me now and from being able to spend some time talking to many of you, I know that you believe in change too. Many of us are here because the voting public agreed with that concept.

For those that do not know what change looks like, look around now, the new face next to you is change. Except we as an Assembly need to be united and seen to be united. There are 16 party Deputies here today so clearly parties have been accepted by the public, but partisan thinking will not be accepted. (**A Member:** Hear, hear.)

I am new to the States but I am not new to the real world, so what have I been up to and what do I bring. Firstly I own a small business so I am aware of the issues and the frustrations faced by others in these trying times. I have been in the on-shore and off-shore finance industry for 36 years, living and working in the UK, Jersey, the Cayman Islands, the Bahamas and of course locally. I have gone from the post room to being the managing director of a local trust company and I have been around long enough to see the industry move from the days of 'where can I deposit this suitcase full of cash?' to the highly regulated industry that serves our Island so well right now.

Along the way I have worked for accountants, private fiduciaries and banks, I have served on the boards of many diverse international trading companies and a publicly listed company. I brokered cross border transactions and dealt with regulatory authorities across many jurisdictions. I formed a start-up trust company from scratch, navigating the regulatory minefield and am well known to most of the managing partners of local law firms from my work with them across innumerable legal matters. I am a prescribed person in the eyes of the Guernsey Financial Services Commission and I wear their stamp of approval concerning my integrity, honesty and reputation with pride. I have been a fiduciary lead in a Law Lords' decision concerning the use of and access to trust moneys around a freezing order and I acted as a sole witness in the largest set of tax fraud cases in South African history.

I have dined with kings and sporting world champions and I have even been threatened over lunch by world heavyweight boxing champion. In short, sir, I have been around a few blocks.

370 I believe this Assembly needs a balance of power or a different version of what we had. Last night when I was asked about standing, I was not able to take the call I was busy, I was busy refereeing Elizabeth College 1st XV in their rugby match against King William's School from the Isle of Man, rugby refereeing as alluded to by Peter is a passion of mine.

375 In fact when I was elected more than a few of my friends jokes that I should bring a whistle and a yellow card into the Chamber. Jokes aside I believe there should be a seat on P&R for someone to act as a buffer and internal check and balance a clear and demonstrable sign that this Assembly has listened, a properly impartial and independent face.

The significant international and domestic challenges that face this Assembly require a balanced and cohesive P&R Committee working together. I offer myself as a true independent candidate and
380 I offer representation at the P&R table for the new faces.

P&R needs to be balanced and that is what you get with me. I have no axes to grind and I come with no baggage. I offer new friendship and a desire to work together with everybody.

This is not easy, change seldom is, but yesterday we started, we made the first step, we did well, yes one nil to us as an Assembly. Broadly we sit here as four groups the two parties, the previously
385 sitting independent Deputies and the new independent Deputies. I hope and believe that the new faces you see scattered around this Chamber today feel as I do, that we are in this together no them and us or more accurately them and them and them and us.

What I am asking you to do very shortly is to take that one next step, a step that will prove to the voting public that we do listen, that we do understand, and that we do act.

390 I will be honoured to sit as a representative on Policy & Resources and I ask the Members of the Assembly for their support.

Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

395 Next I am going to turn to the proposer of Deputy Brouard, Deputy St Pier, please.

Deputy St Pier: Mr Bailiff I was honoured when Deputy Brouard asked me to nominate him for a position on the Policy & Resources Committee.

400 For those of you who do not know Deputy Brouard, perhaps the newer Members will know his history. He is one of the longest serving Members of this Assembly, having first been elected in 2004 and at every election since.

Before that of course he had an extensive banking career and of course he has been very well known in his parish work as well having had I think almost a record breaking, probably not a record breaking actually in Guernsey but certainly a very lengthy period of 22 years' service in many roles
405 in his parish.

But I think obviously of more relevance in the context of this particular nomination is his extensive experience over the years in the States of Guernsey, starting with the Legislative Select Committee, which was where I first met him when I was serving as a non-States' member and of course subsequently as a Member of the Public Services Department when it was first formed – of
410 course that has now become part of the States' Trading Supervisory Board in effect – a period as the Chairman of the Public Sector Remuneration Committee as well, before joining Commerce & Employment, the predecessor to what is now the Committee for Economic Development as well.

He has also been a Deputy Minister of what was then Social Security the predecessor to the Committee for Employment & Social Security and was a Member of the Health Department and
415 subsequently the Deputy Minister of Commerce & Employment before of course joining Policy & Resources in 2016.

Whilst many have spoken of the Election as being about both continuity and change, I think it is worth highlighting the continuity that Deputy Brouard can offer given his previous four years' service on Policy & Resources having taken the lead in the representation of Guernsey in the
420 Bailiwick Council and his work with Alderney and Sark and no doubt that is experience that could be shared with Deputy Helyar, if Deputy Helyar were to become part of the Committee or to take a

lead in that area. But also the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly part of the peace settlement and part of the architecture which helps the external relations and international relations of this Island, not only the British-Irish Council but also the Parliamentary Assembly and Deputy Brouard has extensive experience of representing the Island there and as Chair of course of the Douzaine Liaison Group as well.

So he has been very much around the patch and knows a thing or two about cross-committee working. As a personality he is somebody who is very happy to work with everybody and does not create enemies in his political work.

He of course was not my nominee in 2016 and the Assembly decided to make him a Member of the Committee and I am very glad that they chose to do so. He became a very hard-working Member of the Committee and has been very loyal to the decisions of the Committee but has been very happy to challenge within the Committee room which, as I indicated when I spoke yesterday, is a very important part of Committee work that there is robust challenge within the room.

The other aspect of Deputy Brouard, of course is he is the voice of Mrs Le Page in Torteval the famous Mrs Le Page, it is a different voice to some of the others that we here through social media and other ways of channelling the voice of Guernsey but it definitely comes through in the work of Deputy Brouard.

I was disappointed that Deputy Ferbrache when he generously offered to myself to nominate me as a Member of the Policy & Resources Committee for that continuity and I know also Deputies Trott and Le Tocq but he did not actually consider Deputy Brouard as well because I think it would have been a conversation worth having.

So in the absence of that I think I am delighted that he has nonetheless chosen to stand from the floor. I think there is an opportunity for this Assembly to provide some new faces to P&R but also some continuity as well

So with that, sir, I do encourage Members to support Deputy Brouard on this occasion.

The Bailiff: Finally, Deputy Brouard, please.

Deputy Brouard: Thank you, sir.

Good morning and my congratulations to every one of you.

I do have a tinge of *déjà vu* as four years ago, I stood exactly in the same position on the floor of this Assembly gaining a seat on the then new P&R team. I was, as Deputy St Pier said, not his choice back then and neither am I Deputy Ferbrache's choice today either. I think in his legal terms, it is something called like having form.

I recognise the qualities that Deputy St Pier has and by closely working with him and our team over the last four years and by Deputy St Pier's nomination today of me, I hope he of mine.

It will be in your gift who you wish to serve and support Deputy Ferbrache in his endeavours on behalf of the Island I am very happy to have my name put forward.

We are now embarking on a new term of the States, some of you will know in great detail the challenges ahead, who our friends are, who would do us harm, where the big issues are, how to negotiate with big brother. Some of you, new to this world –and it is a world, a very unique world, an exciting world, a challenging world, it is a privileged political bubble – may not have a Scooby Doo and that was me 16 years ago.

I did not understand back then the challenges the dichotomies we faced but I learnt. I do know have a much better understanding. Do I know Guernsey? Yes pretty well. I have put myself to the electorate five times. We do not have to do it but many of you like me will have felt that we are driven by some insane mechanism inside us which calls us to represent the people and our Island.

Do I know by now all the answers? No. Do I know where to find the answers and who we can rely on? Probably yes. The Island has been left to the election class of 2020 in good stead, the financial prudence of the P&R team of which I was proud to be a part led by Deputy St Pier we have brought back a balanced budget measures to support industry during this pandemic. Health is in a strong position, new drugs, new capital infrastructure, the massive change in bringing digitisation

to the States with the help of Agilisys. The robust defence of our realm on tax and international compliance. Did we get it all correct? No.

Clearly schools is a legacy for us to resolve, but we have others, not next year or next month but now, right now. We have Brexit, we have Covid. Now we have hoteliers going to face a winter, now we face the mounting costs of Aurigny. It may not be someone's fault except for the trader selling bats in Wuhan but its problem is now on our collective shoulders to solve.

Yesterday we had made our choice by electing Deputy Ferbrache as Minister of P&R a new candidate to the role experienced in business and experienced in States' business, his proposed team has much experience but in my view – and I may be wrong, and I may be proved wrong – you do not start your political career at P&R's table; you start your political career in Committees, you learn the craft, you learn how things are done and how things go forward.

It is really a place where you have your middle years, your best years, or even sometimes your last years, but that is where we need to have our skills need to be at that top table. I too am disappointed that there are some other people in this room who are very skilled who could have come up to the plate but for many reasons are not able to. So in their gap I give you this morning a choice.

It is no secret I am my own man. Being christened with the name 'Alvord' set a die that has run some 60 years: please do not do it to your children! *(Laughter)* We all walk different paths, we all have different skills, and I hope we can tap into each and every one of you as Guernsey needs now more than ever a functioning, cohesive Government, skilled in the art of delivery and mindful of the craft of politics which you have been elected to.

We need a Policy & Resources team that can – and I apologise for the cliché – hit the ground running, as Deputy Le Tocq said, have a good grounding as to where we are, a razor-sharp focus of where we want to get to next. And as an aside as I have realised as I have gained experience of working for a company, running my own business, building property, marriage, death, children, life is a journey, as we pass from one station to the next they are just stations on the way.

It is the same for our Island we have to steer Guernsey for the next five years, some stations we will get to but there are always new ones on the horizon and so on.

So I offer you the ability to add some continuity to the P&R team without which they will have to find their own way, and that may be fine, but when I climb a new mountain I value the guide, and secondly, as my proposer has adduced, I am a hard-working politician not afraid of a contrary view who represents that Guernsey donkey common sense which we most certainly need.

We are not building – and this touches slightly on what Deputy Soulsby said – Noah's Ark today of various species of politicians to represent the electorate or the floor of this Assembly. We are not building the main engine room to drive the economy that is Economic Development or the ship's medical facilities to cure all our ills, that is Health & Social Care, we are building the bridge of the Ark the team to navigate us through uncharted waters, to identify friendly shores and those rocks where we may founder. It is the team to support all teams. I cannot stress that enough it is the team to support all teams. We want experience, capability, knowledge and common sense.

You will have four votes this morning. You can use one, none, two, three, four; you can put a spoiled paper in with five votes if you wish. Of those I would be very grateful to have one of them. I will be very pleased to work with whoever is elected to P&R and whether I am on P&R or not I will be very pleased to work with you all.

I hope you do not mind having a choice this morning, it is the second decision you will have to make. I thank you very much for listening to me and I thank very much my proposer and my seconder.

Thank you very much.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Well, Members of the States, I do not really need to remind you about the process of voting because Deputy Brouard had just done it for you. But if you take a sheet of paper and unless you

525 are a candidate do not write your own name on it, but you can write, one, two, three or four names on it.

I remind you, Members of the States, of the five candidates who are in the frame for four seats on the Policy & Resources Committee. It is Deputy Soulsby, Deputy Le Tocq., Deputy Helyar, Deputy Mahoney. Each of those four was proposed by Deputy Ferbrache and seconded by Deputy Inder.
530 The fifth candidate is Deputy Brouard proposed by Deputy St Pier and seconded by Deputy Falla.

When you have completed your voting, if you can fold your slip at least in half and then hand it to the Sheriff or another official.

Are there any more voting slips to be handed in? If everyone has handed in their voting slip because the counting of the votes this morning is likely to be slightly longer than the counting of
535 the votes yesterday, where it was a binary choice, I am going to suggest that we adjourn whilst that voting takes place.

Deputy Brouard, you have risen to your feet.

Deputy Brouard: Sir, just a thought, we have one Member of the Assembly who cannot be here
540 for Covid reasons – two for Covid reasons – do you think it may be possible, sir, that you would consider suspending the Rules to allow those two Members to do a secret ballot by way of email through to the Greffier, as was planned during the Covid zoom meetings we had earlier in the year, sir.

I just offer that as something you may wish to consider for States' Members because this is a
545 once-in-a-lifetime chance for those people.

The Bailiff: I think before I can do that, Deputy Brouard, I would need to know what the motion is that you want me to put to the Members, and the form in which you have just described it is, in my view, too inchoate.

550 What I will do is I will adjourn the sitting of the States now, if there is to be a motion to be put to the Members then we will resume as soon as that motion is prepared. The counting of the votes will not take place until that step has been taken.

It is now 10.23 a.m. I would like an indication by half past 10, shall we say, as to whether a motion is to be put, but that is the best I can do, Deputy Brouard, in the circumstances. I think it is very
555 important that Members know what they are being asked to do.

Madam Procureur.

The Procureur: Sir, yes I am happy to liaise with the Members about this issue if they so wish.

560 **The Bailiff:** Okay, so I am going to adjourn the States now to at least 10.30 a.m. – no counting of votes in the meantime and then we will see where we get to.

*The Assembly adjourned at 10.24 a.m.
and resumed its sitting at 10.32 a.m.*

Election of Members of the Policy & Resources Committee – Election continued

The Bailiff: Deputy Brouard, you have had an opportunity to take some advice and reflect. Is it your wish that a motion be put to the States?

565 **Deputy Brouard:** No, sir, thank you. My apologies to the States for the indulgence, I was just concerned about the people who could not get here due to Covid.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much, Deputy Brouard.

570 Well, in that case, the voting slips have all been collected, Members of the States. Whilst the votes are going to be counted, we will just adjourn again for a brief moment.
Thank you very much.

*The Assembly adjourned at 10.33 a.m.
and resumed its sitting at 10.41 a.m.*

**Election of Members of the Policy & Resources Committee –
Election concluded –
Deputies Soulsby, Le Tocq, Helyar and Mahoney elected**

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

575 Members of the States, the voting for the four Members to join the Policy & Resources Committee is as follows: Deputy Soulsby received 35 votes; Deputy Le Tocq received 30 votes; Deputy Helyar received 32 votes; Deputy Mahoney received 30 votes; and Deputy Brouard received 11 votes.

Accordingly I declare that Deputies Soulsby, Le Tocq, Helyar and Mahoney are elected as the four Members of the Policy & Resources Committee. *(Applause)*

580 Members of the States, that concludes the business for a Saturday morning sitting, and we will reconvene for the next meeting of the States of Deliberation at 9.30 a.m. on Monday morning.
Greffier, can we close the meeting, please.

The Assembly adjourned at 10.44 a.m.