



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

STATES OF DELIBERATION

OF THE

ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

HANSARD

Royal Court House, Guernsey, Wednesday, 21st October 2020

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Guernsey website www.gov.gg*

Volume 9, No. 46

ISSN 2049-8284

Present:

R. J. McMahon, Esq., Bailiff and Presiding Officer

Law Officers

R. M. Titterington, Q.C. (H.M. Comptroller)

People's Deputies

S. E. Aldwell	C. J. Le Tissier
C. P. A Blin	J. P. Le Tocq
A. H. Brouard	D. J. Mahoney
Y. Burford	A. D. S. Matthews
T. L. Bury	L. J. McKenna
A. Cameron	C. P. Meerveld
D. de G. de Lisle	N. G. Moakes
H. L. de Sausmarez	R. C. Murray
A. C. Dudley-Owen	V. S. Oliver
J. F. Dyke	C. N. K. Parkinson
S. P. Fairclough	R. G. Prow
S. J. Falla	L. C. Queripel
P. T. R. Ferbrache	P. J. Roffey
A. Gabriel	H. J. R. Soulsby
J. A. B. Gollop	G. A. St Pier
S. P. Haskins	A. W. Taylor
M. A. J. Helyar	L. S. Trott
N. R. Inder	S. P. J. Vermeulen
A. Kazantseva-Miller	

Representatives of the Island of Alderney

The Clerk to the States of Deliberation

C. Foster (H.M. Deputy Greffier)

Absent at the Evocation

M. M. E. Pullum, Q.C. (H.M. Procureur);
Deputy M. P. Leadbeater (*relevé à 11h 05*);
Alderney Representatives S. Roberts and E. A. J. Snowdon (*relevés à 14h 30*)

Business transacted

Evocation	6
Convocation.....	6
Billet d'État XXI	6
Elections & Appointments	6
IX. Overseas Aid & Development Commission – Deputy Blin elected President.....	6
XI. States' Trading Supervisory Board – Election of President commenced	9
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 10.47 a.m. and resumed at 10.55 a.m.....</i>	<i>26</i>
States' Trading Supervisory Board – Deputy Roffey elected President	26
XII. Transport Licensing Authority – Deputy Gollop elected President.....	26
Billet d'État XXII	29
Elections & Appointments	29
I. Scrutiny Management Committee – Election of two members commenced	29
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 11.26 a.m. and resumed at 11.34 a.m.....</i>	<i>34</i>
Scrutiny Management Committee – Deputy Fairclough and Deputy Dyke elected as members.....	34
II. Committee for Economic Development – Election of four members commenced	34
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 12.08 p.m. and resumed at 12.18 p.m.....</i>	<i>41</i>
Committee for Economic Development – Deputy Kazantseva-Miller, Deputy Falla, Deputy Vermeulen and Deputy Moakes elected as members	41
III. Department for Education, Sport & Culture – Election of four members commenced.....	42
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 12.45 p.m. and resumed at 12.55 p.m.</i>	<i>48</i>
Department for Education, Sport & Culture – Deputy Aldwell, Deputy Murray, Deputy Haskins and Deputy Cameron elected as members.....	48
Procedural – Seating arrangements	48
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 12.57 p.m. and resumed at 2.30 p.m.</i>	<i>49</i>
IV. Committee for Employment & Social Security – Election of four members – Deputy Falla, Deputy Bury, Deputy de Sausmarez and Deputy Gollop elected	49
V. Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure – Election of four members – Deputy Cameron, Deputy Fairclough, Deputy Gabriel and Deputy Haskins elected	50
VI. Committee for Health & Social Care – Election of four members deferred	50
VII. Committee for Home Affairs – Election of four members commenced.....	51
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 3.00 p.m. and resumed at 3.13 p.m.</i>	<i>57</i>
Committee for Home Affairs – Deputy Taylor, Deputy Vermeulen, Deputy Leadbeater and Deputy Le Tissier elected as members	57
VIII. Development & Planning Authority – Election of four members – Deputy Dyke, Deputy Le Tissier, Deputy Taylor and Deputy Kazantseva-Miller elected	57

IX. States' Assembly & Constitution Committee – Election of four members – Deputy Gollop, Deputy Queripel, Deputy McKenna and Deputy Fairclough elected	58
X. States' Trading Supervisory Board – Election of two members commenced	59
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 3.39 p.m. and resumed at 3.47 p.m.</i>	64
States' Trading Supervisory Board – Deputy Parkinson and Deputy Moakes elected as members	64
XI. Transport Licensing Authority – Election of four members – Alderney Representative Roberts, Deputy de Lisle, Deputy Le Tissier and Deputy Blin elected	64
XII. Administrative Decisions (Review) (Guernsey) Law, 1986 Panel of Members – Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman commenced – Deputy Meerveld elected Chairman	65
VI. Committee for Health & Social Care – Election of four members resumed – Deputy Bury, Deputy Leadbeater, Deputy Matthews and Alderney Representative Snowden elected	67
Procedural – Acceptable forms of address and seating arrangements	68
Administrative Decisions (Review) (Guernsey) Law, 1986 Panel of Members – Douzenier Goodlass elected Deputy Chairman	69
Procedural – Query on election of Chairman of the Panel of Members	69
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 4.05 p.m. and resumed at 4.25 p.m.</i>	70
Procedural – Query on election of Chairman of the Panel of Members – Election of Deputy Meerveld and Douzenier Goodlass confirmed	70
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 4.27 p.m.</i>	70

PAGE LEFT DELIBERATELY BLANK

States of Deliberation

The States met at 9.30 a.m.

[THE BAILIFF *in the Chair*]

PRAYERS

The Deputy Greffier

EVOCATION

CONVOCATION

The Deputy Greffier: Billets d'État XXI and XXII. To the Members of the States of the Island and Guernsey, I hereby give notice that a Meeting of the States of Deliberation will be held at the Royal Courthouse on Wednesday, 21st October 2020, at 9.30 a.m. to consider the items listed in these
5 Billets d'État which have been submitted for debate.

Billet d'État XXI

ELECTIONS & APPOINTMENTS

POLICY & RESOURCES COMMITTEE

IX. Overseas Aid & Development Commission – Deputy Blin elected President

Article IX.

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The Deputy Greffier: Article IX. Election of a President of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission.

The Bailiff: Deputy Ferbrache, this is a Policy & Resources Committee nomination.

Deputy Ferbrache: Yes, sir, and our nomination is Deputy Blin.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much. Is that nomination seconded?

15 **Deputy Prow:** Yes sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Prow, this is almost a repeat of the other day, now, is it not? Perfect. In that case, if that is the Committee's nomination, then I will invite Deputy Ferbrache, if he wishes to remind Members of what he said the other day, to propose Deputy Blin.

20

Deputy Ferbrache: Thank you, sir.

 I hope I remember what I said the other day. What I do say is that Deputy Blin is a person I have known for a long time and he is a caring, decent person. He has got wide and extensive interests and I am not going to repeat the story of South America that I told just a day or so ago, but I am
25 sure that is still in people's memory. He is the recommendation of the nomination of the Policy & Resources Committee and I ask the Assembly to so vote.

The Bailiff: I now invite Deputy Blin to speak for up to 10 minutes in respect of his nomination. Deputy Blin please.

30

Deputy Blin: Thank you, sir.

 I am asking the Assembly to consider me for the Presidency of the Overseas Aid & Development committee. Charity starts at home but does not end at home. Just how many times do we hear on the news that the way to stop Covid-19 from spreading is just to open the tap and wash your hands
35 properly and then it dawns on you on the millions of people across the world who do not even have access to uncontaminated water, let alone soap or taps.

 My aim will be to ensure that we continue to do something about this and hence my strong interest in this role. I would commit to continuing the good work of the OADC, making sure that our approach to international development remains good for the world and good for Guernsey.
40 The work will be paramount in helping communities by making sustainable changes that are the foundation for social and economic growth in the poorest parts of the world.

 I would monitor this with the commissioners and be ready to review and adapt quickly where required and a lot of the projects have been ongoing. I would also liaise with various authorities and organisations that collaborate with the OADC.

45 I can only praise the work of retired Deputy Emilie McSwiggan, as well as all of the commissioners who clearly are and have been committed to use their diverse skills, including their knowledge of medicine and education, aid and water, and to ensure that there has been a right balance of advisory and knowledge to fulfil many of these projects.

 This shows that the work carried out has gone way beyond our borders and has achieved a very
50 large amount of good around the world and I would like to take a few moments to cite to you and the Assembly just a few examples from the 2019 Report, which has clearly made a huge impact on many communities: 3,910 farmer start-ups, 43 new school facilities, 252 new water supplies, 13 new health facilities and the planting of 673,600 trees. There are many more on that Report. So that means that, in 2019, with the £2.4 million funding, 365,433 people directly benefited from this and,
55 in fact, when you work out a spend per person, it is somewhere in the region of £6.70.

 During these unprecedented times, though, it is also worth noting that the approach of OADC and P&R was notable, as some projects could not be fulfilled due to civil unrest and Covid. But that £1 million of the reserves of OADC was actually re-allocated back to Guernsey during the Covid pandemic.

60 What I would do, as well, would be to engage and liaise with P&R, to get guidance of the level of funding for future years and also, within P&R, is the investment fund, which is going to also have an impact and obviously create self-funding. During the previous term, the amount of funding secured by P&R has been somewhere between 0.1% and 0.2% and due to Covid and other factors, the 2021 Budget is going to be *circa* 75% of the 2020 Budget, but with the hope and anticipation
65 that, over the years, we will be able to bring it up by 2029 up possibly to 0.2%, which is still by the

way, way below the UN Millennium sustainable development goal, but we have to take into account where we are and our situation as well.

However, please, always we need to remember that Guernsey should continue to play an important part in meeting the needs of those forgotten emergencies worldwide and communities that truly cannot help themselves. So, as an Island we are small, but not an insignificant force for good.

I will also continue with the plans to develop the larger programmes to make sustainable changes. I will be able to work closely with the committee, or rather with the commissioners, in identifying good solutions and I would even add that I would like to consider even some talent from Guernsey, specialists that can help some of our Third World problems. To cite an example, look at ways of rejuvenating, enriching dead soil in certain parts of the world, by applying biological and scientific process that could include increased yields, nutrition and health. This would be from the potential of Guernsey eco-initiatives as well as global groups.

I would consider programmes that would link us with other places, like the work we are doing currently with Ille et Vilaine in France and hopefully my French language would be of help to that as well. I can say that I would be coming to this new, although it is with great interest I have been reading the Annual Report and all the work Deputy McSwiggan has done. I am aware that the commissioners have considerable know-how and I feel that I will not know all the answers but I will make it my business to ensure that I get to grips with this as quickly as I can.

So, from a more personal perspective, it is important to understand that although I have a strong belief and compassion in supporting and helping those less fortunate than us, I would also like to clarify that I do understand the complex issues and decisions when we are dealing with our economy and the sensitivity of giving money abroad when people may think that charity starts here and stops here.

I would also, on that basis, like to share some of my background. I do have a strong interest in the economy. I have lived on Guernsey for most of my working life. I understand a lot about skills and business. I schooled on the Island and also overseas, as I will explain a little bit more shortly to you. After graduating in languages and economics, I worked initially in the finance sector and after a number of years I embarked on a life of self-employment, working hard to build a number of businesses in various sectors, language teaching, translation, recruitment, coaching and both commercial and financial services.

So I have gained a lot of experience over these years and I will do my utmost to apply some of this knowledge in this mission here. Furthermore, throughout my 35-plus working years, I have maintained a strong interest in our community and charity work, including 15 years in the Guernsey Round Table, which has always had a strong, charitable, fundraising side. So I have been very much involved in reviewing and selecting charities, causes and projects. This, I find, is within in my remit and understanding.

I would also like to add something a little bit more personal, as well, which pulls me towards this role. It is a bit personal, so I hope you will allow this. My parents moved here in the late 1960's. My father was a lawyer at St James' Chambers and my mother a language teacher. After a few years, he decided to set off with us, as a very young family, including my two sisters, and to travel around the world, working on charitable and Christian projects.

This included three years in South America, predominantly in Peru, where I witnessed at a very early age poverty-stricken areas like the Barriadas where thousands of people lived in confined, polluted and disease-ridden slums. I would have never imagined those sorts of experiences, which have stayed with me since my early childhood.

What I can say is that from a very young age, I have been aware of the plight of many others less fortunate than us. Sir, I would like to thank you for listening and thanks also the Assembly for listening to me and I would be grateful if the Assembly would consider me for this role.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much. Well, Members of the States, we go to the vote for the president of the Overseas Aid & Development Commission. The candidate is Deputy Blin, proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, seconded by Deputy Prow. All those in favour; all those against?

Members voted Pour.

120 **The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Blin duly elected, without dissension.

XI. States' Trading Supervisory Board – Election of President commenced

Article XI.

The States are asked:-

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The Deputy Greffier: Article XI. Election of a President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board.

125 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, who wishes to nominate a fellow Member for this office?
Deputy Soulsby.

Deputy Soulsby: I nominate Deputy St Pier, sir.

130 **A Member:** Hear, hear.

The Bailiff: Is Deputy St Pier's candidature seconded? (**Deputy Parkinson:** Yes, sir.) Deputy Parkinson, thank you. Deputy de Sausmarez.

135 **Deputy de Sausmarez:** I would like to nominate Deputy Peter Roffey.

140 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much and is Deputy Roffey's candidature seconded? (**Deputy Mahoney:** Yes, sir.) Deputy Mahoney, thank you. Do we have a third candidate at all? In that case we have two candidates, Members of the States, Deputy St Pier and Deputy Roffey, and I invite both of the candidates to come and sit on the bench, Deputy Roffey window side, alphabetically, Deputy St Pier door side.

(A drink is spilled.)

145 Does the States' Trading Supervisory Board care for our water resources?! Never mind, accidents happen. Once we are all settled and the Sheriff has got the kitchen roll onto the spillage, are you ready Deputy Soulsby to speak for up to five minutes about Deputy St Pier? Deputy Soulsby please.

Deputy Soulsby: Thank you, sir.

150 It does feel rather odd having to explain why I believe Deputy St Pier should be elected as President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board. There is probably little about him we do not already know. He has held the two most senior positions in the States, firstly Treasury & Resources Minister and then in the new machinery of Government, President of the Policy & Resources Committee, our Chief Minister.

I have known him for a long time. We were both at KPMG back in the 1990's and our paths crossed a few times in business, when we were both directors at Kleinwort Benson and later, when

155 he managed Walbrook Trustees, as it was then under Deloitte. He knows business. Our paths crossed again when we were both elected to the States in 2012 and I think it is fair to say I was a bit of a thorn in his side that term, when I was Chair of the Public Accounts Committee. But he did not take it personally and was happy to nominate me as HSC President four years later.

160 Until 2012, it was Treasury & Resources that acted as shareholder for most trading assets. So he already has a good knowledge of Guernsey Electricity, Guernsey Post, the tankers and Aurigny. So, there is little if any learning curve needed. It was also on the States' Review Committee that developed the new machinery of Government to help structure the States' Trading Supervisory Board and knows its purpose.

165 There is so much more that I could say but really I do not think there should be any need. Until Friday he was our Chief Minister. He has an incredible depth of political and business experience and his leadership skills should not be wasted. I therefore ask you to vote for Deputy St Pier as President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board.

The Bailiff: I now turn to Deputy St Pier to speak for up to 10 minutes in support of his candidature, Deputy St Pier.

170 **Deputy St Pier:** Sir, I should start by saying that, on Friday, 23 of you did not want me to be the President of P&R. As Deputy Ferbrache would say, you are entitled to be wrong! But having made that erroneous decision, it is my job to make you aware that this role is the one I want, the one I really want.

175 This is the one I am best suited to. This is the one I can add most value to and I am going to explain why and then what I would do with it if you give it to me. I sat on the States' Review Committee in the 2012-16 term, first under Deputy Harwood as Chief Minister, then under Deputy Le Tocq. My single greatest influence on the work of that Committee was probably the recommendation to establish the STSB at the beginning of the last term.

180 The intention always was that it should be a less politically driven and more commercially driven committee, hence it being the only committee of the States required to have non-States' members, who, unlike other committees, also have a vote alongside States' Members. As such, just like a commercial board, I will be proposing States' Members who are aligned to the change programme.

185 The portfolio, Aurigny, States' Works, Guernsey Waste, Guernsey Electricity, Guernsey Post, Guernsey Water, Guernsey Dairy, and JamesCo, which owns the tanker ships, is the monopoly board of Guernsey utilities serving our community, without the train stations. Whilst there may be no train stations, mixing my toy references, this is a train set I know and want to go and build.

190 Before going further I should say that these businesses are pretty well-managed. I know this, having been a director of Aurigny for just under a year, before being elected to the States in 2012. I know this from having acted in the shareholder role for Guernsey Electricity, Guernsey Post, Aurigny and JamesCo, as the Minister of Treasury & Resources between 2012 and 2016 and I know this from having been the President of P&R for the last four years, crawling over their finances.

195 So I am not going to parrot a lazy trope criticising our hard-working public service and management, which we hear from so many quarters in an attempt to pick up a vote or two. But I do firmly believe that collectively the trading assets of the STSB are capable of improvement, and I do believe that they are capable of contributing both a capital and revenue stream into the Treasury, in accordance with the Medium-Term Financial Plan, albeit recognising that the MTFP is going to need to be flexed post-Covid.

200 I am going to pitch to you what I think we should be looking at to make them more commercial and I should emphasise looking at. We need to shoot a few foxes here. I am not presenting final solutions today but I am making the point if, having convinced ourselves that the electorate wanted a change agenda, simply doing more of the same with the STSB is not going to deliver against those expectations.

I must emphasise from the outset, when I talk about sweating assets, that does not and cannot simply mean ramping prices to customers to inflate the revenue line at the top of the profit and loss account. That would be unacceptable. I do not advocate it, I would resist it.

Firstly, the work that has been done over many years now to put Guernsey Water and Guernsey Electricity together to share the cost base and systems of one utility basically supplying to the same customer base should, in my view, be dusted down. This needs to be done in the context of understanding and finally determining the role of the Guernsey Competition & Regulatory Authority in relation to Guernsey Electricity.

In an initiative led by Deputy Stewart and myself, the 2012-16 States resolved to switch this regulation off, whilst Economic Development, under Deputies Ferbrache and Parkinson, decided not to progress that particular piece of de-regulation in the last term. With increasing decentralisation of electricity production, with micro-generation feeding into the grid, understanding what we are trying to achieve with regulation in that new landscape is key.

I do not pretend I have got all the answers, five years on from the previous decision, but we do need to make a decision. It might, for example, mean having a single cable and supply business into which individual generators are granted access and the regulation is simply to ensure that access is given at a fair price.

Secondly, aside from Guernsey Water, which I have already referenced, I think we should look at incorporating the other unincorporated businesses: Guernsey Waste, States' Works and Guernsey Dairy. The incorporation of Guernsey Electricity and Guernsey Post had a very chequered start, but we can learn from that experience and it has allowed those businesses, over a period of time, to move the staff from States' terms and conditions, pay negotiations and the States' final salary pension scheme, onto more normal commercial terms. The removal of this straitjacket for the businesses would also enable them to, more readily, direct their resources where they want, within their businesses, without reference to arcane States' processes, pay grades and scales.

We must, of course, respect employees' contractual rights and execute any changes with care and sensitivity. We have done all of these things before with Post and Electricity and we can do it again.

Third, the ports, harbour and airport, are functional but there is self-evidently a lot of space at both that is capable of generating a greater return on that space. Fourth, the Dairy is to be rebuilt, a decision late in the day of the last States. On behalf of P&R, I recently wrote to the STSB advising that in building the business case, consideration should be given not to just building a functional Dairy to replace the existing ageing one, but thought should also be given to the wider commercial opportunities of a visitor centre, focused of course on the iconic Guernsey Cow but also potentially providing an environmental and educational angle to.

A very simple example of what I was talking about on Friday, of the inter-connectedness between economic, social and environmental policies. I can now go to the other side, pick up the letter I wrote to the last President, and get on with it.

Fifth, Aurigny should for the time being be handed back to P&R. The strategy and role for Aurigny really needs to be worked out by P&R and Economic Development working together. There is no shareholder function to perform when the company is so indebted and under water, and indebted to P&R and commercial lenders guaranteed by P&R. I am sure the President of P&R will confirm, having been on the other side of the table, that right now the STSB are the spare wheel in the relationship and frankly its role just adds time, process and bureaucracy. This is one area where we can deliver a cut in red tape and deliver on the President's much-repeated reliance on his favourite Churchill quote, 'action this day'. Let us do it.

Sixth, the States is going to require access to significant sums of cash. I know that because I provided the Treasury political lead for eight years. The States has an understandable reluctance to borrow but the STSB provides two opportunities that may partially assist and they should at least be looked at. Firstly, incorporation would allow a normal capital structure. Similar surpluses of their type to be put in place, which may release some cash back to Treasury and, secondly, we should examine whether we can learn anything from the Jersey Electricity model and float minority stakes –

I am not suggesting more – of say 15-25% on the International Stock Exchange. To be clear, I am not saying we should do it, but I am saying we should look at it.

I only want you to vote for me if you are prepared to let me go off and start to deliver what I have set out today. If it is too rich a diet for you and you prefer more of what Deputy Roffey sets out, and I am delighted he is standing, please support him. I would rather know now than later down the road.

If you are going to support me, let me also put you on notice that it is conditional on your support for my nominees for the vacant seats on the committee. I will certainly nominate Deputy Trott. The nominee for the third seat will come from one of Deputies Noakes, Oliver and Cameron, who have all expressed interest in the role.

If successful, I will talk to them all to confirm their interest, having heard me today, before putting one name to you. I wish to be unambiguous and transparent. If you decide you want to appoint me but not my nominees, I will resign. My tenure will be very brief. As I said on Friday you can trust that I say what I mean and I will do what I say.

On that basis, I am offering you an indivisible package today of me, who would provide executive not servant leadership of the STSB, a plan and my nominees. The STSB has not yet fulfilled the ambitions the States' Review Committee had for it in 2016. I am not going to go into why we failed in that regard. In any event, as Socrates said, 'The secret of change is to focus all your energy not on fighting the old but building the new.' That is precisely what I want to go and do, starting tomorrow. If you like it, please vote for me, so I can get on with it. If you do not, please support Deputy Roffey.

The Bailiff: I turn to the proposer of Deputy Roffey, Deputy de Sausmarez.

Deputy de Sausmarez: Thank you, sir.

We have before us two excellent candidates and I am delighted to propose Deputy Peter Roffey as President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board, not just because he has a perfect blend of political and commercial experience, but also because he has a clear and compelling vision of how the STSB can deliver against both financial and social objectives.

Deputy Roffey is in some ways a difficult person to introduce precisely because he is a man that needs very little introduction. He first entered the States as a 23-year-old, back in the early 1980's, and since then has served in just about every area imaginable. Over his many years of public service, he has served on and often led, everything from the Board of Health to Agriculture & Countryside, Housing to Scrutiny, Ancient Monuments Committee to the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee, the IDC to the Equal Pay Investigation Committee, Scrutiny to Employment & Social Security and Education to Overseas Aid.

Most recently, however, he has been a very active Member of the STSB and is now its only available political incumbent, his former President having gone onto a higher calling. Deputy Roffey is undoubtedly a big beast of the political world, but he is also a beast of the commercial world, too. Commercial experience is in no short supply in this Assembly, which bodes well, but the States' Trading Assets are no ordinary commercial entities.

They are owned by the community and therefore do not and should not operate simply as profit-making machines. Financial performance and efficiency is paramount but not at the expense of the community. They have to be achieved in a way that supports ordinary Islanders, and this is where Deputy Roffey's commercial experience is uniquely suited to the task, as I am sure he will explain in more detail when he speaks.

The shareholders in the States' trading assets are the people of Guernsey and, while every Member of the States has a legitimate claim to understand the people we all represent, I will venture that Deputy Roffey, thanks in part to the longevity, scale and range of his political experience, in part to his varied life experience and in part to his deep-rooted involvement in the community, understands Guernsey people particularly well.

I remember the first time I personally witnessed Deputy Roffey's uncanny ability to connect with people and cut straight to the heart of their concerns. Our paths had crossed on the campaign trail back in 2016, when we had both been canvassing in the same area and I found myself stopping in my tracks to watch a master at work. Door after door, his conversations illustrated not just his encyclopaedic knowledge of the States, but also his incisive understanding of people. It was plain he just got what made people tick; their challenges, their fears, their hopes and their dreams, and he was always absolutely honest and deeply empathetic.

The STSB has a very complex mandate. It covers not just the role of shareholder in Cabernet, which is the parent company for Aurigny, of course, Guernsey Electricity, Guernsey Post and JamesCo, the parent company that owns our fuel ships, but it is also responsible for the efficient management of our and Alderney's airports, our harbours, the Channel Islands Lottery, Guernsey Water, the Dairy, States' Works and the Waste Disposal Authority.

As we have seen over the last couple of years, the policy letters, which STSB brings to the States, tend to be large, complex and often controversial. They need to be sold to Members by someone who not only understands the issues themselves, but who has the powers of oratory to allow other Members to understand them too.

Now I am sure both of the candidates here today would make excellent, hard-working Members of the STSB, but Deputy Roffey has the particular powers of oratory, which would make him a huge asset to the committee as its President and public face. Despite its heavy and complex mandate, it is a Board with just three political Members. Deputy Roffey is the only presidential candidate with STSB experience and that experience is hugely valuable, especially at this particular point in time when the new Assembly needs to hit the ground running.

New committees always face a steep learning curve in the first few months but with Deputy Roffey at the helm, the STSB would have a vital element of continuity to give it the momentum it needs to get off to a flying start. We have before us two excellent candidates for this important role and I believe Deputy Roffey has the ideal range of political, commercial and life experience to make him the best candidate.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: I turn to Deputy Roffey to speak for up to 10 minutes. Deputy Roffey, please.

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir.

Members, why do I think I am the best person to be the new President of the STSB? Well, I have trained for it for the last several decades. A huge chunk of my life outside of this Assembly has been dedicated to directing and growing a highly commercial organisation, operating in an extremely competitive world, but crucially owned by its customers and therefore not driven solely by the motive of maximising profits.

The Channel Islands Co-op is in many ways very analogous to all of the States' trading entities. If it was not commercial in everything that it did, it would very soon fail. But if it ever starts to believe that its core function is simply generating profits, it will have lost its way and its original purpose. The same is true, in my view, for Guernsey Electricity, Guernsey Water and all of the other publicly owned utilities and businesses.

Now, my long tenure at the Co-op was never easy, operating in a highly competitive environment never is. But it was highly successful. When I joined the CICS, it was much smaller than it is today, a genuine minnow of local retailing, leading to one of my erstwhile BBC colleagues to ask if I had taken leave of my senses. 'You do not stand a chance against the big boys like Le Riche and Besant's,' he opined. Well I begged to differ and I went on to prove him wrong.

Members, I have commerciality, commercial insights and commercial instincts ingrained into my very DNA and I believe they are exactly what the leader of the STSB needs. More recently I tried out those commercial skills on a much bigger stage. When the Co-op Group in the UK, no connection to the CICS, faced an existential crisis due to the travails of the Co-op Bank, I joined its national governance structure. I spent three years on its business performance committee and I am really

proud of the way in which a focus on getting the basics right has turned around that £8 billion a year business and set it on the road to growth.

So I have a huge amount of commercial experience at all levels. And my commercial experience is not in the finance industry, accountancy or trust management. I do not denigrate any of those callings; I admire them. But I think in the context of STSB it is relevant that my commercial experience is in delivering front line goods and services in a world where the customer is always right, in a world where the failure to keep costs down and put customers first always spells disaster.

Members, I am convinced that costs can be driven down significantly in our States-owned trading entities, through a combination of efficiency, a more commercial approach and by greater co-operation and synergy between the various States' businesses.

Where I differ markedly from the other candidate is that I think those benefits should all be passed onto the customer and not to the Exchequer. I do not believe in hidden taxation, which has no relation to a person's ability to pay. If we ever use high dividends from our utilities as a significant revenue source then we will indeed have introduced quasi-taxation, which is likely to hit the poorest hardest.

Even worse in my view, we will be shamelessly abusing what are near monopoly situations. This is neither a fair nor a sustainable way of funding basic public services. In fact, it is basically a VAT or a large GST levied on the most basic of life's commodities, like water and power and I thought most of us vowed to our electorate very recently that we were not in favour of GST.

Going back to the subject of commerciality, I give this pledge. If given this job I will absolutely maximise the input of commercial advisors from the private sector sitting on the boards of the unincorporated trading entities. Those businesses belong to the whole community and we should be using proven talent from the whole community to ensure that they thrive.

I will turn to a few specific issues that I see looming for the STSB. Firstly, the system of regulation in Guernsey is broken. Taking a UK regulatory model, designed to control competing and privately owned utilities and applying it to the completely different situation in Guernsey was and is complete madness. Not only is it a duplication of effort and therefore a duplication of cost, but it leads to perverse outcomes.

For instance, years of inappropriate regulation have led to Guernsey Electricity being so deeply and unnecessarily indebted that it needs to make the best part of £3 million a year from its customers just to service that debt, before it can even start to show a profit. Now I have got nothing against commercial organisations borrowing to invest in their infrastructure but on the level of turnover that it generates, the amount of debt that GEL has been forced to take on is complete madness. It gets worse. Its debt mountain is now so large that it is pushing it very close to its bank covenants, and that in turn is starting to significantly and adversely impact on core capital investment decisions. This simply must stop. If I am President of STSB, I will push for that to happen without delay.

Talking of electricity there is, I think it has been flagged up by the other candidate, another looming problem for the States. Traditionally our Government, through its ownership of Guernsey Electricity, has relied on its monopoly supplier status to indulge in a bit of understandable and laudable financial redistribution. Put simply the standing charges are nowhere near high enough to cover the cost for maintaining the generation and distribution network.

On the other hand, the unit charges are much higher than the genuine variable cost of generating that electricity. It was a very benign way of trying to spread the load and to protect small customers, like poor old Mrs Le Page from Torteval, a woman by the way that new Members will get to know very well over the coming years. *(Laughter)* It would protect her and others like her from paying too much for their modest electricity consumption.

Sadly, it is just not going to work going forward. If GEL is going to become one of a range of electricity generators, or importers, and the custodian of the local grid, the business model will be broken. But correcting it will require a matching welfare response. Because if it does not it will simply increase fuel poverty in the Island, which already exists. Not easy, but just the sort of conundrum I like to get my teeth into.

Talking about conundrums, what about Aurigny? STSB is the shareholder on behalf of the States and I know it takes that duty very seriously. But that does not mean that it is the STSB's job to determine Aurigny's future, what its proper role or how much the taxpayer should be expected to pay for the economic enablement it provides. I think the frustration for the STSB is that years on it is still waiting for the high-level strategic steer that it was promised on these issues by this Assembly and by P&R in particular.

Now, if I am head of STSB, we will of course contribute to that debate fully, using our insights into the operational issues – and there are many – facing Guernsey's airline, but respecting the fact that our role in determining the strategic policy, what Aurigny is for, if you like, will be limited, because the STSB has a specific, non-policy making mandate. Once those decisions have finally been taken, I will ensure that they are carried out by using the shareholder function to its full extent.

In closing, I want to address two wider issues. Is it normal to stand as a president of two committees and will I have the time to devote to both roles? The answer to both questions is an emphatic yes. Until recently it was really quite normal to head up more than one committee, in fact I did it myself with the Board of Health and Agriculture & Countryside. Indeed, I would strongly be recommending all Members that they consider standing for more than one committee themselves, so they do not fall into the trap of viewing Government through one restricted lens, otherwise you will go native, I warn you. Not you, sir, Members of the States! *(Laughter)*

As for my time, I am already a very active Member of both STSB and ESS and while being President would of course be more demanding, that would be more than compensated for by no longer being a Member of ESC, so my overall time commitment would actually be reduced. Members, electing committee presidents is not about sharing out the goodies fairly. It may feel like that but it is not. It is far more serious than that.

We need to ensure that we select the best person for each of these important roles and I genuinely believe I am the best person for this role, or I would not be asking for your vote – and I do. My first instinct when I heard that Deputy St Pier was standing, was to actually stand aside, make way for him and maybe put myself up as an ordinary Member.

But on talking to him it became clear that our philosophical approaches to the very *raison d'être* for the States-owned businesses are poles apart. We just do not agree on them. In fact, I think his vision is appalling. I have a huge respect for Deputy St Pier as an individual and as a politician, I hope that became clear in my proposal speech for him as President of P&R, and I meant every word, but I think he has got this one badly wrong. That is the choice this morning. Not between Deputy St Pier and me but between our visions about what the trading assets are for and I believe that you should vote for me to make the correct choice.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

Members of the States, we now move into what you are becoming used to, which is up to 30 minutes of questioning to the candidates for the office of President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board. Can you wait for me to invite you to stand, please, Deputy Queripel, because I just remind you, as it has been a day between, the candidates will answer the questions alternately first? Who wishes to ask a question of the candidates? Deputy Queripel.

Deputy Queripel: Sir, thank you.

When they spoke, both candidates said that in their view oversight of Aurigny should be handed over to P&R. What do they think P&R are going to do with it that STSB cannot do? They did not actually explain that when they spoke, they simply said it takes up too much time, which is not a justifiable reason to hand over responsibility to another committee in my view. So I would like to hear that explanation from them please.

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: The issue is that the STSB is there to perform a shareholder role. It cannot function as a shareholder for a company that is, in essence, bankrupt, other than being propped up by P&R as the creditor. So it is in essence the creditor responsibility to manage the relationship with the asset that it controls, or the liability, I should say, that it controls, and until such time as Aurigny is put into a better financial position, I do not see it really has a role

It is just a further group of people with a different opinion, trying to come together around the table with Economic Development and P&R. P&R and Economic Development need to make those strategic recommendations to this Assembly about the future of Aurigny and then we will take it from there.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

Deputy Roffey: I did not actually quite say that. What I said was that the frustration for STSB is they could not do their job in relation to Aurigny without the over-arching vision about connectivity, air routes and where we were going as far as what we wanted to use Aurigny for and that that would be taken out of the hands of STSB and we were promised, I think first it was going to be Economic Development, then it was taken out of their hands and taken to P&R, saying, 'We are going to work out the master plan on this and bring it back to the States.' It never happened.

I do not really see P&R as necessarily being the creditor of Aurigny. I think this Assembly is the creditor of Aurigny. We are the ones who are putting the money in. I have no strong feelings whether the connectivity between the Assembly and Aurigny should be to STSB or P&R. I do not believe in changes for changes' sake, but I do think we need the strategic vision of what it is for before anybody can do anything meaningful.

The Bailiff: Deputy Helyar.

Deputy Helyar: Sir, both candidates mentioned regulation in relation to electricity and the GCRA and identified it as a problem. Could they tell the Assembly what they think the solution is?

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey:

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir.

Certainly, I should qualify, I do not actually blame the office of the regulator, because I think they are applying the sorts of regulations that this Assembly wrongly decided should be applied to things like electricity and so on. I think the answer is for the STSB to be a really active shareholder and engage on behalf of ensuring profitability and good practice but also we are politically elected and we represent the ordinary consumer as well and we would not pursue the sort of profiteering that regulation is there to guard against because we are answerable to the people that elected us and that is our *raison d'être*.

So I think we are just duplicating ... either get rid of the STSB and its shareholder function because there is no point to it, or get rid of the regulation, but we should decide one way or another because we are trying to do the same thing in two different ways. I prefer to keep the STSB and limit regulation of things like telecoms, which is more analogous in the local situation to the UK one that –

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey, that is your minute. Deputy St Pier, please.

Deputy St Pier: Sir, I appreciate I was moving at some pace so Deputy Helyar may not have heard me say I do not have all the answers on that question but my view is that actually one suggestion would be possibly to split Guernsey Electricity between its supply business and the network, particularly now with an increased number of generators.

Only a few years ago the only generator was the power station and now of course we have the cable, but we also have a series of micro-generators now who are feeding into the grid and I think it is about ensuring fair access to the grid. So I could see a scenario where you regulate the access to the grid, the rest of the business is, in essence, unregulated and dealt with in exactly the way that Deputy Roffey has suggested, which I absolutely endorse in respect of most businesses under the control of the States.

The Bailiff: Deputy Inder.

Deputy Inder: Neither candidate has mentioned, ports development I do not believe. A significant piece of work, it is supposed to come back in December, likely to come back in June. Why has there been no access to Economic Development on development of the ports and the infrastructure?

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: I am really struggling to understand the question. I wonder whether perhaps Deputy Inder could repeat it?

The Bailiff: Can you try and re-pose the question please, Deputy Inder? It is about ports.

Deputy Inder: My apologies. Not the first time. Why has Economic Development over the past year-and-a-half had no access or oversight over the Ports Development Plan, as it is an economic enabler?

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: I have no idea.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

Deputy Roffey: If I understand the question, there is a piece of work going on about what to do with our commercial ports and I think, put very bluntly, we could have a really expensive redevelopment of our current harbour, a much more expensive development outside our current harbour or an even more expensive development further north.

I quite agree that when those sums have been worked out and the options have been put forward, then it is not just a question for STSB to decide which is the most cost effective, it is also what we would use our ports for and Economic Development would absolutely be key to that debate and I would encourage co-working to make sure that that happens.

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Thank you, sir. Sir, GFL has debt that has funded its infrastructure investment, without that debt it would have needed to generate huge amounts of cash and that would have resulted in enormous hikes in electricity prices. Would either candidate recommend huge hikes in electricity prices or do they see the merits of a balance sheet that is of a far more conventional and commercial nature?

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

Deputy Roffey: I said in my address that I can see the case for borrowing for investment to a degree but I think you have to be careful of how high that gearing goes. I do not think it is a

565 question of hikes in electricity prices. What regulation has done has frozen electricity prices for many years, creating a debt mountain and to get out of that, unless we choose to re-capitalise Guernsey Electricity, that is actually what is going to cause the spike in electricity prices, it is going to be actually trying to get back on an even keel when they can make proper investment decisions. So I am afraid I totally agree with the thrust and the basis of the question.

570 **The Bailiff:** Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: The save to invest model, which of course was the model with the previous regulatory model, is a nonsense ideology. The idea that all future investments should be on the shoulders of current consumers. So, absolutely, I do agree that I think all the businesses should have conventional balance sheets, which recognise that long-term investment should be paid for by those that enjoy the benefit of that long-term investment. In other words, present and future consumers, not past consumers, so I absolutely endorse that and I set that out when I spoke and I hope Deputy Trott heard that.

580 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Fairclough.

Deputy Fairclough: Thank you, sir.

585 What are the candidates' visions for the future management of the States' extensive property portfolio?

The Bailiff: It is outside the mandate of this Committee, I am afraid, so that question cannot be posed. Deputy Kazantseva-Miller.

590 **Deputy Kazantseva-Miller:** Thank you, sir.

I sat on the board of Guernsey Ports for a year and I saw first-hand that first of all we do not have an asset register and second of all we do not have valuation attached to those assets. How would the candidates propose to solve that major issue, which relates to most of our trading assets? Thank you.

595 **The Bailiff:** Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: It clearly is a priority that we have an asset register for all the businesses without which you cannot track, you cannot plan future replacement and so on. It is clearly going to require the requisite investment to enable that to happen and I would certainly hope, I would add sir, that actually there would continue to be an ongoing role for those that have previously been involved in the management of all of these assets across the States.

605 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Roffey.

Deputy Roffey: I think that is a key bit of work going forward and I think it really is high on the agenda. The STSB was set up four years ago and was plagued by having three different Presidents, I think, inside a few years, and therefore has not made the progress that it ought to have done but I think it now actually is in overdrive, particularly with the two excellent non-States' Members we have on, who have an incredibly strong commercial background and that is exactly the type of agenda that they are driving and I agree, if you do not know what you own, how on earth do you manage it?

615 **The Bailiff:** Deputy de Lisle.

Deputy de Lisle: Thank you, sir.

Can I ask the candidates their position on the Dairy, going forward, particularly with the issues of lower production problems and capital renewal and equipment, in terms of facilities?

620 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Roffey.

Deputy Roffey: The key thing is to get supply and demand into balance. We have an over-supply of milk, which is leading to haemorrhaging of profitability. Farmers understand that and they are working with the Dairy to actually address that. I agree that we should have a new Dairy. Where
625 I perhaps slightly disagree with the other candidate is that my commercial instinct tells me that a visitor centre actually will not wash its own face.

If we want it as part of a tourism product, like a museum, which loses money at the moment, where nearly all of our museums do then that is great, I think it can be considered in the round. But actually I think and I am proud of the Guernsey Cow and the heritage so I would love to see it
630 happen, but do not think it is suddenly going to be a money spinner and justify the investment in the new Dairy. The investment in the new Dairy is there because the dairy industry is integral to Guernsey life and we should not actually have any doubt about that is the reason for spending money.

635 **The Bailiff:** Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: Sir, to be clear, I was not suggesting that a visitor centre would be a money spinner but I was saying that it should definitely be looked at as part of the business case. Now is the opportunity to examine whether there is an opportunity there or not. We do not want to build
640 it and then think about it after the event. That, I think, is the only point.

Clearly there is a substantial change in the market for milk, as consumer tastes are consumer tastes are changing and people are consuming alternative products. That is a long-term trend, which is going to continue, and that is clearly going to put substantial financial pressure on the Dairy. The issue is about the management of supply and demand and the States' appetite and willingness to
645 continue to support and subsidise the whole Dairy operation as part of its wider commitment to the maintenance of the environment that we enjoy. That is the bigger issue, which takes us beyond the role of the STSB, actually into the role of Environment & Infrastructure and ultimately some decisions of this Assembly.

650 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard.

Deputy Brouard: Thank you, sir.

I was drawn to stand in the States on the back of the ill-judged give away of Guernsey Telecoms, where we are still counting the cost today. Will you be prepared to sell, give away or similar, our
655 vital utilities owned by the people?

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: An excellent question and one that does provide me an opportunity to provide
660 clarity on that. As I said when I spoke, I would not be in favour of the disposal of any majority stake in any of the businesses, but I do think we have a responsibility, on behalf of taxpayers, to look at – I am not saying we should do it, but we should look at it and present any options to the States – the realisation of a minority stake and what the impact of that has been, for example on Jersey Electricity, and whether we can learn any lessons from that and it brings any advantages to us. We
665 absolutely should be doing that as an alternative to borrowing by the States in respect of many other projects, which will require funds over the next five to 10 years.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

670 **Deputy Roffey:** When you have utilities and basic businesses providing absolutely basic services, with a near-monopoly situation, then we have to be really careful about the profit motive. That does not mean you do not drive down costs as much as possible but, actually, generating profits, I think there is a real morality question when you have got that sort of control of the market, so I have fears.

675 But, going back to Guernsey Electricity, Guernsey's telecoms, I would actually like to reverse that to some degree. I think if we are going to roll out super-fast broadband then some type of vehicle, of which I hope the States would be a major investor, should actually take control of the infrastructure in the Island and actually provide a platform on which commercial organisations can use but not actually the commercial organisations using only that network, otherwise we will not compete with Jersey for super-fast broadband.

680 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Oliver.

Deputy Oliver: Thank you, sir.

685 At the moment, we have had several reports regarding the ports and what should be done and they have all been ignored. What would your small vision be regarding the ports?

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

690 **Deputy Roffey:** I do not think they are being ignored. I think the Ports Supervisory Board, under the able chairmanship of Stuart Falla, is due to finish work this year and bring forward some very firm choices about what we do with the ports. What we do, I think, have to be realistic rather than go chasing unicorns, we have to make sure that in terms of hydrocarbons, cruise ships and anything else, that the huge amount of money that some of the projects being considered would involve have actually got some sort of payback. Not just that they are nice in principle but they have to have payback.

695 It may be that we are less ambitious than some Members of the States actually want, but what we have to do is actually bring our ports up to scratch. There has been a chronic under-investment now for decades and that, at the very least, has to be addressed.

700 **The Bailiff:** Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: The ports of course are Airport and harbours. In relation to the Airport, clearly that is an asset, which is going to remain there, it is largely settled, subject to the decisions around lengthening the runway or not, which will largely be driven, I suspect, by the Committee for Economic Development.

705 So it is really a question of how we use that space and I think there are, as I said, indicated opportunities for that land area, is not as well used as it could be and I am sure Deputy Oliver would agree with that, given her experience.

710 In relation to the ports at St Sampson's and St Peter Port, clearly that has to fit in to whatever the long-term plan is and I think in that case even the President of Policy & Resources would agree we do actually need to have a plan in that case. We cannot drive that development entirely by action alone, we will need to develop a vision and a plan. So, in the meantime it is going to be hampered by that and finding the opportunities within the context, let us make a decision on that bigger plan as quickly as we can and then everything else will follow from that.

715 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: Returning to the ports, both the harbour and the Airport have customer-facing terminal facilities. Why cannot the franchises for both include more local produce, local cafes, local advertising and more marketing opportunities, generally, at both harbour and the Airport?

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

725 **Deputy St Pier:** I think those are excellent ideas. That is exactly what I am talking about in the context, when you talk about sweating assets it is that, using that space in order to provide those kinds of opportunities and produce a return, without the need to ramp prices in exactly the way that Deputy Roffey fears. I think they should be explored by people who know how to explore them.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

730 **Deputy Roffey:** I am inordinately proud of Guernsey produce, Guernsey products, and I would like to showcase them at the ports very much. I do not think it is part of the franchise arrangement you could agree with that. I think once you give out a franchise you have to allow people to run that commercially, but we as the ports could actually do more to make sure that those sorts of facilities are there. I think they are, to a certain extent, at the Airport already. I think probably the
735 harbour is where we are falling short there and I agree with Deputy Gollop that more should be done.

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson.

740 **Deputy Parkinson:** Could the candidates tell us what their positions are on a possible extension of the Guernsey Airport runway?

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

745 **Deputy Roffey:** I am yet to be convinced, I have to say. I am not completely closed-minded, but I do have significant reservations, not only on the environmental impact and whether, post-Covid, the case is still there, but also on whether actually fewer, larger aircraft, doing fewer rotations will necessarily increase rather than decrease the connectivity that people want in the Island. I come from the point of view of being slightly cynical over it, but I have not completely closed my mind.
750

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: Sir, I think in this case, the Members of the Assembly probably will not have much choice between the positions of Deputy Roffey and myself. I think I share, probably less
755 cynicism and more scepticism, of the challenges around extending the runway but I think that is an issue, as I said in response to a previous question, that does need to be driven, in the first instance, by the Committee for Economic Development establishing that there is a merit in doing so and then we take it from there.

760 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Vermeulen.

Deputy Vermeulen: Thank you, sir.
We have got two airports. Is there an interest in investing in the other one in Alderney?

765 **The Bailiff:** Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: There is already a States' commitment to invest a substantial amount of money – £12 million from memory, off the top of my head – in the refurbishment of that piece of asphalt. There may be a need for further investment around the terminal and so on. I am not sure why that
770 business case has not been progressed, why they have not got on with that. That decision has been made, let us do it.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

775 **Deputy Roffey:** I see there is no votes in this answer today, but I will give it anyway! Yes, absolutely, the widening and strengthening and the construction of that has already been approved. I would personally like to consider, having asked the way I did for the Guernsey runway, a modest lengthening of the Alderney runway, to allow it to take 80 yards. It will mean they have less frequent flights but it could be a simplification of the Aurigny fleet, which is far too complicated at the
780 moment to be cost effective and it would allow some triangulation with Southampton as well. So I think that is an option that should be seriously considered.

The Bailiff: Deputy Gabriel.

785 **Deputy Gabriel:** Thank you, sir.

What are the candidates' thoughts on any synergies to be gained or lost by part or whole ownership of the other Bailiwick's utilities?

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

790 **Deputy Roffey:** Which other Bailiwick? Do you think we should be buying part of Jersey's utilities?

The Bailiff: It must be a reference to Jersey. It can only be.

795 **Deputy Roffey:** I am sorry, I did not quite catch the question, could I ask for a clarification?

The Bailiff: Could it be repeated please, Deputy Gabriel?

800 **Deputy Gabriel:** My apologies. What are the candidates' thoughts on synergies to be gained or lost by part or whole-ownership in Alderney and Sark's utilities?

The Bailiff: It is Alderney and Sark's utilities, rather than Jersey's? I misunderstood. We will add a bit of time for that. I will call Deputy Roffey first.

805 **Deputy Roffey:** It is difficult because we are not in the sort of relationship with Sark that, unless they come and ask us and say, 'Can you help with our conundrum?', I do not think us banging on their door and trying to do something about it would be welcome. I think we have to respect the constitutional relationship that we have with Sark.

810 Likewise, power generation and the other utilities in Alderney are not transferred services, but we have a much closer working relationship there and a shared Exchequer. I think if they were, I am not 100% sure of the issues facing them, I know electricity is a lot more expensive here because of economies of scale. I am not sure there is anything we can do to help, particularly, or whether it should be the Guernsey States or the Alderney States that invest but I am open to looking at all of
815 that, but I am not aware it has been raised as an issue.

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

820 **Deputy St Pier:** To answer the question, I do not believe there are any obvious synergies in Guernsey participation in those utilities in Alderney and Sark. But to answer a question which you did not ask, which the Presiding Officer thought you were asking in relation to Jersey, I actually can see some synergies in relation to Jersey, particularly in relation to Post, possibly in relation to electricity and certainly, when I was the Treasury Minister, there were some conversations exploring that, which did not progress terribly far.

825 Again, I think it probably is incumbent to be considering those kinds of questions. I am not saying it should happen. As with everything I have said, we should be looking at it. That is the issue, is actually driving our thinking in a different way, that allows these opportunities to be explored and opened up if there is mileage in them.

830 **The Bailiff:** Is there any Member who has not yet asked a question, who wishes to ask a question of the candidates? Then Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Sir, thank you.

835 Previous States have made some spectacularly good decisions. The building of the QEII Marina is the most successful infrastructure project in our history. A spectacular success for the taxpayer. Would the candidates support such obvious future investment, particularly in support of the blue economy?

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

840 **Deputy St Pier:** Yes.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

845 **Deputy Roffey:** Depends what it is. I think certainly our eastern seaboard and particularly around St Peter Port has huge opportunity for enhancement. I think we have under-invested in it and under-used it for a long time, particularly the piers. That does not mean I want to get rid of all parking in St Peter Port.

850 But I think Belle Greve, for instance, is called Belle for a very good reason. I think it is a beautiful part of Guernsey's landscape, with the best view over the small islands of anywhere in the Island and I am not predisposed to have a major development of Belle Greve, and if that is where the seafront enhancement scheme is heading then I am afraid they are going to find me a drag, rather than a following wind.

855 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Dyke.

Deputy Dyke: Could I ask the candidates if they have given any thought to changing our tendering processes? For example, we have announced that with the Dairy we are considering £2.6 million for a business case and £26 million for the buildings. Both of which seem to be enormous sums. Once announced, how will they ever get a competitive tender? It is not something any business would normally do.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

865 **Deputy Roffey:** I am not sure it actually falls within the mandate of STB, in the sense that the tendering policy has really come from the centre, as directed down to committees how to do it. I have to say I found in the last Assembly our capital process, our whole capital process of which tendering is one part, to be like wading through treacle. We kept putting huge amounts of money aside to do capital developments and never did any, because trying to actually satisfy all the tick boxes that were in place was almost impossible. Not quite. But it was also a really expensive process.

870 It is a problem. If you ask permission from the States to go ahead with a project, they want to know how much it is going to cost. If you tell them how much it is going to cost you are then telling potential tenderers where their benchmark and their ball park is and in 40 years in the States, on and off, I have never been able to totally reconcile that. But I think the Deputy is right, we ought to try to perhaps go out to pre-tender first, before announcing what we are willing to spend.

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

880 **Deputy St Pier:** Deputy Roffey is correct that the principal construct of tender and capital process is led by the Policy & Resources Committee. However, I think to answer the question, it does speak to exactly what I was seeking to address in my opening, that actually we should be thinking of these as commercial assets rather than politically driven assets and that will free them from the shackles of the States' processes.

885 So, for example, Guernsey Electricity and Guernsey Post, as incorporated businesses, do not have the same procurement processes as the unincorporated businesses of Guernsey Water. Those are exactly the kinds of things that I think would be unlocked by incorporation of the unincorporated businesses and driving them in a different way.

890 **The Bailiff:** Once again, are there other Members who have not yet asked a question who wished to do so, because it is the opportunity? No. Deputy Queripel please.

895 **Deputy Queripel:** Sir, thank you. It seemed completely illogical to me for us to be spending £100 million on a cable link directly to France when Alderney will soon have a tidal power plant just off their shores. Do the candidates agree with me it would make far more sense for us to link up with that plant, instead of linking directly to France?

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

900 **Deputy St Pier:** Whilst I think at face value that seems attractive, my understanding is, and I have been a little bit distant from it in Policy & Resources in the last couple of years and the outgoing President may have a view on this, but my understanding is that commercially it actually does not make as much sense as might first appear, because of the waters between here and Alderney and obviously there still remains a high degree of uncertainty around the ability to capture that project and therefore actually making decisions now in relation to direct access to France is the right commercial decision for GEL. That is my understanding of the current position but I cannot really update on full knowledge.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

910 **Deputy Roffey:** I think the proposed tidal mill between Alderney and the French mainland is one of a series that are actually going to be manufactured on the French mainland in that region. Therefore, we will be importing exactly the same sort of electricity through a contract with France through those same tidal mills so the question is which is the cheapest way to do it? As has just been said actually, going direct to Alderney is going to be the more expensive option so I see no point in doing that.

The Bailiff: Deputy Gollop.

920 **Deputy Gollop:** Thank you very much, sir. Candidates have not mentioned water much, so my question is will the candidates focus on further ensuring that water has no pollution within it and also that we consider, for the sake of argument, using quarries as additional water reservoirs for the future.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

925 **Deputy Roffey:** The drive for purity I hope goes without saying. As far as strategic reserves of water storage, it is a difficult one, because climate change makes more irregular rainfall. We can

have very intense rainfall and then periods of drought, so maximising water storage makes sense to a degree.

930 But there are competing infrastructure requirements for those quarries. For instance, whether or not we use Longue Hougue South for inert waste finally, that is not going to last forever and therefore there needs to be a very interesting balance, particularly when Ronez have finished with Les Vardes Quarry, in deciding exactly how much water storage we need and being safe and secure without being so obsessional that we actually take them out of the options for other uses.

935

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: Sir, I have very little to add to Deputy Roffey's response, other than to note that the pollution of water of course would be largely an operational matter for management, working
940 with the Health and Safety Executive, rather than for the STSB. The only other comment I would make in relation to Water is that I think it is a well-managed business but it is, I know, to some extent, hamstrung by the terms and conditions that all of its staff are employed on. It limits the flexibility of the management of that business, which I think would benefit from that incorporation in the way that I have already referred to and that of course could be done by combining it with
945 electricity and treating it as a single utility, given that the customer base is so overlapping.

There are definitely some opportunities for synergies between that. It is clearly a project that would need to be well planned and well managed, but that is where the opportunities lie in relation to Water.

950

The Bailiff: Deputy Taylor.

Deputy Taylor: Sir, I am not sure if this will be too specific. It has been mentioned the much-needed investment into the Dairy and whilst I am not in any disagreement with that because I can see the efficiency savings it will bring and the effect that might have on the balance sheet, but there
955 is a downward trend in sales and I wonder how the candidates might address that particular issue?

The Bailiff: Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: First of all I would like to say, sir, in case I do not get the opportunity, I am
960 delighted the Assembly really has a clear choice between the two candidates. In relation to the Dairy, as I indicated in response to a previous question, there is clearly a change in demand, as a result of changing consumption patterns.

So that takes us to a strategic decision about what is the role of the dairy cow in our community and to what extent do we as a community wish to support that and management of the environment
965 and so on. So there is a whole series of questions that flow from that, rather than just seeing it as a problem for the Dairy and for the STSB and it is going to require thinking across committees, rather than it just being parked as an STSB problem.

The Bailiff: Deputy Roffey.

970

Deputy Roffey: As a former President of Agriculture & Countryside, I am absolutely passionate about our dairy industry, but I have to accept that there is a changing pattern of consumer demand and that vegetable based alternatives, we are certainly not going to stop that trend. I think it is laudable the idea that people who have suffered from lactose intolerance will in future be able to
975 enjoy Guernsey milk because of a fairly modest investment.

But I think the new Dairy just has to be fit for its ongoing purpose, which means it is going to have to be highly efficient. The current Dairy is anything but, and it will have to be of a scale to suit what we expect to be processing going forward. I would love to be able to say we could export stuff all over the world but the cost base in Guernsey is hugely higher than most of our competing

980 creameries elsewhere so there is only going to be niche products like Guernsey butter that may find exports. So it really is a question of tailoring supply to demand but if we lose the dairy industry we are going to lose part of the soul of Guernsey.

The Bailiff: That is your minute, Deputy Roffey.

985 Thirty minutes are up, I am afraid. You were having such a good time that you had not realised that we have actually gone just beyond the 30 minutes to allow for the interruptions. Can I invite you to show your appreciation of the two candidates? *(Applause)*

Now, I am going to invite you once again to take your voting slips and simply write one name on it, that is either Deputy St Pier, who is proposed by Deputy Soulsby, seconded by Deputy Parkinson, who is proposed by Deputy de Sausmarez and seconded by Deputy Mahoney. So it is
990 either Deputy St Pier or Deputy Roffey.

A secret ballot took place.

The Bailiff: Are there any more voting slips, Members, or have they all been handed to the Sherriff and Deputy Sherriff? In that case, whilst the votes are being counted we will just rise to allow you to stretch your legs for a few minutes, possibly up to five.

*The Assembly adjourned at 10.47 a.m.
and resumed at 10.55 a.m.*

States' Trading Supervisory Board – Deputy Roffey elected President

995 **The Bailiff:** Well, Members of the States, the voting for the President of the States' Trading Supervisory Board is as follows: Deputy St Pier polled 12 votes, Deputy Roffey polled 24 votes, there was one blank paper. Obviously three Members are still absent, and therefore I declare Deputy Roffey duly elected to that presidency. *(Applause)*

XII. Transport Licensing Authority – Deputy Gollop elected President

Article XII.

The States are asked:-

To elect a sitting Member of the States as President of the Transport Licensing Authority to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The Deputy Greffier: Article XII. Election of a President of the Transport Licensing Authority.

1000

The Bailiff: Well, Members of the States, this is the last of the presidencies. Who wishes to propose another Member? Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: Sir, I would like to propose Deputy John Gollop.

1005

The Bailiff: Thank you very much and Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: I second it.

1010 **The Bailiff:** You are seconding that. Are we going to have a contest or is this going to be straight forward? Nobody else is rising, so I will invite Deputy Meerveld, if he wishes, to address the Assembly for up to five minutes about Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Meerveld: Thank you, sir.

1015 I do not think Deputy John Gollop needs introducing to anybody in this room. I think we all know him as a man of incredible intellect and great intelligence. The Transport Licensing Authority, although it is not an active committee at the moment, it is potentially an important one in that there have been discussions about putting other forms of transportation licensing under that committee, such as buses, taxis, etc. So there is a potential for it to evolve.

1020 The hope is that it will develop more of an active role and when it does, Deputy Gollop's character and the way he approaches things is particularly suited to this committee, because it is a quasi-judicial committee. It operates under a set of rules and Deputies sitting on that committee have to interpret the rules under very tight guidelines and have a limited scope for putting their opinions into the process and we all know how intellectual and analytical John is and I think he is admirably suited to this role and I am happy to recommend him to Members.

1025 Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: And Deputy Gollop you have up to 10 minutes, if you so wish, to speak about your candidature.

1030 **Deputy Gollop:** Not everybody seems to want a 10-minute speech on this one but I will give it a go! *(Laughter)*

The Bailiff: I was not encouraging you to use your full 10 minutes, Deputy Gollop!

1035 **Deputy Gollop:** I thank Deputy Meerveld for his generous nomination and he has served as the vice-president of the former committee. He mentioned a new aspect, perhaps, that the Transport Licensing Authority as presently constituted is a quasi-judicial decision-making body and indeed we had extensive and welcome advice from the Law Officers, St James' Chambers on many occasions, and that was an element of training that I would like to continue with.

1040 I have sat on quasi-judicial committees in the past, the old Housing Authority, Environment & Infrastructure, DPA and other committees and of course legislation, so I am well acquainted with those kinds of issues. I would like to be considered as a suitable replacement, if that is possible really, for the incomparable Deputy Barry Paint, who was a founder president and predecessor in this hopefully challenging role.

1045 As I say, I had the privilege of sitting on the previous and founder committee with Deputy Meerveld as vice-president, and other Members included a lot of very analytical and able people including Emilie McSwiggan, Dawn Tindall, Paul Le Pelley, Steve Roberts from Alderney, Mr John Curran and Mr Martyn Langlois as non-States' Members and we were very well served by our principal officer.

1050 I have got four years of experience. The mandate was initially as identified to include maybe ferry ro-ro ramps and vehicle licensing, taxis and buses. But in practice that never happened, so we just exercised the powers and duties of air route licences. After the decision of the States in summer 2018 to switch to open skies generally, the sole routes left in STLA are the lifeline routes between Guernsey and Gatwick and Guernsey and Alderney, which of course is still in a PSO tendering process.

1055 I was a signatory to the Deputy Heidi Soulsby-led Requête, which was sadly postponed in early February, which wanted a root and branch reform of aspects of the machinery of Government. The Requête text described how the States agreed nearly 30 months ago to review the role of the

1060 Transport Licensing Authority, that is still on SACC's books I think, in the light of open skies and the challenge of starting politically with what could be perceived as a regulatory quasi-judicial role, because I think there are issues, when States' Members leave the policy making and political arena for perhaps more of a judicial role.

1065 I will pledge to complete this review as soon as possible and moreover go further and consider whether it would be in the public interest to create and structure a new Transport and Tourism Departments Committee, that would at least co-ordinate and develop functions currently random and perhaps inefficiently distributed across several committees and bureaucracies.

1070 I will conclude by saying I have done a certain degree of research into the role and it is not the first transport committee we have ever had. When I was growing up as a boy and student on the Island, we had a Passenger Transport Licensing Authority, which basically made the bus timetable work and the taxi services. I remember presidents like Peter Derham and others served many roles on that.

1075 That was wound up and became part of the Traffic Committee, which successor Committee is Environment & Infrastructure. More interestingly enough, we also had a States' Transport Board and it was constructed the great Roger Berry and others in 1987 and was reconstituted in 1998. Curiously enough one of the Members in 1998 was none other than Island-wide poll-topper and now Chief Minister Deputy Peter Ferbrache.

1080 The mandate of the Transport Board of the era, which was wound up in 2004, was a constitution which included two non-States' Members, the President of the States' Board of Administration, the President of the States' Advisory and Finance Committee, the President of the States' Tourist Board and the President of the States' Committee for Horticulture, or its representative, the President of the States' Board of Industry.

1085 Why do I mention this? I think there is a need for myself as President to start a conversation whether we should actually restructure and create a different body, which has today's Presidents on it or their representatives: Policy & Resources, Environment & Infrastructure, States' Trading & Supervisory Board, Economic Development. We have our functions of transport spread across the *piste*. We have this artificial division between shareholders, owners and do-ers. So that is what I am interested in.

1090 The only other thing I researched in the period, curiously enough, was in those days, the Transport Board sent representatives to London to talk about the Heathrow link, which we lost and gained and lost again and that was led by the Bailiff and senior figures like Mr Roger Berry, and they actually met a Minister of Transport called Miss G Jackson, so an Oscar-winning star, so there you go, you never know what will come out of restructuring our transport. I think there is a need not just to run this committee for the foreseeable future but to work out a more sensible replacement structure.

1095 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Leadbeater, good morning. Is it your wish to be relevé?

Deputy Leadbeater: Please, sir.

1100 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much. You are just in time to vote for the President of the Transport Licensing Authority, where there is a single candidate, Deputy Gollop, proposed by Deputy Meerveld and seconded by Deputy Ferbrache. All those in favour; all those against?

Members voted Pour.

The Bailiff: I declare Deputy Gollop duly elected without dissension. *(Applause)*

Billet d'État XXII

ELECTIONS & APPOINTMENTS

SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE

I. Scrutiny Management Committee – Election of two members commenced

Article I.

The States are asked:-

To elect two sitting Members of the States as members of the Scrutiny Management Committee to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

1105 **The Deputy Greffier:** Billet XXII – Article I – Election of Members of the Scrutiny Management Committee.

The Bailiff: And I turn to the President of the Committee first, Deputy Brouard ... Deputy Burford, sorry.

1110

Deputy Brouard: Thank you, sir, thank you so very much! *(Laughter)*

1115 **The Bailiff:** Sorry, it is looking in that direction and knowing what you are supposed to say but it comes out wrong. I do apologise, Deputy Burford. I turn to the President of the Committee, Deputy Burford to see if she has any nominations.

Deputy Burford: Thank you, sir. Yes, I would like to nominate Deputy Fairclough and Deputy St Pier.

1120 **The Bailiff:** And are those nominations seconded?

Deputy Aldwell: Yes sir, Deputy Fairclough.

1125 **The Bailiff:** Are you seconding both of those nominations?

Deputy Brouard: I will happily second Deputy St Pier.

1130 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much, so that is Deputy Aldwell, Deputy Brouard. Do any other Members wish to nominate another Member? In that case ... Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: Sorry, sir. I would like to nominate Deputy Dyke.

1135 **The Bailiff:** Is Deputy Dyke's nomination seconded? Deputy Le Tissier. I will pause again because if I wait long enough somebody else will be nominated.

The new Rule that we need to engage now is that where there are more candidates than there are vacancies then there will be speeches but no questions. Those speeches are by the proposer first, for up to three minutes in respect of each candidate, and then the candidate for similarly up

to three minutes. So I will invite Deputy Burford first to speak to the Assembly in respect of her two candidates for up to six minutes. Deputy Burford please.

1140 **Deputy Burford:** Thank you, sir.

On Monday, 24 Members voted me into this role and I thank each one for placing their trust in me. I would like to make one more request of those Members and indeed of all the other Members of this Assembly. I am asking for you to give me the team that I have nominated, which I have
1145 selected from the various expressions of interest that I received in response to my email and I thank all of those who showed an interest.

As Members will know, I only have two nominations within this Assembly. The other two seats go to non-States' Members. I am broadly aware of the skills and talents available in that particular pool, including legal minds, as applications are just closing. From the combined resource available
1150 from those in this Assembly and outside of it, I wish to draw the broadest range of skills and importantly diversity of thought to create the best possible committee.

Scrutiny, uniquely, also draws on Members from across the Assembly during the term for standing panels, such as the Legislation Review Panel and the Financial Scrutiny Panel. I hope those Members who I was not able to nominate but who expressed an interest in the work of the
1155 committee will wish to be part of those or other Scrutiny-related panels.

My first nomination then is Deputy Fairclough. Although a first-time independent candidate in the recent election, Deputy Fairclough is certainly no stranger to the States of Guernsey. After graduating, he returned to the Island and joined the States on the junior executive scheme before moving to the environment section of the then Board of Administration. Three years later he
1160 became a project manager overseeing the Island's first environmental impact assessment for the proposed energy from waste facility.

But he had long held a desire to be a journalist and, after six months working at Channel TV, he joined the BBC, the third time he had applied to do so. Strong, silent determination is one of Deputy Fairclough's many qualities and it was at the BBC that he quickly became established as the States
1165 reporter and eventually the station's first ever political reporter, listening in and reporting on the business of the States at nearly all of its Meetings for the last 18 years.

Ever modest and unassuming, Deputy Fairclough does not pretend for one minute that this experience will automatically make him a good politician. Personally, however, I think it will stand him in very good stead indeed. He has studied the processes, procedures and decisions of the States
1170 across three different systems of Government and at least as many types of election, for just about this entire century.

He likes asking questions but he loves getting answers. As a journalist he prided himself on professionalism and impartiality. He knows there is always more than one side to a story and, like any journalist worth his salt, he is a good listener. He believes passionately in openness,
1175 accountability and transparency. His inquisitive and analytical mind make him not just an obvious candidate for the Scrutiny Management Committee but an absolute must-have.

As I mentioned in my speech on Monday, I know there is a very strong desire for the SMC to up its game, particularly on financial scrutiny, and I have chosen my second nomination, Deputy St Pier, with this firmly in mind. Yes, Deputy St Pier is an accountant by trade and I have no doubt that that
1180 will prove to be a valuable skill, but that was not part of my reasoning, when offering him my nomination.

Deputy St Pier, uniquely in this Assembly, has spent the last two terms as Treasury & Resources Minister and as Chief Minister. His knowledge of the workings of the Treasury, States' Budget, tendering, capital portfolio processes and investment management, to name just a few things, is
1185 simply unparalleled.

In my research for this role, it became crystal clear to me that obtaining this kind of information can be extremely time-consuming, both for the committee itself and for other civil servants and it often creates frustrating delays. Having a member of the committee with Deputy St Pier's experience and knowledge is, frankly, gold dust.

1190 But Deputy St Pier's eminent suitability for this role does not end there. He has an enormous capacity for work, except it appears when it comes to loft clearances. He can process information rapidly and think on his feet, a skill not to be underestimated in the context of public hearings. He is approachable, open and engaging and I am delighted that he is up for this role.

1195 Members of the Assembly, you have entrusted this role to me and I do not intend to let you down. Please extend that trust to supporting my nominations and give me the team that I need and that I have carefully balanced in order to do this job to the highest standard possible.

Thank you.

1200 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much. I now invite the first of the candidates proposed by Deputy Burford to speak to the Assembly, so Deputy Fairclough please.

Deputy Fairclough: Thank you, sir.

1205 I would firstly like to thank my proposer, Deputy Burford, and also Deputy Aldwell for seconding me for membership of the Scrutiny Management Committee. Scrutiny is an issue which is close to my heart. As some of you will know a large part of my job over the last two decades has been asking questions and trying to get to the heart of issues. As the political reporter at BBC Guernsey, as well as trying to make sense for the public of what goes on in the Governments of Guernsey, Alderney and Sark, I have tried to play my part in holding them to account by pursuing issues and matters, which are clearly in the public interest.

1210 This has not always been easy, particularly when committees and departments have wanted to hide behind statements rather than fronting up issues, when reports have been held back or when reviews have had sections redacted. When I stood in this election I said that a lot of lip service is paid to greater accountability, openness and transparency. The community hears it every four years. I want to translate that into action.

1215 With greater engagement from the public at an election than possibly ever before, I believe that now is an opportune time for strong scrutiny and, as we have already heard from others this week, it is an ongoing job for us all this term to scrutinise and challenge decisions, processes and spending. Do not ever be afraid to ask why something is done the way it is.

1220 I have sat through countless public Scrutiny hearings over the last two political terms and I welcome the more recent approach of focusing on issues rather than simply committees. If elected to the Scrutiny Management Committee, I will use my analytical and investigative skills to hold to account the Committees of the States and those organisations which are in receipt of public funds or resources in a fair and balanced way.

1225 I have made no secret of the fact that I would like to see a freedom of information law. While the Committee did some excellent work last term, I would like to see some more real-time scrutiny, rather than simply continuing the lessons learned mentality. And I relish the opportunity to discuss how that might be done so that the Committee can act swiftly where necessary.

1230 We have to ensure that, more than ever, we are reviewing what we do to ensure our resources, both financial and human, are used more efficiently than ever. Please allow me the opportunity to play my part in this process by voting for me as a Member of the Scrutiny Management Committee. Thank you.

The Bailiff: I now invite Deputy Burford's second candidate, Deputy St Pier, to have up to three minutes. Deputy St Pier.

1235 **Deputy St Pier:** Sir, my nomination is gamekeeper turned poacher. I have been a frequent critic of the Scrutiny Management Committee in our system of Government. I have struggled to understand how, with this Assembly being the beating heart of our executive system, the font from which committees flow, albeit fused with the legislative function, there is a role for a separate Scrutiny Management Committee.

1240

It was of course created in 2004, replacing the Audit Commission, emerging from the Harwood Panel reforms, it survived those recommendations, whilst the main recommendations for executive government it was supposed to be scrutinising did not, which made no sense to me.

1245 But with the adherence to a committee system of Government, I did try to argue the Scrutiny Management Committee out of existence within the States' Review Committee of 2012 but I did not have the heart to push it for debate in the Assembly. It could have been another piece of needless red tape for Deputy Ferbrache to throw on his bonfire of red tape, which I know he is ready to light in his garden in time for Budloe.

1250 I am with Deputy Queripel, when he spoke on Monday, in his pitch to this Committee. We are of course all scrutineers. He is absolutely right and I, for one, for the last eight years, have had less time and focus than I would have liked to play my full part in that important role that we all have. But now, having listened to Deputy Queripel and having a bit more time on my hands, I am determined to ensure that I do play my full part in this Assembly, in ensure the effective scrutiny of others. That is of course the role of the Rule 11 and 14 written and oral questions and committee
1255 presidents' regular statements to the Assembly for subsequent cross-examination and, of course, ultimately, for amendments to policy letters.

That is why I am very happy and delighted to have been nominated by Deputy Burford to play an active role and to provide more effective scrutiny, through the Scrutiny Management Committee process. Quite simply, there is no one in this Assembly today with more experience than me at being
1260 on the other side of the Scrutiny Management Committee's work.

I have politically headed the Treasury, capital process and investment management processes for eight years, I have headed the policy planning and transformation processes for four years and I have been cross-examined in more public hearings than anyone else today. So I am very much up for going from one side to the other, crossing the aisle as it were, and I am up for this, to be all
1265 ready to be on the other side.

Thank you very much.

The Bailiff: I turn to Deputy Meerveld to propose Deputy Dyke. Deputy Meerveld, please.

1270 **Deputy Meerveld:** Thank you, sir.

Transparency and accountability are two words I think you have all heard from me repeatedly during the election campaign and have been close to my heart throughout my term in the States, two things that I desperately want to see increased in this new Assembly.

1275 I originally, Members who were here before will ratify this, I had originally wanted to stand for Scrutiny myself and I was going to put myself forward for that. But the problem we have with politicians is reality and perception are two different things. From the public perspective perception is everything.

So, whilst I would have put myself forward for Scrutiny and I would have promised to be completely even-handed and not partisan in the way I would perform that role, the perception would have been from the public, because of the political campaign I ran, I would have been biased. So I did not want to put either this Assembly in that position to have put somebody forward like myself and that brings me to why I am proposing Deputy Dyke, as Deputy Trott is pointing.

1280 There is an issue here with perception. I think we do need a lawyer on this team. I think we need a highly qualified lawyer. Deputy Dyke has a double first in law, has set up an international law firm, has achieved many things in life. The problem is, I see it, and going back to my issue with perception, yesterday we had Deputy Burford stand and successfully obtain the position of President of Scrutiny and at that time declare she was resigning from the Partnership of Independents. The issue we have here today is we are now potentially electing the president of the Partnership of Independents to a Scrutiny role as well.

1290 So I would ask this Assembly, I think we have two very able candidates. I am not denigrating Deputy Gavin St Pier's abilities whatsoever and his experience but I think this Assembly has to be aware about perception, and I would like to see a president who was formerly of the Partnership of

Independents, an independent in Deputy Fairclough, and a member of the Guernsey Party, the other party that is active in this Assembly as the third person I think that would give the balance and the perception to the public that we are approaching this in a non-partisan way.

Thank you, Members.

The Bailiff: I invite Deputy Dyke to speak for up to three minutes on his candidature. Deputy Dyke please.

Deputy Dyke: First, through you, sir, I must thank my proposer Deputy Meerveld for his introduction and Deputy Le Tissier for seconding me. I will try not to compete with John Gollop and be quite brief, as a new Deputy I should perhaps introduce myself. Although I have had a reasonably successful career in law, I come from humble beginnings. My father was in the fire brigade in Poole, my uncles were all plumbers and carpenters; white van men.

Life when I was young was pretty tough financially and I am very aware of the stresses imposed on families by struggling to save for a mortgage, paying the bills and always turning down the lights to save on the electricity. The sort of problems that many of our fellow citizens face right now. So why did I stand as a Deputy?

I did not pay too much attention to Guernsey politics until a couple of years ago, when it began to occur to me that things were not going quite so well. Enormous price tags for contracts, one Deputy even announcing, 'I do not care what it costs,' as I recall. An ever-growing Civil Service, more and more regulation, the education issue and the problems around that. There were the terrible losses and disarray at Aurigny, even before Covid and I think even now we do not really know its true state, except that it is insolvent.

I have talked to some local Guernsey-born businessmen, one of whom took me through the difficulties of doing business in Guernsey, to the point that he was undertaking his new business development, guess where, in Jersey. He is not the only one making that decision, I fear. I found myself writing increasingly irate letters to the *Press*. As I always sign my name, I started receiving feedback from friends and people I have never met before, in effect telling me not just to talk the talk but to walk the talk.

Having reached a point where I now had the time and still had the energy and enthusiasm, I thought I should now put something back to stop taking things for granted and pitch in and try and help our wonderful Island community. I want to use my business and legal skills for this new purpose.

I made a lot of proposals in my manifesto. I hope we can carry them out. One of the most important, with an eye to struggling families, was to get a grip on spending and avoid major tax rises, which would risk damaging the economy and taking us in a downward spiral of low growth, more taxes and so on *ad infinitum*.

No economy has ever grown as a result of raising taxes. We must treat the spending of every pound as if it were our own –

The Bailiff: Deputy Dyke, I am loath to interrupt you but your three minutes are up I am afraid.

So Members of the States, we now go to the vote for two Members of the Scrutiny Management Committee. I remind you that the three candidates for those two seats are Deputy Fairclough, proposed by Deputy Burford and seconded by Deputy Aldwell; Deputy St Pier, proposed by Deputy Burford and seconded by Deputy Brouard; and Deputy Dyke, proposed by Deputy Meerveld and seconded by Deputy Le Tissier. So I invite you to write up to two names on your voting slip from those three candidates.

A secret ballot took place.

1340 **The Bailiff:** Have all Members passed their voting slips to the Deputy Sheriffs? In that case, Members of the States, whilst the votes are being counted, we will adjourn the States briefly so you can stretch your legs. Five minutes or so.

*The Assembly adjourned at 11.26 a.m.
and resumed at 11.34 a.m.*

**Scrutiny Management Committee –
Deputy Fairclough and Deputy Dyke elected as members**

[Audio recording of result announcement failed.]

*Vote result: Deputy Fairclough 35 votes; Deputy St Pier 17 votes; Deputy Dyke 20 votes.
Deputy Fairclough and Deputy Dyke were declared.*

COMMITTEE FOR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

**II. Committee for Economic Development –
Election of four members commenced**

Article II.

The States are asked:

To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the Committee for Economic Development to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

[Audio recording of initial nominations failed.]

Candidates nominated by Deputy Inder and seconded by Deputy Mahoney: Deputy Kazantseva-Miller, Deputy Falla, Deputy Vermeulen, Deputy Moakes.

Candidate nominated by Deputy Meerveld, seconded by Deputy Murray: Deputy Blin.

The Bailiff: ... slightly quicker off the mark. Deputy Gollop.

1345 **Deputy Gollop:** Sir, I would like to nominate Deputy de Lisle.

The Bailiff: Is Deputy de Lisle's nomination seconded? (**Deputy Leadbeater:** Yes sir.) Deputy Leadbeater. Thank you.

1350 We are up to six, have we got a seventh? Okay, so we have got six candidates for four seats. I will therefore invite first Deputy Inder to speak for up to 12 minutes in respect of his four candidates and then each of the candidates in turn will have three minutes and then we will go through the other two candidates as well. So Deputy Inder first, please.

Just a minute, the clock has gone off. Hopefully, none of my words of wisdom have been lost, but Deputy Inder, you have up to 12 minutes now, starting now.

1355 **Deputy Inder:** Thank you, sir.

Members, the Committee *for* Economic Development's mandate states 'to secure prosperity through the generation of wealth, the creation of the greatest number and widest range of employment opportunities possible, by promoting and developing business, commerce and industry in all sectors of the economy'.

The Deputies I have identified to assist in that delivery are as follows, all of whom I have had detailed conversations with, regarding aspects of the Committee's mandate over the last week or so and I will start with Deputy Kazantseva-Miller. She introduces herself on her manifesto as in her words 'an experienced and community leader that gets thing done'. Well, I like her already. She has commercial acumen, passion for sustainability, international and local expertise, can help advise the economic, environmental and social changes we want to see in our Island.

Importantly, Deputy Kazantseva-Miller has worked in the local market and has been a non-executive advisor to Guernsey Ports since 2019; an active member of Guernsey business organisations, such as Chamber of Commerce and the IoD and I remind Members of the meeting we had with the IoD at the beginning of the week.

Having worked in Google, the Moscow base as I understand, she knows government and she knows business. It is going to take me a while, Deputy K-Miller is multi-lingual and having spoken with her for a couple of hours on a range of subjects, I will be considering her for the digital lead within the Committee.

I met her last week over a coffee, having identified her on the campaign trail as someone I could work with. There is little point going through her extensive CD and credentials. It is plainly clear she is a capable business woman and will be an easy fit into Committee. A great asset.

Turning to Deputy Vermeulen. For 40 years, he has built, developed and run one of Guernsey's largest hotels on the Island's west coast. He is an experienced businessman with a proven track record and developed the Grand Mare resort, including Guernsey's second 18-hole golf course, a significant challenge at the time.

He is an excellent negotiator, listener and team player. Tourism is one of Guernsey's greatest challenges and we will be travelling on matters such as harbours and runways and I will be asking him to be the lead in that. His lifetime of skills and experience in the sector, which also includes retail and construction will make him an excellent part of our Economic Development team. Importantly sir, Members, there are a number of areas of policies where we may not necessarily agree on and it is important for all Committees to have some internal challenge and I look forward to working with him on those specific areas.

My third recommendation is Deputy Falla. I have known Deputy Falla for several years and worked with him for two years on the previous incarnation of the Language Commission. I rate him. He is a team player, a challenger and a communicator. From Deputy Falla's manifesto, he makes specific references to Economic Development. It is a Committee he wanted to be on from day one. He says:

The Committee should be at the centre of business revival by listening to, supporting and partnering business through this next critical period.

His words. Slap bang in the middle of what we need to do over the next couple of years, if not months. I will remind Members that last week most of us attended the IoD briefing for candidates. The IoD were clamouring for input into policy development. My Committee will need a strong business-to-Government lead, someone who can bring business into the centre of the Committee. Deputy Falla has worked in a professional capacity for many of Guernsey's top brands. He is well-respected, keen and as he rightly says in one of his blogs, 'I know business and business knows me.'

Now my fourth and final recommendation is Deputy Moakes. Before moving to Guernsey, he was based in London, where he spent more than 25 years working for some of the world's leading financial services companies. At Visa, he was responsible for managing the portfolio of banks and financial institutions during a period of great change and innovation. He helped clients develop several market-leading Propositions and oversaw a range of complex projects, including platform migrations and product launches.

At American Express, he managed teams responsible for key client relationships across a diverse range of business sectors, including travel, retail and restaurants, and as director of travel-related industries, he became an airline industry expert and regularly presented to business leaders at client and industry events across Europe.

He has extensive experience of working with boards and committees at companies across a wide range of different sectors and is used to working collaboratively. He is also used to challenging ideas and business practice where he thinks it is necessary to do so.

Sir, Members of the Assembly, what I have put together is a team that has obvious communication and business skills, a broad range of interests and background that touch on every part of Guernsey's industry, from construction, travel, transport, retail, digital, travel and education. This is not just about interest, this is expertise in these areas. This is where these people, these nominations are from. It is what they do, it is what they have done. It is a new team, it is a strong team that will assist the Island moving forward in what is an aggressive delivery plan and I ask the Assembly to keep the team together in its entirety.

Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: I now invite Deputy Inder's first nomination, Deputy Kazantseva-Miller, to address the Assembly for up to three minutes. Deputy Kazantseva-Miller.

Deputy Kazantseva-Miller: Thank you, sir, and thank you, Deputy Inder, for your nomination and Deputy Mahoney for seconding me.

Economic Development is the one Committee where I believe I can add the most value to the Assembly in our community in my first term as Deputy. I have an all-round business background as an entrepreneur, investor, non-executive director and business executive. I hold an MBA from INSEAD and a Bachelor's degree from the London School of Economics. I worked in Google, leading global campaigns that own multiple marketing awards and at Agoda.com, a leading hotel booking site where I managed the \$100 million sales channel in Asia.

I have been very active in the start-up and business sector system in Guernsey, very much from day one of moving to Guernsey. I helped launch Start Up Guernsey and the Digital Greenhouse and set up a networking community for coders and was involved in with Creative Industries Guernsey. I also had an opportunity to buy a local digital business, Island Mums, from no one less than Deputy Andrea Dudley-Owen. Through Island Mums I helped serve over 1,000 local households and provided marketing services to hundreds of local businesses.

I have been able to deeply connect with the challenges, issues and opportunities of local businesses, especially the small enterprises, that comprise the vast majority of our economy. I sold the business earlier in July this year, which opened the opportunity for me to stand in the election. Since 2019, I have sat on the board of Guernsey Ports with Deputy Ferbrache, learning the ropes about the States' processes and tearing my hair out about our capital expenditure system.

Most recently I have taken a keen interest in sustainability and the opportunity of marrying transition to a clean and green economy with sustainable economic prosperity. I co-founded the Chamber of Commerce Sustainable Business Initiative and set up Transition Islands, which helped provide feedback on the Revive and Thrive Strategy to the Committee for Economic Development earlier this year.

I see real opportunities for us to move the needle on diversification, business incentive schemes, relegation programmes, horticulture, green and blue economy, digital connectivity, innovation in partnership with Agilisys and Blenheim Chalcot. In nature, interesting things happen on the edges and it is at the edges of the Economic Development Committee mandate where there may be spill over into other committees such as STSB, DPA, E&I and even Education, where I see some of the exciting opportunities for cross-community collaboration, together with tapping into the expertise and resources of the wider business community.

I am a natural team player, an out-of-the-box thinker and most importantly a do-er. My campaign slogan was 'action not words' and it is this spirit that I would like to bring to the Committee. I would be honoured to have your vote.

1460 Thank you.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much. I turn next to Deputy Falla.

1465 **Deputy Falla:** Sir, I am extremely enthusiastic about the prospect of being a member of the Economic Development Committee. As Deputy Inder has said, throughout my election campaign, I stated that my number one priority was championing the measures that would fast-track the revival of the Island's economy. It needs to be buoyant to help fund an inclusive community that provides everyone living in Guernsey with what we need.

1470 Guernsey will benefit from a strong, dynamic and diverse economy and from staying competitive and high profile in the international business arena. My credentials for this role are I have founded my own small, award-winning business in communications and public relations and led it for 21 years before a management buyout. Having run one, I get promotional agencies and Economic Development is responsible for several.

1475 As Deputy Inder has said, I know business and business knows me. I have been a committee member on business groups for more than 30 years and in more than three decades as a communications professional, I have advised and supported businesses across all sectors of Guernsey's economy.

1480 I am a networker, mediator and facilitator and I am evangelical about two-way communication and engagement, with an emphasis on listening and listening to understand, not listening to reply. This Assembly will need to listen to the business sector and provide the support and infrastructure it needs to truly fly. In the proposed role of Government-to-business lead, I should like to be the bridge between the Economic Development Committee and the business community.

Thank you, sir.

1485 **The Bailiff:** I turn next to Deputy Vermeulen.

Deputy Vermeulen: Thank you, sir.

1490 I stand before you this morning not as an economist or as a financier but as someone of sound judgement, courage and ambition. Guernsey has unprecedented challenges ahead and our economy needs to be built back even better, post Covid-19. We need unity and teamwork has to be at the heart of this.

1495 I believe my skills and experience lend themselves well to a place on the Committee for Economic Development and as a representative of all sectors of our economy. I would like to fulfil this position to provide the skills and experience of tourism, construction, retail and those who are just about managing.

1500 In business, I spent the majority of my career in a board position with significant personal liabilities. During that time, I was a successful negotiator and leading having had to manage a number of stakeholders, sometimes with conflicting views, but bringing everyone together, working together for a common purpose, whilst developing and nurturing those individuals to fulfil their potential.

I stood for election on the promise of getting Guernsey going and that is exactly what I intend to do. Real investment in our Island needs to happen and economic enablers given the support and encouragement they need to help boost our GDP.

1505 The finance sector is the engine room of our economy. We need it to be open for business and create policies and products that make us a competitive jurisdiction. I fully support the Revive and Thrive Strategy but believe we need to make sure that we develop and fulfil the action plans swiftly, to enable economic growth to happen. Should I be successful, I look forward to playing a key role in this.

1510 Individuals in all parts of Island life in Guernsey gave me their support during my campaign. I believe, with real experience, real action can happen. I believe I can offer to do a collaborative approach. The people of Guernsey put their trust in me and I would ask this Assembly to put their trust in me as a member of the Committee *for* Economic Development.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much and I next turn to Deputy Moakes. Deputy Moakes, please.

1515 **Deputy Moakes:** Thank you, sir.

First of all I would like to thank Deputy Inder for proposing me. Deputy Inder also did a terrific job of explaining what my career background is, so perhaps I will skip over that a little bit and give you some more information. So, before moving to Guernsey, I was based in London, where I spent more than 25 years working for some of the world's leading financial services companies.

I started out in sales and marketing, before moving into relationship management, where I spent most of my career in senior management positions, covering the UK and beyond. Of course, these roles were not just about building relationships and doing deals, they were also about improving processes and measuring profitability and risk and using facts and figures.

1525 I have worked in a number of senior leadership teams and have extensive experience of engaging with external boards and committees and companies across a wide range of different sectors. I am also used to working collaboratively with senior decision-makers but I am not afraid to challenge where I think it necessary to do so.

1530 What my 25 years in financial services taught me was that you absolutely must be a team player. You need to lead from the front and be able to work effectively, across highly matrixed organisations. In addition, you need to be able to absorb information, agree upon priorities and then deliver them. This means that you need to listen to all of your stakeholders and build a consensus. Working with a silo mentality will result in failure and Guernsey cannot afford anything less than 100% commitment from its Deputies and 100% co-operation across committees and boards.

1535 I am standing to be a member of the Committee *for* Economic Development because it is a Committee that I believe I have an awful lot to offer. Economic Development is part of growth initiatives in four key areas. Maintain and develop – I have spent most of my working life in roles focused on retaining existing business and winning incremental business. I have worked at board level with many companies across almost every business sector, not just finance, so I believe that tick that box.

1545 Diversify and grow – I have led teams tasked with expanding business into new business sectors and sub-sectors of existing sectors. Examples include digital, utilities and new or emerging sectors. So, again, I believe I have the experience to help the team identify target sectors and then go after them.

Open for business – you have probably read some of my articles on Guernsey. Most of them promote Guernsey as a great place to live and work, working in Economic Development will give me the opportunity to do this within a far more structured environment.

1550 Monitoring and reporting – again, having worked in financial services for over 25 years, I am used to monitoring and reporting on business, economic activity and demographic trends. Once again I have written a number of articles looking at Guernsey's economy and demographics, so I believe that I can bring a great deal of commercial and analytical experience to the team.

Having lived in London for 20 years I have a fairly unique view –

1555 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Moakes, I am afraid that is your three minutes, to which you are entitled, so I am now going to turn to Deputy Meerveld to speak to the Assembly about the candidate that he has proposed, Deputy Blin. Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: Thank you, sir.

1560 I have only recently met Deputy Blin, but my first conversation with him was incredibly insightful. We discussed his desire to be on the Committee *for* Economic Development, but from the unique perspective of how he sees himself co-operating with other committees.

He owns a recruitment business, which works with Employment & Social Security, through the Job Centre, providing training and coaching to assist the unemployed back into employment. He
1565 also has worked with large businesses to find local staff and apply for work permits under the remit of Home Affairs.

Having worked supporting people to gain employment, he saw how he could, through the Committee *for* Economic Development, work with the employers to generate more opportunities for those same individuals from the other side of the equation. This reminds me of another new
1570 Deputy at the beginning of the last term, who took a very similar approach, Deputy Dudley-Owen. She used her positions on Economic Development and Education to bridge the gaps, to create greater co-operation between the Committees and to basically facilitate breaking down the silos that definitely existed in the last term.

On one side she was talking to employers, finding out the skills that they wanted, and then
1575 through education promoting the development of Skills Guernsey, the delivery of apprenticeship schemes, to try and match that supply and demand on both sides of the equation. Things that tend to get lost sometimes in this Assembly. If the committees develop the silo mentality. You can end up going off in different directions and not making those connections.

Besides his admirable work with the unemployed, he is also a successful businessman who has
1580 worked across many business sectors, including hospitality, tourism, training, language services and, last but not least, finance. A unique range of business experience he will bring to the Committee *for* Economic Development.

If Deputy Blin is elected on to the Committee *for* Economic Development, he intends to work closely with the Committees for Education, Employment & Social Security and Home Affairs, to
1585 break down the silos and promote greater cross-committee co-operation. I sincerely hope that this Assembly will elect him to the Committee *for* Economic Development so that he can deliver against this promise.

Thank you, sir.

1590 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much and I now turn to Deputy Blin to speak for up to three minutes on his candidature. Deputy Blin.

Deputy Blin: Thank you, sir.

I would like to start that by saying that on Monday I was extremely pleased that Deputy Inder
1595 named me as one of his team of four during his election speech for the Presidency of Economic Development, so you can imagine to an extent my disappointment today, as he has actually not nominated me for this Committee.

Therefore, I would like to thank Deputy Meerveld for proposing me and for his kind introduction, as well as Deputy Fairclough for actually seconding me. So, why me for this Committee? I am very
1600 keen. I have a diverse business background that has given me a well-rounded skill set. I grew up here before spending several years slipping abroad and graduating in the UK with my degree in languages and economics.

But since then I have come back to the Island and I have amassed more than 35 years' experience across various sectors on the Island and including my membership for the Chamber of Commerce, the IoD, etc. I have run a language school specialising in bringing hundreds of European students
1605 to Guernsey and I class that as tourism.

I have done lots of specialist work for my consultancy and recruitment agencies in both finance and hospitality. I have helped companies with specialist work to sort out work permit issues to recruit key personnel and to find staff locally wherever possible. I have found and invested in
1610 numerous businesses, from hospitality and retail but also co-founded a fiduciary business. I spent

five years contracted by the Job Centre, through a States' initiative, helping jobseekers find work, organising workshops, job fairs and developing joint initiatives to find them these things.

1615 But it is with this diverse background in mind, I want to apply my skills across the various committees, to break down this mentality, Deputy Meerveld referred to the silo mentality, and assist in building a more cohesive and co-operative States. I believe this is where I can truly add value, working across committees, creating bridges between them and Economic Development.

I have already initiated this. I have spoken to Deputy Roffey to see how we could work together. Also I would like to identify ways to help jobseekers with transferable skills to train them where necessary and help as our economy diversifies. I also want to work with the Education Committee
1620 and continue the work that Deputy Dudley-Owen started before, to establish links with Skills Guernsey, apprenticeship schemes and truly match skills with current industry and also new ones as they develop.

I have spoken to Deputy Prow at Home Affairs about working on the implementation of the Population Management Regime, to address the requirements of hospitality, for example, to help
1625 business to get through staff shortfalls. I cannot add much more in this limited time but, sir, through you, I would really ask the Assembly to endorse me as a Member of the Economic Development Committee so that I can use these skills to take forward these initiatives I have described for the benefit of all.

Thank you, sir.

1630

The Bailiff: I turn next to Deputy Gollop, to speak to the Assembly on behalf of his nomination, Deputy de Lisle. Deputy Gollop, please.

Deputy Gollop: Thank you very much, sir.

1635 We have heard great nominations of great people but they are all new to this Chamber and I think at times we do need to have the strength of continuity and collective memory from a previous Assembly, both perhaps the good things they did and the less good things. My candidate is Deputy David de Lisle, who would bring continuity to the role.

Continuity not only because he has been a Member for 16 and a half years, but significantly has
1640 served under two very different Presidents, Deputy Parkinson and Mr Kevin Stewart when the role of this Committee was Commerce & Employment. Therefore he has a broad knowledge of not just the business functions but also perhaps other elements ranging from Island agriculture to the employment field.

We have heard a lot about his career in Canada but I think his ideas implemented in Ottawa, of
1645 an arts and leisure gallery, can certainly work here and we need to move beyond the Carnival. His university career needs to be usefully utilised in terms of knowing where we are going with the university idea and with lifelong skills.

His other career is in retail and we definitely need to kickstart retail in St Peter Port. He has a
1650 great knowledge of property as well and of course his retail has brought lots of contact with tourists and the cruise liner economy and he is interested in the blue economy. I consider that he has a very wide range of skills and his previous memberships of the Education Department also brings on board that knowledge so we can synergise education and commerce and employment and maybe work to build a stronger bond between Economic Development and Education in terms of the culture, leisure and tourism sector. So I commend his candidature for the role.

1655

The Bailiff: I now turn to Deputy de Lisle to speak for up to three minutes. Deputy de Lisle, please.

1660 **Deputy de Lisle:** Yes sir. I would like to speak in terms of continuity on the Committee. A lot of very good work has been carried out in the past two terms and I think it is a matter of building on much of that, particularly as we go out of the Covid situation. What I would like to see, of course, is economic diversification and we need to promote that particular area, together with promotion of

the finance sector and new, innovative products and services in that sector, together with creating new jobs as we go forward out of Covid.

1665 Now, I have served on Commerce & Employment a term back and, of course, assisted a number of sub-groups in terms of construction, air traffic licensing, renewable energy and supported, also, the University College for the Channel Islands in the past and renewable resource development, with particular emphasis on the commercial solar renewable area.

1670 I have been a firm advocate of an inter-Island ferry link, cheaper fares to London and improve the connectivity into Alderney. I see the provision of reliable, sustainable and affordable air and sea links as a priority and central to us moving forward currently. I also support the urgent need for delivery of ultra-fast broadband to businesses, which I think has been lacking up to this time, despite our efforts.

1675 I have commercial experience in office accommodation and retail in Town and interests, of course, in farming in the western parishes. I have a successful record in economic development in public service, with in the region of 20 to 30 years of work in economic diversification, specifically, first in western Canada in Manitoba, where my services were drawn into diversifying the grain economy in that province.

1680 Later, in Sudbury, in the metal mining community, a city facing severe problems following the virtual collapse of the base metal industry, I worked on import substitution –

The Bailiff: Deputy de Lisle, I am afraid your three minutes have now expired. (**Deputy de Lisle:** Thank you, sir.) Thank you very much.

1685 Members of the States, we now go to the vote for four Members of the Committee *for* Economic Development. Let me remind you of the six candidates and their proposers and seconders first.

1690 The four candidates proposed by Deputy Inder and seconded by Deputy Mahoney are Deputy Kazantseva-Miller, Deputy Falla, Deputy Vermeulen and Deputy Moakes. The next candidate is Deputy Blin, who is proposed by Deputy Meerveld and seconded by Deputy Murray, and the sixth candidate is Deputy de Lisle, proposed by Deputy Gollop and seconded by Deputy Leadbeater. In this election you can vote for up to four of the six candidates and therefore you can include zero, one, two, three or four names on your ballot paper and I simply ask you to write up to four names out of those six on the ballot paper.

A secret ballot took place.

1695 **The Bailiff:** Are there any more voting slips, or have they gone? They have gone already, I do apologise! One of these days I will keep an eye on what is going on! We will just adjourn the States briefly so that you can continue your discussions if you needed to until the voting is completed.

*The Assembly adjourned at 12.08 p.m.
and resumed at 12.18 p.m.*

**Committee *for* Economic Development –
Deputy Kazantseva-Miller, Deputy Falla,
Deputy Vermeulen and Deputy Moakes elected as members**

1700 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the voting for the four Members of the Committee *for* Economic Development is as follows: Deputy Kazantseva-Miller secured 24 votes, Deputy Falla secured 27 votes, Deputy Vermeulen secured 25 votes, Deputy Moakes secured 25 votes, Deputy Blin secured 23 votes and Deputy de Lisle secured six votes. Accordingly, I declare that Deputy Kazantseva-Miller, Deputy Falla, Deputy Vermeulen and Deputy Moakes are all duly elected. (*Applause*)

COMMITTEE FOR EDUCATION, SPORT & CULTURE

**III. Committee for Education, Sport & Culture –
Election of four members commenced**

Article III.

The States are asked:

To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The Deputy Greffier: Article III. Election of Members of the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture.

1705 **The Bailiff:** I invite the President of the Committee, Deputy Dudley-Owen, to move her nominations. Deputy Dudley-Owen.

Deputy Dudley-Owen: Yes sir, thank you. I would like to nominate Deputy Sue Aldwell, Deputy Bob Murray, Deputy Sam Haskins and Deputy Andy Cameron.

1710 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: I, sir, second all four of those nominations.

1715 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much. Are there any other nominations, Members of the States? Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: I would like to propose Deputy Aidan Matthews.

1720 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much and is Deputy Matthews' nomination seconded? Deputy Parkinson, thank you very much.

I will pause briefly to see if there is a sixth nomination. Members of the States, is it your wish that we continue to sit to hear the speeches for the five nominations that we have received? The alternative would be to adjourn now and come back after lunch. Deputy Dudley-Owen is it your wish that the election take place straight away?

1725

Deputy Dudley-Owen: Yes please, sir.

1730 **The Bailiff:** Alright. I am going to put to you, Members of the States, that we sit to complete this election. Those in favour of doing so; those against?

Members voted Pour.

The Bailiff: I will declare that carried and therefore I will invite Deputy Dudley-Owen to speak for up to 12 minutes on her four candidates. Deputy Dudley-Owen.

1735 **Deputy Dudley-Owen:** Thank you, sir and Members will be relieved, as will, I am sure, you, that I will be speaking for less time than that. One of the responsibilities of leading a Committee is to form the team that will comprise that Committee. It is a very difficult task and I have been very pleased to have had colleagues in this Chamber who have a variety of skills, experience and relevant connections, which I believe are all valuable.

1740 It is a regret that I have had to make a choice from amongst them, but with insufficient seats to
meet the interest shown, that is what I have had to do. The strategic direction that I want to lead
the Committee in requires a team to look beyond the mountains and towards the horizon. It is high
time that we prioritised on this Committee the purpose for which we are educating our children
and realised the synergies between sporting and creative endeavour, the heritage assets that we
administer on behalf of the people of Guernsey and their community wellbeing and enrichment, as
1745 well as the economic opportunities that we can derive from them.

The Committee is building a strong base of support from officers, which will enable the political
Members to reach beyond operational matters and service delivery, which are so ably carried out
by expert staff in all areas. As elected Members of this Assembly, I am confident that I and the
colleagues that I nominate today can build the body politic, which will work to set the strategic
1750 direction and overall goals of the Committee and to lead it into the future-facing, sustainable and
adaptive body of the States that it needs to be.

I will be proposing to my Committee that, in order to ensure the best use of the knowledge base
and skills in this Chamber, brought by various Deputies and also to create a collaborative and
collegiate approach to some of the workstreams, which will be brought back to the Assembly for
1755 approval, that working groups are set up to assist with priority areas, such as the future model of
education and Education Law.

So, in turn, I nominate the following. Deputy Susan Aldwell. I have known Deputy Aldwell for a
number of years. Her working life has been mostly involved in accounts or banking and always
heavily involved in the community. She has experience on a local school's committee, a deep
1760 understanding of special educational needs provision locally and has been heavily involved in parish
work, more recently on the Torteval douzaine, where she served as a Constable for some five years.

The job of the Parish Constable is very involved. They are often under-valued but invaluable
members of the community who carry out all sorts of executive and administrative functions on
behalf of the douzaine, from creating a budget, issuing rates, dealing with day-to-day parish affairs,
1765 which are surprisingly numerous.

Deputy Aldwell was appointed by the douzaine to a seat on the La Mare de Carteret School
committee, where she was fully involved and committed. Deputy Aldwell is extremely well-
respected and has a very good reputation for being a thorough, inquisitive and conscientious
individual. Whatever she is tasked to do, she will do to the best of her ability.

1770 Deputy Bob Murray. In the time that I have known Deputy Murray, I have been impressed with
his ability to communicate. He has a knack of making people feel at ease in his company and he is
very articulate, as well as having an ability to listen effectively. He asks searching questions and is
able to process complex issues and create pragmatic solutions. He has a proven track record in
commerce and holds a Master's degree in multimedia computing. He is passionate about the arts
1775 and heritage and sees the importance of a focus on skills and apprenticeships and lifelong learning.
He is an assiduous individual who can get to the heart of the issue quickly and explore solutions by
listening and engaging well with others.

Deputy Sam Haskins. I met Deputy Haskins six years ago and I know that because it was my 40th
birthday party and he came along as a guest. He struck me then as someone who has a fresh and
1780 energetic outlook. So energetic that he left Guernsey later that year for travels and adventures
around the world on high seas as a ship's engineer and has now returned with that same energy
and fresh outlook but now a more sage and worldly view.

He is very much a team player and able to work together with anyone. He understands and
accepts and encourages different points of view. As well as being innovative he has an analytical
1785 and pragmatic style. Like Deputy Aldwell, Deputy Haskins has a personal interest and experience in
our special educational needs provision. He also has a passion for sport and arts, particularly how
this area can be of benefit to those who are more vulnerable in our community.

He has commented to me that Guernsey needs to move to a new era of green, self-sustainability
and global competitiveness and for this we need to be enabling students to achieve their best and
1790 to have a desire to continually learn.

Deputy Andy Cameron. As is the Guernsey way, I have known of Deputy Cameron since we were teenagers, although I am slightly younger and I cannot be sure that he can quite remember me. I recall him then, as he is now, a strapping chap, well-liked and sporty. Deputy Cameron has had a career in IT and finance and more recently has set up his own small business, reflecting of the careers and entrepreneurialism that we want to see more of in future, especially from our young people.

His sporting achievements are impressive, as a regular open water swimmer, cyclist, cliff runner and walker and triple iron man. He has commented to me that it would be easy to think that ESC just stood for education for the amount of attention it received last term and he believes that we need the best schools. But he also wants to make sure that we do not forget sport and culture.

He wants to create an isle of opportunities and encourage post-16 apprenticeships or vocational qualifications for the younger generation, our future Island leaders, to invest in them and provide and support in our teachers. He is also keen to encourage active travel to and from schools and participation in all sports education.

In my capacity as President, I commend these candidates to this Assembly as Members of the Committee for Education, Sport and Culture, and seek the support of colleagues today for their appointment. Thank you.

The Bailiff: I turn next to Deputy Aldwell, to speak for up to three minutes on her candidature. Deputy Aldwell.

Deputy Aldwell: Sir, the Committee has a wide remit and each Member will need to bring something to the table. Part of the remit is to promote the highest possible standards and outcomes with the highest standards of pastoral support for student staff across all schools. This includes support for students with special educational needs or disabilities. This is where I do have some personal experience.

Having a son of 21, with severe autism, has not been without its challenges. Understanding that early interventions and being trained in tools such as PECS, picture exchange communication systems, can alleviate the frustrations of being non-verbal. These tools are invaluable. Studying at Birmingham University autism and associated disorders has given me a great understanding. I hope to be able to bring some of my first-hand knowledge to the table, my son attending Le Rondin and Le Murier special needs schools. Both have outstanding head teachers, which feed down to the inspirational teaching staff, designing an educational package to meet every individual student's needs. I only have praise for both of those schools.

Moving into secondary education, I took my seat as Constable on Torteval douzaine on 1st January 2016. Owners' rates contribute towards the school libraries where the children from our parishes attend. Both junior and senior schools have representation from each parish and they attend by law. I applied for a seat representing Torteval for La Mare de Carteret High School and over the next three years attended every prize-giving, play and invitation which I was sent. The annual school building inspection, along with attending, each term, a meeting and presentations by the management team, which were truly inspiration. The whole team was 100% dedicated and turned the school around.

The school at La Mare de Carteret High is indeed the very heart of the community, bringing together their sporting achievement, competing across the Island and, on many occasions, bringing home the silverware. With huge pride, many of the students are members of many sporting associations, being competent musicians and taking part in musical theatre and drama.

My time spent on La Mare de Carteret committee gave me a real insight into the workings of a school and the challenges they face on a day-to-day basis, how the teaching staff worked from the school across to the home to achieve the best outcomes. This is why we need to take the stakeholders with us. Everyone is part of the jigsaw, with the same goals of a world class education system.

I am passionate about our children's future and unwavering about a system which encompasses every student. I have a great deal to learn and would very much like to be a team –

The Bailiff: Deputy Aldwell, I am afraid that is your three minutes. (**Deputy Aldwell:** Thank you.) I turn next to Deputy Murray to speak to his candidature. Deputy Murray please.

1845 **Deputy Murray:** Thank you, sir.

More than anything else, the debate characterised the previous Assembly. It proved too controversial and divisive. It likely cost the careers of a number of previous Deputies. But that was then and this is now. We now have the prospect of moving the provision of education forward for the benefit of not just our children but for all of us, since education touches everyone's life and at all stages.

I cannot profess to be an educationalist. I come from a communications and a technology background. I recognise the role that the combination of this experience can play in the delivery and provision of a portfolio of services that Education, Sport & Culture have responsibility for.

1855 What is often overlooked is the interaction across a number of committees that ESC, of necessity has to have – let alone industry, the third sector and of course business at large, finance, tourism and everything in between. This is by its very nature two-way and there is therefore an intrinsic independence and communication required at many levels and with many different audiences.

If I had one criticism of the unfortunate experience the entire topic of education was characterised in the last Assembly it would be poor communication. I believe I have the skills to ensure that this mistake is not repeated.

1860 Some 20 years, while undertaking for the first and the only time a dual role in the public sector of e-commerce director for our much-lamented Guernsey Telecoms and as the Island's first e-envoy, I decided I needed a more in-depth understanding of the underlying technology. I therefore resigned from these roles and embarked on a Master's degree in multimedia computing for e-commerce.

Now during the subsequent two years of that particular degree, one of the concepts I was introduced to was that of distance learning. Even then I became extremely excited by the potential of what was already becoming a major component of learning. Imagine my surprise then when what goes on under the hood of local education began to be examined in some detail in the public arena in the last term, since distance learning was largely nowhere in sight.

1870 It seemed to me that given I had quite a hand in providing what used to be known as the Guernsey Group for Learning, the scope of additional educational needs that our small size cannot ordinarily sustain, should be readily addressed with access to off-Island providers using this sort of technology. That technology has moved on massively since my early introduction to it and the scope that the myriad activities at Digital Services now plays in every aspect of our lives is huge.

It is, then, this particular consideration that further drives my wish to participate in ESC. Our economy is, to a very large extent, about data management already. Simply put, we move bits of data all over the world and in an advantageous way, both financially and in terms of its footprint –

1880 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Murray, I am afraid your three minutes are also up, so I will turn next to Deputy Haskins.

1885 **Deputy Haskins:** Thank you, sir and thank you, Deputy Dudley-Owen and thank you, Deputy Ferbrache. The electorate voted for change. They voted for a good mix of old and new Deputies to steer the Assembly. The old Deputies, or incumbents, as I should say, almost teaching the new. The electorate voted for us to be the leaders in resolving the issues we are currently facing, along with those that we will face.

1890 We are aware that one of those issues is education and it needs to be resolved urgently. We cannot shy away from this. We need Members on the Education Committee who are up to the challenge and will not rest until we get it sorted. I think Deputy Dudley-Owen has proposed a superb, well-balanced team that will do exactly that.

The ESC mandate is not just our secondary schools, it is not just what buildings we build. It is far more than that and we all know that. We do not want to get lost in the swathes of detail, we need

1895 to focus on what the outcomes are. What is it that we want from Education, Sport & Culture Committee, because it does include sports and includes arts and it includes our heritage? All of these tie into our future, tie into our tourism and they tie into our economic empowerment.

I bring balance and think that I can see the bigger picture. As well as a marine engineer and a qualified sailing instructor, I understand that one size, or perhaps two, does not fit all and that the teaching approach needs to accommodate every type of learning. Let us not forget that our learners of today will be the doctors, the chief ministers, the athletes, educators, environmental caretakers of tomorrow and will fill the very seats that we are standing in – or sitting in – today.

Surely we want to be producing the best that we can for these roles and keep Guernsey punching above its weight internationally? My own personal opinion is that we want education to take a more holistic and agile approach to make sure that the needs of the Island are parried up with the long-term needs of the Islanders.

I am humbled by Deputy Dudley-Owen, who believes that I hold many qualities that she believes will help the community to achieve the success that I know the entire Assembly is avidly behind. I hope you will support both myself and Deputy Dudley-Owen by backing her proposed Committee Members, so ESC can swiftly solve the crisis in education we are currently facing.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: I turn next to Deputy Cameron, who has up to three minutes. Deputy Cameron please.

Deputy Cameron: Thank you, sir.

Thank you, Deputy Dudley-Owen and thank you, Deputy Ferbrache. I have two daughters, both of whom attend the Beaucamps School. They are at a crucial stage of their education, both making decisions about the future, so I am passionate about ensuring that we choose the correct school model for our future generation.

Every pupil must be supported and nurtured. They must be able to rely on the skill of their teachers and make informed decisions and they must have access to the best environment, training, equipment and opportunities. I have over 20 years of experience of working in IT, within the finance industry, the legal profession, many small businesses and many of the States of Guernsey schools.

Whilst working in our schools I noticed an inconsistency in the quality of buildings. We need to ensure that all children have equal access to excellent buildings and teaching staff. We need to encourage active travel to and from school. Our children need to feel safe enough to cycle or walk to school. I am a champion for active travel and physical activity. It is vital for our wellbeing, every individual in our Island.

In my spare time, I love open water swimming, cliff walking, kayaking and cycling. I have completed several Ironman distance triathlons, including Celtman of the Scottish Highlands, Swissman of the Swiss Alps. I am used to crossing the finish line, regardless of the size of the mountains in the way. Our children need to be encouraged to take part in all fields of sport and physical activity. We must take the time to listen and to consider the needs of our children, the teachers and the views of parents Island-wide, in creating a fully supported school model going forward. Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: I turn next to Deputy Gollop to speak to the Assembly for up to three minutes on his candidate Deputy Matthews. Deputy Gollop, please.

Deputy Gollop: Thank you, sir.

We have heard very much about reinvention of the new and the strengths of a team and I am putting forward Deputy Matthews and his slogan is 'for a brighter tomorrow'. He has lived in Guernsey most of his life, attended Elizabeth College and the Grammar School. He has a young son who seems about seven or eight, but actually he is only five, who attends St Martin's School, so I

think already you are getting a picture of somebody who has got experience and a commitment to schools across the agenda.

He very much focused on education and education is the one subject that he priorities to get involved with this term. He prefers a three-school model, but he is open-minded on the options. He is against overcrowded schools. He does not wish to abandon world-class school and sixth-form centres. He is yes to considering all the locations, including rebuilding La Mare de Carteret, and he is a strong support of special educational needs and disabilities.

He is interested in choice and competition as well as a more conventional approach to educational standards. Educational outcomes are important. His career as a software developer and information technologist means that he too has a strong science and skills background and he too is very interested in ensuring that we have active travel and young people have safe walkways and cycle paths and that we need to look again at the travel planning of schools.

He is also in favour of controlling spending carefully but ensuring we have repair and maintenance of States' properties, which is a particular issue in the past with schools, and I think he would bring oversight to that. He is also keen on all aspects of arts and heritage and comes from a family that is very interested in conservation and the Island's past. I commend his candidature.

The Bailiff: Now I turn to Deputy Matthews, to speak for up to three minutes on his candidature. Deputy Matthews please.

Deputy Matthews: Thank you, sir and thank you to Deputy Gollop and Deputy Parkinson for seconding me. I was prompted to enter the election this year and then subsequently into the States one Sunday afternoon in February, standing in the Market Square with about 2,500 other people who had come out to protest against the two-school model.

The thought occurred to me then that the people I was standing with were not just protesting against the model itself, which of course there was a great deal of anger and disillusionment with, but with the whole process by which it had been arrived at. Something had gone very wrong with the communication process between the States and the people. When I say people I mean all the stakeholders – teachers, students, parents, grandparents, would-be parents, taxpayers, commuters, in fact almost every member of our community. Because education affects everyone and forms such a close link between people and the Government.

When you think about it, it is the point of greatest contact between the Government and the people. Compare it to other services. Healthcare, we hope, is there for us when we need it, but we hope not very often. Social Security, we pay our stamp every week or every month and we hope we do not have to call on the services very often. Law and order, again, there for us when it is needed and we hope not very often. Vital services for the environment, infrastructure and economic development we may use every day and we expect to be there but we do not normally come into contact with the providers of the services.

But with education we do. Every day, Monday to Friday, parents wave goodbye to their children at the school gate or the bus stop and then see them again at the end of the day, but we have not forgotten about them during that time. For pupils, our children, are directly in contact with the providers of a Government service, for so many hours every day of the week.

The service provided shapes the rest of their lives. This is why people feel so strongly that we should have a say and a choice in the service that is offered. At the moment the only school choice parents can make is to accept a place offered in a state school or fund private education. Our independent schools are and must remain an essential part of the mix in Guernsey and there is much to learn from their ability to understand and meet a diverse range of needs.

I would like to help all of the services that are part of the Education, Sport & Culture mandate from pre-school, primary, secondary, continuing education to adulthood and of course the sports, arts and community services to work towards providing services that understand and meet people's expectations.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much.

2000 Well, Members of the States, we come to the election of four Members of the Committee for
Education, Sport & Culture, for which you have five candidates standing. Those candidates are, let
me remind you, Deputy Aldwell, Deputy Murray, Deputy Haskins and Deputy Cameron, all four of
whom are proposed by Deputy Dudley-Owen and seconded by Deputy Ferbrache. The fifth
candidate is Deputy Matthews, proposed by Deputy Gollop and seconded by Deputy Parkinson and
2005 I invite you to write up to four names from those five candidates on your voting slip and be prepared
to hand them in.

A secret ballot took place.

The Bailiff: Members are there any more voting slips to be handed in? Thank you all very much.
If you promise that at least 21 of you come back to hear the results so that we are quorate, we will
just adjourn for a few minutes while the votes are being counted!

*The Assembly adjourned at 12.45 p.m.
and resumed at 12.55 p.m.*

**Committee for Education, Sport & Culture –
Deputy Aldwell, Deputy Murray, Deputy Haskins and Deputy Cameron elected as members**

2010 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the election for four Members of the Committee for
Education, Sport & Culture has produced the following result. Deputy Aldwell polled 28 votes,
Deputy Murray polled 24 votes, Deputy Haskins polled 29 votes, Deputy Cameron polled 22 votes
and Deputy Matthews polled 18 votes.

Therefore I declare that Deputy Haskins, Deputy Aldwell, Deputy Murray and Deputy Cameron
have been duly elected. *(Applause)*

**Procedural –
Seating arrangements**

2015 **The Bailiff:** Now, Members of the States, I am going to invite you when you come back after
lunch to play a little bit of musical chairs because the time has come to bring the Presidents of the
Committees into their seats, plus those other Members who are going to come onto the top bench,
which are the vice-president of the Policy & Resources Committee and the Lead Member for
External Relations.

2020 So, when we come back after lunch, there will be more space for the rest of you, it will be less
congested. The order will be: Deputy Oliver, Deputy Blin, Deputy Gollop sitting in the three seats
that used to be the dock – that is no reflection on any of them of course! – and then in order of
seniority of the blocking together the Policy & Resources people, it will be, from the door-side that
way, Deputy Inder, Deputy Prow, Deputy Dudley-Owen, Deputy Le Tocq, Deputy Soulsby, Deputy
2025 Ferbrache obviously, who has already taken his seat, and then it will be Deputy Roffey, Deputy
Brouard, Deputy de Sausmarez, Deputy Meerveld and Deputy Burford.

2030 One advantage being that the seniority stakes mean that the two Presidents of the parliamentary
committees who are coming up to the bench in this term, rather than it being the two ordinary
members of the Policy & Resources Committee, are isolated in a corner over there! So that is where
everyone will sit from this afternoon. Everyone else can just sit where they like. Spread out as much
as you want to. There will be a different seating arrangement for 4th November onwards.

Thank you all very much, we will now adjourn until 2.30 p.m.

*The Assembly adjourned at 12.57 p.m.
and resumed at 2.30 p.m.*

COMMITTEE FOR EMPLOYMENT & SOCIAL SECURITY

IV. Committee for Employment & Social Security – Election of four members –

Deputy Falla, Deputy Bury, Deputy de Sausmarez and Deputy Gollop elected

Article IV.

The States are asked:

To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the Committee for Employment & Social Security to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article IV – Election of Members of the Committee for Employment & Social Security.

2035

The Bailiff: Before I deal with that matter, the two Alderney Representatives have made it. The weather has obviously cleared. Is it your wish for you both to be relevés, Alderney Representative Roberts and Snowdon?

2040

Alderney Representative Snowdon: Yes, please, sir.

Alderney Representative Roberts: Yes. Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much. Therefore we will record your presence.

2045

There is no current permission to remove jackets. Everyone is in different seats, now, which is going to make life very interesting! Good. Welcome to the Presidents and others from the view that they will now have, both for them a view and you of them, and it will make life simpler for the next elections. Therefore I turn to Deputy Roffey as the President for the Committee for Employment & Social Security, to place his nominations, if he wishes to do so. Deputy Roffey.

2050

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir, yes. I will be proposing Deputies Falla, Bury, de Sausmarez and Gollop.

Deputy Le Tocq: And I will second those nominations sir.

2055

The Bailiff: Thank you very much, Deputy Le Tocq. Are there any other nominations for this Committee? Well, that is a comparatively simple one, then. In that case I will put to Members of the States the nominations that have been proposed by Deputy Roffey and seconded by Deputy Le Tocq, of Deputies Falla, Bury, de Sausmarez and Gollop to sit on the Committee for Employment & Social Security. All those in favour; anyone against?

2060

Members voted Pour.

The Bailiff: I declare all four of them duly elected.

COMMITTEE FOR THE ENVIRONMENT & INFRASTRUCTURE

**V. Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure –
Election of four members –
Deputy Cameron, Deputy Fairclough, Deputy Gabriel
and Deputy Haskins elected**

Article V.

The States are asked:-

To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the Committee for the Environment & Infrastructure to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article V – Election of Members of the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure.

2065 **The Bailiff:** I turn to the President of the Committee, Deputy de Sausmarez, to place her nominations, if she wishes to do so.

Deputy de Sausmarez: Thank you, sir. I would like to nominate Deputies Cameron, Fairclough, Gabriel and Haskins.

2070

The Bailiff: There is this looming presence over my left shoulder! Deputy Ferbrache does that mean you are seconding this?

Deputy Ferbrache: I second all four of those nominations.

2075

The Bailiff: You are going to second them. Thank you very much. Are there any other candidates for the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure? Well then Members of the States, I will put to you the election of four Members, that is Deputies Cameron, Fairclough, Gabriel and Haskins, proposed by Deputy de Sausmarez and seconded by Deputy Ferbrache, for the Committee *for the* Environment & Infrastructure. All those in favour; anyone against?

2080

Members voted Pour.

The Bailiff: Therefore I declare all four of them duly elected.

COMMITTEE FOR HEALTH & SOCIAL CARE

**VI. Committee for Health & Social Care –
Election of four members deferred**

Article VI.

The States are asked:

To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the Committee for Health & Social Care to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article VI – Election of Members of the Committee *for* Health & Social Care.

2085 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard, as the President of the Committee, I will turn to you for your four nominations if you wish to make them. Deputy Brouard.

Deputy Brouard: Thank you, sir.

2090 I have three nominations that I would like to make but I would ask the States to indulge and move the Health nominations until the end of the session, sir, because there are some candidates who may wish to put themselves forward, who may find themselves without portfolio but would very much like to be on Health. I would like the opportunity for those people to be able to be in competition with each other.

2095 **The Bailiff:** Okay, so I think what you are really saying, Deputy Brouard, is that you would like me to put a motion that we defer this item to later in the agenda and that is what I will do. I will simply invite you Members to vote *Pour* or *Contre* to defer this matter to the end of the Agenda or the end of the committee elections at least. All those in favour; all those against?

Members voted Pour.

The Bailiff: I declare that duly carried. So we will come back to that one then.

COMMITTEE FOR HOME AFFAIRS

VII. Committee *for* Home Affairs – Election of four members commenced

Article VII.

The States are asked:-

To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the Committee for Home Affairs to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

2100 **The States' Greffier:** Article VII. Election of Members of the Committee *for* Home Affairs.

The Bailiff: I will turn to the President of that Committee, Deputy Prow, to move his four nominations, if he wishes to do so. Deputy Prow.

2105 **Deputy Prow:** Thank you, sir. I would like to propose the following eligible candidates: Deputy Sue Aldwell, Deputy Simon Vermeulen, Deputy Andrew Taylor and Deputy Chris Le Tissier.
Thank you, sir.

2110 **The Bailiff:** And Deputy Ferbrache?

Deputy Ferbrache: Again, sir, I would be pleased to second the nominations.

2115 **The Bailiff:** You are seconding all four. Are there any other nominations?
Deputy St Pier.

Deputy St Pier: Sir, I wish to nominate Deputy Marc Leadbeater sir.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much. Is Deputy Leadbeater's nomination seconded?

2120 **Deputy Le Tocq:** I do, sir.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq, thank you very much. Anyone else? Sorry, just pausing for breath. It is getting quite busy now.

2125 If there are no further nominations then we will move into Deputy Prow having up to 12 minutes to speak in respect of his three candidates, so Deputy Prow please.

Deputy Prow: Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

2130 Sir, it is with much pleasure that I propose Deputies Sue Aldwell, Simon Vermeulen, Andrew Taylor and last but not least Chris Le Tissier. As previously mentioned in other speeches on Monday, please may I thank Deputies Helyar and Meerveld, for organising the informal gatherings on Sunday evening, for Deputies to meet up with, at that stage sir, potential Presidents of Committees.

2135 I also emailed all Deputies asking for expressions of interest in Home Affairs and I therefore thank all of those who have spoken with me or responded to me and given me an opportunity to get to know them. Following this process, I ask this Assembly to support my nominations. I have already outlined to the Assembly the team concept of policy leads within the committee structure that I would seek to adopt, so there is no need for me to repeat this now.

2140 I have picked a fresh team with youth and as much diversity as is available to me. As a States' Member of four years' experience, including a spell as vice-president for Home Affairs, and a previous background in Law Enforcement, albeit eight years ago now, I hope we can combine as a team with that experience and with brand new thinking to match the completely new make-up of this emerging States.

2145 I believe the different but outstanding talents of this team will blend well and make up for the failings of their President, which are far too numerous to mention. (**A Member:** Hear, hear!) (*Laughter*) They all embrace the concept of strong cross-committee operating, hard work, productive dialogue and appropriate challenge.

I shall now briefly mention each candidate in turn. Deputy Sue Aldwell had a father who served in the Island Police Force in the 1950's, 1960's and 1970's, along with a sister who worked in the Royal Court for 20 years, a first cousin who is a Law Officer and a nephew who is a lawyer. Deputy Aldwell feels this department is probably in her DNA.

2150 She has served as a Constable for nearly five years, working in different States' Departments and building good relationships with many parts of the Civil Service. This enabled her to put cases forward to benefit the parish, such as the night buses for the west and 23-hour parking at La Lague and Portelet.

2155 She has been described as tenacious by the Dean of Torteval, one example being when she took on a project, she identified, searching out heirs and owners of land with rates unpaid for 20 years. Because of the work involved, this had not been looked into by the Cadastre. She was able to uncover the heirs and retrieve 10 years back rates on swathes of land.

2160 Deputy Aldwell very much likes working as a team. She has huge respect for each member of the Torteval Douzaine, she is a team player, enjoys a challenge and certainly will not give up a problem until it is solved. She has informed me she very much looks forward to learning about the different aspects of Home Affairs' remit, if elected, and learning first-hand from the different areas and building relationships with each department, being set a challenge, working to achieve the Committee's goals as a team and moving priorities forward.

2165 Deputy Simon Vermeulen. Deputy Vermeulen is an experienced hotelier and a passionate Guernseyman. He has been in business for over 40 years, encountering many of the facets of the Home Department: liquor licensing, population and migration, immigration and emergency services.

Not only has Simon run a business, but he has also been an active representative for Guernsey's tourism, retail and construction sectors. Deputy Vermeulen was most recently industry lead for tourism at Guernsey Chamber of Commerce and a previous member of the Guernsey Hospitality and Tourism Association. Deputy Vermeulen has been actively involved in Guernsey's new population management regime, as a lobbyist for change to it. Simon is a champion for commerce and wants to create an environment that enables the economy to thrive and remain competitive.

Deputy Andrew Taylor. Deputy Taylor is a breath of fresh air. He is bold and brave, as he demonstrated in this Assembly and put his head above the parapet in competing for a place on E&I. But for a young man he has so much substance and potential. Sir, he is an ideal candidate to help the Committee progress the justice policy piece.

Deputy Taylor, having read through the mandate, is very enthusiastic, particularly the key points highlighted in the recent debates and having read the Professor Sumner Report. In his words, sir, he would see Home Affairs as a fascinating time and an opportunity to see real progress. Deputy Taylor has different ways of thinking. He is open to challenge and would do so constructively. He has a longstanding interest in Guernsey's history and is well-prepared for reading and research.

I am hopeful that you can see his interest in shaping Guernsey's future. Deputy Taylor, as an employer, has always sought to bring about the best in everybody and he thinks that probation and rehabilitation will represent a small part of the mandate, he believes he could offer genuine insight to industry. Industry needs to achieve the best long-term outcomes.

Deputy Chris Le Tissier. Deputy Chris Le Tissier is a local and has spent his long career in the Guernsey financial industry in several different sectors, from high street banking to the more esoteric, such as hedge funds and trust structures. He is a qualified investment professional. After being involved in the administration side of the industry for many years, Chris saw that economic crime was increasing and naturally moved to compliance and financial crime roles.

He is now a director of the Guernsey office of the second largest custodial bank in the world, with responsibility for combating all aspects of financial crime, from money laundering, terrorist financing to people trafficking, bribery and corruption.

Deputy Le Tissier has been the Channel Islands' lead on these matters and has been instrumental in developing economic crime policies in both Islands and a wider group of subject matter experts worldwide. Apart from these matters, Deputy Le Tissier has an interest in population management, IT, Law Enforcement, data protection and Brexit, which will of course affect each and every one of us.

Deputy Le Tissier will bring a methodical and collaborative approach as he has done in his financial career. He will seek to engage with other committees and achieve joined up Government. He believes that Law Enforcement teams deserve up to date data systems for efficiency.

Sir, hopefully, this Assembly will see that this team is a team that will work together and will complement each other and I urge the Assembly to support the team that I have nominated.

Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: I now turn to each of the candidates proposed by Deputy Prow in turn, starting with Deputy Aldwell, for up to three minutes. Deputy Aldwell please.

Deputy Aldwell: Thank you, sir.

This is going to be quite brief, actually. As mentioned by Deputy Prow, having several members of my family over the years working in areas under Home Affairs, I do genuinely feel that the Department is in my DNA. Serving as a Constable for nearly five years and working with different departments, including Law Enforcement and Civil Defence, as well as being the key person for the emergency planning for the parish during Covid, I have been extremely interested in the different reports, which have been produced and the Justice Report, I actually read it before thinking of standing. When I had decided to become a Deputy, I also read it again.

I had already read the Report several times and I had delved into it several times, to which my husband could testify, as each time I quote another set of facts and figures and hear a long sigh as

2220 he does not share my enthusiasm! I am a team player, I enjoy challenge and I certainly will not give up until the problem is solved.

I am very much looking forward to learning about the different aspects of Home Affairs' remit first-hand, learning from different areas and building relationships with each department and being set a challenge, working to achieve Department goals as a team and moving the priorities forward.

2225 Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: I turn next to Deputy Vermeulen.

2230 **Deputy Vermeulen:** Sir, thank you, and for the avoidance of doubt, for those of you in the Chamber, I am of course the youth in the team that Deputy Prow is referring to! (*Laughter.*) I thank him for proposing me and Deputy Ferbrache for seconding me. On a serious note I would very much like to contribute my skills and experience to the Committee for Home Affairs. As Deputy Prow touched on, I believe my skills and experience would lend themselves well to this Department, but I also believe that my listening skills and sound judgement would be just as important, as we
2235 move towards Brexit and the future of justice policy aims.

In my previous career, I played a key role in lobbying for changes to the restrictive population and migration law, which many see as a blocker to business. I have extensive experience with immigration, trading standards and of course the Liquor Licensing Authority. I am looking forward to working as a team with my colleagues and sharing our knowledge and experience led by Deputy Prow. I ask the Assembly to support my nomination for a seat on the Committee for Home Affairs.
2240

The Bailiff: I turn next to Deputy Taylor, please, for up to three minutes. Deputy Taylor.

2245 **Deputy Taylor:** Sir, a quick thank you to my proposer and seconder. I would actually like to start by reading the opening gambit for this Committee. It reads:

To support a high standard of living and quality of life by maintaining and promoting a safe, stable and equitable society, which values public protection and justice and respects the rights, responsibilities and potential of every person.

Now I do not mean to teach Members to suck eggs, I would merely like to draw attention to the last two words there, every person. I have already heard multiple references to considerations of Mrs Le Page in Torteval but not one mention of Duane or Shanigwa, of no fixed abode. Although I may be well-dressed today, I am far more comfortable in my boots and my shorts and my Guernsey.
2250 I am a working man and I can engage on many levels and on many topics, a trait I believe sits well within this Committee.

I have been fortunate in life so far but I believe strongly that the ladder should be let down for others to climb, even if they have previously fallen off. This is a Committee with a widespread mandate so it is important you know I have a working knowledge of the immigration and right to work regimes, as well as the population management regime.
2255

As a small business owner, I have imported goods from around the world, working with customers and although I have recently stood down from the position, I have been the designated official of licensed premises. I believe I have a breadth of knowledge on offer and could make genuine contributions for the good of our population but I am always looking to learn and my ears are always wide open.
2260

Sir, through the election campaign, there are a small group of incumbents who metaphorically took me under their wing. One of those incumbents was Deputy Prow and it would be a privilege to work with him on this Committee.

Thank you.

2265

The Bailiff: I turn next to Deputy Le Tissier.

Deputy Le Tissier: Thank you, sir.

Firstly I would like to thank Deputy Prow for nominating me and Deputy Ferbrache for seconding me. It is the wide-ranging scope of this Committee's mandate that makes it such an important Committee. I believe my own experiences and knowledge prior to being elected would add value to the team Deputy Prow is hoping to assemble.

Now I have worked in finance, as Deputy Prow said, for many years. Too many years, some might say, but I have experienced most sectors where I have two FTSE 100 directorships. My expertise is primarily now, these days, in economic crime. I have got quite a bit of experience in that in the finance industry.

During my career I have had lots of interaction with the Home Department's mandate, in particular financial crime prevention and data protection, but I am happy to say not the police. The finance industry is currently our key industry, which will hopefully continue for many years but it does need careful management and part of this management includes the preparation for the next Moneyval inspection in 2023, but also a proactive approach on such matters as population management and immigration policy. Now, keeping the reputation high in the finance industry is key to its continued success and that is why I would like to commence now in preparation for Moneyval.

Other matters, during the election, one of the very hot topics on social media was that of States' policies on the misuse and decriminalisation of drugs, notably cannabis. So I believe the Committee should take note of the public's changing attitude to this and just keep it on the radar going forward, as a matter of social policy and justice.

If voted onto the Committee, I would be keen to pursue efficiencies across the Home services, chiefly by investing into the provision of state of the art IT services and integration and that is from Law Enforcement to population management, for example. I also believe that as part of the drive towards increased efficiencies, we need to look to more digitising where we interact with the public but we should not forget that some people for whatever reason cannot use digital services and so we need to protect them. So I look forward to the chance to work with the fine team Deputy Prow is seeking to create and getting Guernsey going. So I would ask you to please vote for me.

Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much and I now turn to the proposer of Deputy Leadbeater, Deputy St Pier, to speak in respect of Deputy Leadbeater.

Deputy St Pier: Sir, I am honoured that Deputy Leadbeater should ask me to nominate him for the Committee for Home Affairs. I have actually attempted quite hard to persuade to ask almost anyone else to nominate him because I feel that association with me can do his candidacy no good whatsoever, but nonetheless he has been good enough to persist with me, so I will persist with him.

Continuity or change. Change or continuity. We voted for continuity at Home, with Deputy Prow becoming President and with at least three new Members of the Committee, delivering change. So why is Deputy Leadbeater not part of continuity? It makes no sense. He was the previous Committee's vice-president, he served on it for four years. We should not, in my view, be dumping that experience quite so readily.

I just want to explain what that experience has been and I do think it stands in contrast, with no disrespect to the newly elected Members, who obviously have set out their case but they cannot bring the experience, which he can bring. In fact, the first item I was going to identify was his service on the Oversight Board, with former Deputy Mary Lowe, who I am sure we are all delighted to see is in the public gallery. The Oversight Board worked with Policy & Resources for approximately 18 months and at his first meeting, actually Deputy Lyndon Trott recognised the strategic thinking on offender management.

Deputy Leadbeater has helped build relationships with the service chiefs and support staff. He has sat on the Brexit sub-group, which has formed such a major part of the work of the Committee for Home Affairs in the last term and the Children and Young People's Plan as well, which has not

2320 been mentioned by any other candidate but is an important part of the mandate, working with other committees for the Committee.

2325 He has also filled in on the Brexit Transition Group and chaired Home Affairs meetings in the absence of the then president. He does have an in-depth knowledge of the population management regime, he has worked for four years with Bailiwick Law Enforcement, preparing for Brexit and the multiple cliff edges, which have come and gone and may yet come again, and he of course does have a full understanding of the Committee *for* Home Affairs' mandate. With that pedigree, I do strongly encourage Members of the Assembly to think very carefully before they dump that experience and I urge Members to support this candidate, sir.

2330 **The Bailiff:** I now turn to Deputy Leadbeater to speak to the Assembly for up to three minutes. Deputy Leadbeater.

Deputy Leadbeater: Thank you, sir.

2335 I will start by thanking Deputy St Pier and Deputy Le Tocq for proposing and seconding me, respectively. I was elected to the Committee *for* Home Affairs during the last round of committee elections in 2016. Home Affairs was not in the best place back then. There was history between some of the politicians and senior staff and that obviously had a negative effect on the working relationship.

2340 Fast forward to 2020 and Home Affairs is in a far better place. The Committee had been the subject of a critical HMIC and governance reviews that uncovered historic issues between the political and operational bodies. I found these processes extremely helpful because governance across the States needed to be examined and fully understood by Committee Members and staff alike.

2345 I chose not to focus on any negativity that arose during these reviews but to use the experience to make me a better politician. By adopting this attitude, I was able to make a positive contribution towards guiding the Committee into the better place that it is in now. A Home Affairs Committee's role is to provide the service chiefs with strategic direction and the resources they need to discharge their duties.

2350 During the last Budget debate the then president, Deputy Lowe, that Deputy St Pier referred to is sitting in the public gallery, and I, as vice-president, successfully fought P&R for £100,000 for critical training for Bailiwick Law Enforcement and also for a £1.3 million ringfenced budget for Bailiwick Law Enforcement and St James' Chambers, for the purposes of fighting economic crime.

2355 So, to sum up, sir, I have worked extremely hard over the last four-and-a-half years at Home Affairs. I ended the term as vice-president and I believe that I played an important part in taking the Committee from the uneasy place it was in when I joined to the strong and sturdy ship that it is today. I have an in-depth knowledge of the population management regime and I would like to see a post-lockdown review conducted as soon as possible. I am committed to driving through reforms in the area of justice and I would like to sit on the cross-committee Justice Advisory Panel. Sir, I ask Members to recognise the positive contribution I have made to the Committee *for* Home Affairs and to support me and continue my work on that Committee.

2360 Thank you, sir.

2365 **The Bailiff:** Well, Members of the States, there are five candidates for the four seats on the Committee *for* Home Affairs. They are Deputies Aldwell, Vermeulen, Taylor and Le Tissier – all four being proposed by Deputy Prow, seconded by Deputy Ferbrache – and Deputy Leadbeater, proposed by Deputy St Pier and seconded by Deputy Le Tocq. So in the usual fashion, if you take a voting slip and write as many as four of those five names on it and then hand your voting slip into the Sherriff and her deputy.

A secret ballot took place.

The Bailiff: Are there any more voting slips to be handed in? Members of the States, whilst those votes are being counted, we will rise for a few minutes and resume when the result is available.

*The Assembly adjourned at 3.00 p.m.
and resumed at 3.13 p.m.*

**Committee for Home Affairs –
Deputy Taylor, Deputy Vermeulen, Deputy Leadbeater
and Deputy Le Tissier elected as members**

2370 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the voting for the four Members of the Committee for Home Affairs is as follows: Deputy Aldwell has secured 22 votes, Deputy Vermeulen has secured 28 votes, Deputy Taylor has got 32 votes, Deputy Le Tissier secured 24 votes and Deputy Leadbeater 27 votes. Therefore that I declare that Deputy Taylor, Deputy Vermeulen, Deputy Leadbeater and Deputy Le Tissier are duly elected to the Committee for Home Affairs. *(Applause)*

DEVELOPMENT & PLANNING AUTHORITY

**VIII. Development & Planning Authority –
Election of four members –
Deputy Dyke, Deputy Le Tissier, Deputy Taylor
and Deputy Kazantseva-Miller elected**

Article VIII.

The States are asked:

To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the Development & Planning Authority to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

2375 **The States' Greffier:** Article VIII – the election of Members of the Development & Planning Authority.

The Bailiff: And I turn to the President of the Authority, Deputy Oliver, to move her nominations. Deputy Oliver please.

2380 **Deputy Oliver:** Thank you, sir. I would like to nominate Deputy Dyke, Deputy Le Tissier, Deputy Taylor and also Deputy Kazantseva-Miller? Sorry sir.

A Member: Can you repeat the last one please? *(Laughter)*

2385 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: I will not bother doing that, but I will confirm that I second all four nominees.

2390 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much.
Are there any other nominations to stand for election to the Development & Planning Authority? On that basis, Members of the States, I will put the four candidates who have been proposed by

Deputy Oliver and seconded by Deputy Ferbrache to you. They are Deputy Dyke, Deputy Le Tissier, Deputy Taylor and Deputy Kazantseva-Miller. Those in favour; those against?

Members voted Pour.

2395 **The Bailiff:** I declare all four duly elected to the Authority.

STATES' ASSEMBLY & CONSTITUTION COMMITTEE

IX. States' Assembly & Constitution Committee – Election of four members – Deputy Gollop, Deputy Queripel, Deputy McKenna and Deputy Fairclough elected

Article IX.

The States are asked:-To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article IX. Election of Members of the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee.

2400 **The Bailiff:** I turn to the President of the Committee, Deputy Meerveld, to move his nominations as he wishes. Deputy Meerveld.

Deputy Meerveld: Thank you, sir. I wish to nominate Deputies Gollop, Queripel, McKenna and Fairclough.

2405 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Ferbrache?

Deputy Ferbrache: Again, sir, I second all four nominations.

2410 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much.
Does any other Member wish to nominate anyone to the States' Assembly & Constitution Committee? Once again, in that case, I will put the four candidates, proposed by Deputy Meerveld and seconded by Deputy Ferbrache to you. They are Deputy Gollop, Deputy Queripel, Deputy McKenna and Deputy Fairclough. Those in favour; those against?

2415 *Members voted Pour.*

The Bailiff: I declare all four of them duly elected to that Committee.

STATES' TRADING SUPERVISORY BOARD

**X. States' Trading Supervisory Board –
Election of two members commenced**

Article X.

The States are asked:-

To elect two sitting Members of the States as members of the States' Trading Supervisory Board to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article X. Election of Members of the States' Trading Supervisory Board.

2420 **The Bailiff:** I turn to the President of the committee, Deputy Roffey, to propose his candidates.

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir. I will be proposing Deputies Parkinson and Moakes.

2425 **The Bailiff:** And are those nominations seconded?

Deputy Brouard: I will gladly second, sir.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much, Deputy Brouard. Deputy Ferbrache?

2430 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, I nominate Alderney Representative Roberts.

The Bailiff: And is Alderney Representative Roberts' ... Alderney Representative Snowdon?

2435 **Alderney Representative Snowdon:** Happy to second, sir.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much. Anyone else. Deputy Gollop?

Deputy Gollop: Thanking you, sir. I would like to nominate Deputy Victoria Oliver.

2440 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much. Is Deputy Oliver's nomination seconded? Deputy de Sausmarez, thank you.

2445 There must be some more, come on! This is proving very popular all of a sudden! (*Laughter*) Members of the States, we have got four candidates for two seats and therefore I will invite Deputy Roffey to speak for up to six minutes on the two candidates proposed by him: Deputy Parkinson and Deputy Moakes. Deputy Roffey, please.

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir.

2450 In bidding for these two candidates, I would like Members to bear in mind there are only three politicians on the STSB and, as well as their regular meetings, their over-arching meetings, one of their key roles is to sit on numerous commercial boards of all of the unincorporated trading assets, to control from within the Board – not control the whole Board does that – to be one of the people who controlling those assets. So I think we do need to choose absolutely the right people to fulfil that function.

2455 Let me start with Deputy Charles Parkinson. It is a challenge. What do you say about Deputy Charles Parkinson? I do not know if Members have ever read the *Hitchhikers' Guide to the Galaxy*, if they have they will be familiar with Marvin the Paranoid Android, who had a brain the size of a small planet. Well, so does Deputy Parkinson have a brain the size of a small planet and it is a very

commercial mind as well. He has huge political experience and huge experience in the commercial world.

2460 Inside this Assembly he has been the T&R Minister, he has been President of Economic Development. Indeed, he has in the past been President of STSB before he and Deputy Ferbrache with their dose-y-doe or whatever they call it in American line dancing. He just is the natural person to do this anyway and even if he was a busy Member of the States, I would have been twisting his arm to say, come on, this is your forte, this is what you should be doing.

2465 But he is not a busy Member of the States. Perversely, somebody with such huge talents, such huge political experience and such huge commercial experience currently has absolutely zilch in the way of committee positions and I warn Members, I am experienced in this, the devil finds work for idle backbenchers.

2470 And if you want any idle backbencher do you not want one with the abilities of Deputy Parkinson? I think we are going to have enough trouble with Deputy St Pier without adding Deputy Parkinson into the mix! So please, put him to work and put him to work at something he is supremely suited to. If ever there was a round peg in a round hole, to use that cliché, that somebody had to use during these two days, it is Deputy Parkinson in this particular role.

2475 Now, I do not know Deputy Nick Moakes so well, although we all heard his nomination, both by his proposer and himself, for the role of Economic Development this morning and he obviously has a very impressive CV at the top level of commercial activity. I am not going to repeat that. I could, I have got the notes from it, but what is the point? Unless you had a very good lunch, you can remember what was said this morning. What is clear is he again will be an excellent person sitting on all of those boards of these commercial undertakings, providing the sort of input that is really required on behalf of the States.

2480 He does not have the political experience of Deputy Parkinson and I do not think we should underestimate how important political experience is, but he has got the opposite. He has got the fresh pair of eyes and will provide challenge, but challenge from an informed background, from a background of somebody steeped in commercial activities.

2485 I also know that this is no flippant act of Deputy Moakes in actually looking to stand for this position. I know that he has been in, talking to one of the two excellent non-States' members that we have on the States' Trading Supervisory Board to find out what it is all about, to find out what he is getting himself into, so he is going in eyes wide open.

2490 This is no flippant committee. This is a committee that controls a huge number of commercial activities and we absolutely need the people with the right acumen to serve on it, to be on those boards, to be on the main Board of STSB, reviewing the actions of those boards, and in Deputy Moakes and in Deputy Parkinson, I do not think we could do better, frankly, so I ask you to vote for both of them.

2495 **The Bailiff:** I turn next to the first candidate proposed by Deputy Roffey. Deputy Parkinson to speak for up to three minutes. Deputy Parkinson please.

Deputy Parkinson: Thank you, sir.

2500 I was President of the STSB from 2016 to 2018 and so I am very familiar with the portfolio of trading assets, which belongs to the States. Indeed, I had responsibility for some of them when I was Treasury Minister from 2008-2012, so my engagement with them goes back a considerable way. I think the STSB is one of the more interesting committees on the States. I was very pleased to serve on that committee for two years in the last term and I very much enjoyed the experience.

2505 In a way, STSB has all the toys. If you want to go and see big generators or you want to see production facilities for milk or you want to go and see the workings of the Waste Transfer Station, it is all there. There are few other roles in the States where you get to see actual industrial scale machinery and processes.

But STSB, also, is interesting because it is at the centre of a lot of very interesting issues facing Guernsey. If we just take, for example, the eastern sea board, the STSB as the owner of the Port

2510 facilities, has a huge part to play and of course it has been engaged for some time now in a study of what Guernsey's future commercial port facilities should look like.

These are massive issues, which could transform the Island over the next decade and for the next century. So I very much look forward to seeing the output of that work. I have not been involved in the research that has been ongoing but I think what comes back from that review will probably feed
2515 into some very interesting projects for discussion and potential inclusion, in the Revive and Thrive strategy.

There are also other issues, like the Airport runway extension possibility, there is the Frontier Economics research is going to be updated in light of the effects of the Covid-19 pandemic. Economic Development will come back to this Assembly, its President said, by Easter next year, and
2520 if there is a case for extending the runway, a cost-benefit analysis case, then STSB will be at the heart of doing that work.

There are many other issues to be resolved. A new Dairy, for example. Clearly, potentially moving the Dairy from its current site to the Brickfield site would free up an interesting piece of property adjacent to Princess Elizabeth Hospital, with huge potential for other uses. So many things are
2525 going –

The Bailiff: Deputy Parkinson, I am afraid that is your three minutes, please.

Deputy Parkinson: Thank you.
2530

The Bailiff: I turn next to Deputy Moakes.

Deputy Moakes: Thank you, sir and thank you for proposing me as well, Deputy Roffey. I am standing to be a Member of the States' Trading Supervisory Board because the role appeals to me
2535 immensely. It is an opportunity to work with a diverse group of businesses, which provide essential services to the Island and are therefore incredibly important. This is what I have done for the last 25 years.

There are some obvious things I would like to focus on if I am elected. For example, Aurigny was losing money before the pandemic hit, so we need to look at how we can reduce losses in the
2540 future. I believe that my experience of working with airlines will be useful here. The Dairy is in urgent need of attention, so we need to deliver the Future Dairy Project, which was set up to make decisions about whether to refurbish the existing site or build a new Dairy on a new site. I have a number of ideas that I would like to explore.

There are some exciting plans for harbour redevelopment, which will create jobs and enhance
2545 facilities for both commercial and leisure users. I am really excited about this and believe that it could be a huge economic enabler for the Island.

If I am elected, I will meet with every States' trading business to learn more about what it does and what opportunities and challenges it faces. I would also like to lift the bonnet on each of these businesses, to see where efficiencies can be made. I will encourage the sharing of best practices
2550 across States-owned trading businesses and I will act as a conduit between the States and the States' own trading companies. To do this, I will work with other committees and boards to help the States' Supervisory Trading Board get the support that it needs and vice versa.

In summary, I believe that I have the commercial and inter-personal skills to be a key member of this team. Twenty-five years of commercial experience, which has involved working with
2555 companies and, crucially, boards and committees, across a wide range of different business sectors; analytical and creative thinking. I am used to working at matrix organisations and building consensus but most of all, perhaps, I am passionate about Guernsey and want this new Government to be successful.

The States' trading companies are integral to the Island's success so, if Deputies vote for me
2560 today, I commit to work with all the other committees and boards to help rebuild Guernsey's economy. Thank you.

The Bailiff: I turn next to the proposer of Alderney Representative Roberts, Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: Sir, it is often said there is nothing new in politics but in the last few minutes the States has heard from three Presidents of the States' Trading Supervisory Board. As the last President, I can say that I was fortunate in my term, my two years and a bit, to work with some very able colleagues, one of which has just been recently elected the President of the Board.

I can say in that relation, it was probably the most enjoyable time. I do not mean the last eight months, necessarily, but over the last two-and-a-bit years, as a States' Member, because it is so interesting. You are doing something. You are dealing with commercial entities, you are producing something.

Therefore that took me to Alderney Representative Roberts because he worked in retail. He had retail businesses in the UK, he travelled from Alderney to the East Midlands as a young man, but he returned to Alderney and he worked for 23 years in the airline industry. I first got to know him, not by seeing him but by hearing his weather reports from Alderney or how many flights Aurigny had missed that particular day.

He is a man of considerable intelligence and he has just got that – I do not know – gentle, calm intelligence and judgement. Because, above all, there are people with the brains of a size of small island or nation or whatever it may be and there are others of us who are much more limited. But you need a balance somewhere in between. Alderney Representative Roberts is a person of that quality and we talk about the inclusiveness of Alderney, this is a chance for us to elect a sensible, intelligent, pragmatic, experienced man onto an important Guernsey committee.

The Bailiff: I now turn to Alderney Representative Roberts to speak for up to three minutes on his candidature. Alderney Representative Roberts.

Alderney Representative Roberts: Thank you, sir.

I am from Alderney and I grew up on a farm there. I moved, as a teenager, from Alderney, as teenagers seek the wider world. My history is a mixed one and I have served in the States of Deliberation for the last two years on the Airport Licensing Board. In Alderney I served on the Planning Committee, the Finance Committee, General Services Committee and I am the States' Member for health plus agriculture and wildlife. I was also on the Air Licensing Board and Employment Board. I am also on Air Transport.

I have run multiple retail outlets in Nottingham, some of which I ended up owning, and was involved in waste management for a period of time. I spent 23 years in aviation for two companies and one of which was Aurigny, for 21 years. Given our problems in Alderney, I feel it would be good to have an Alderney Representative on this Committee and ask for your vote today to give Alderney a seat at the table.

Aviation and connectivity are my first political love and I feel the experience in all these fields would help me make great contributions to the STSB. My background covers a wide field. All attributes needed to understand both airports' needs. My agriculture background helps me understand the needs of Guernsey Dairy and its importance to the Island, which I feel is vital.

I also deal with Alderney Water Board directly through my committee in Alderney and it is our most cost-effective utility. I also understand running a business and the problems that can bring. I get in well and am very good at one-to-one relationships. I am a people person. I am down to earth and friendly, observing and understanding company problems, while taking on board my views. I believe in this opportunity for me to improve the Bailiwick and would welcome challenges and I ask you to give Alderney a vote on this important committee.

Thank you.

The Bailiff: Thank you very much. I now turn to Deputy Gollop to speak in respect of his candidate, Deputy Oliver. Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: Thank you, Mr Bailiff, sir.

2615 One of the busiest Members of the last term has been Deputy Oliver, despite also being a young mother and having two babies in the term, too. She not only attended everything and answered every email with diligence and worked on the Home Committee for four-and-a-half years but of course she was an active Member of the Development & Planning Authority when I was President and when my successor, lawyer Dawn Tindall was President. She became vice-president at that stage.

2620 She was educated at Blanchelande, Millfield, Bristol University of the West of England and, as we know, is a qualified chartered surveyor who has worked with Savills and other organisations. But, especially for this role, she has had a key amount of work and expertise in looking at the University Working Party, the Seafront Enhancement Area, the Property Portfolio Subcommittee and, indeed, she was our representative, and also for the Home Affairs Committee, on the Seafront Enhancement Programme, which we know is a key element of Revive and Thrive.

2625 She is very entrepreneurial. She comes from a background of property investment. She understands the value of money and the nature of the importance of our transport links and she is very strong on wanting contracts to be offered to local companies, keeping money local and only using outside consultants when necessary.

2630 I think her specialist subject, and that has been mentioned already by senior Members of this assembly, is proper asset management of the property portfolio and I think that is why she is a perfect fit for this job, not only having the political and the professional experience but also we can synergise her role at planning, because planning and the trading assets were perhaps not talking to each other as much as they could have done in the last States, and that would indeed help Seafront Enhancement and many other bigger infrastructural projects.

The Bailiff: I now invite Deputy Oliver to speak for up to three minutes on her candidature. Deputy Oliver.

2640

Deputy Oliver: Thank you, sir. Firstly, I would like to thank Deputy Gollop for proposing me and Deputy de Sausmarez for seconding me. I will not repeat what I said during my speech for the DPA presidency, although I will speak about a different side of me, which I do not often say. I am a director of a property company and I used to advise on every aspect. So I do know what it is like to run a business, although I do take much more of a back seat now I am a Deputy.

2645

Working at my old company, I was an integral part of the valuation team. My experience led me to valuation of quite obscure developments, that being airports, large motorway stations, along with all the components, including hotels.

2650

I have a good idea on how to get the deficit down with Aurigny. I have some ideas that I think I would be of benefit to the committee. I will say that I believe that I am a fantastic candidate for this committee, as I can provide challenge and also have the knowledge. It is a role that demands attention to detail. It demands both strategy, implementation, leadership and teamwork, focusing on how to add value and reduce costs in the long-term, whilst absolutely thinking about the bigger picture and what is right for Guernsey.

2655

STSB needs to get the best out of companies, to get the best for our clients, Guernsey Islanders, timely and effectively, is what we need to do and I did this during my previous life. I brought this forward in my Deputies' roles. Reducing costs and expenditure are the consequences of this, but not necessarily the main focus. The real goal is to unlock the gems of – my computer has just shut down, sorry – the utility companies.

2660

What I am very interested in is the drainage. Not many people speak about drainage but the north of the Island has gone under a huge transformation and this is to protect the Islanders, not only from sewage overflows, but pollution as well. We have got the Seafront Enhancement Area, which I have been the committee Member of last term. This is really important as it will enhance our harbours.

2665 There is also the land at Mont Cuet breakwater This could be potentially a great piece of work to do. It is currently a waste site, which needs to be transformed in to such that Guernsey can be proud of. Not just commercial but looking at it from a social point of view, an environment point of view as well. We need to draw upon everything to make this committee fantastic.

2670 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Oliver, I am afraid that is your three minutes.

So, Members of the States, we turn to the voting slips once again please. Two names, two vacancies on the States' Trading Supervisory Board for Members of the States of Deliberation. There are four candidates. They are Deputy Parkinson, proposed by Deputy Roffey, seconded by Deputy Brouard; Deputy Moakes, proposed by Deputy Roffey, seconded by Deputy Brouard; Alderney Representative Roberts, proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, seconded by Alderney Representative Snowdon; and Deputy Oliver, propose by Deputy Gollop and seconded by Deputy de Sausmarez.

2675 So, if you can complete your voting slips by writing up to two names on it from those four candidates and have them ready to be collected by the Sherriff and Deputy Sherriff.

A secret ballot took place.

2680 **The Bailiff:** Has everyone who wishes to do so handed in a voting slip? Members of the States, whilst those votes are being counted, once again, I will just rise and we will adjourn for a few minutes, to enable you to move around.

*The Assembly adjourned at 3.39 p.m.
and resumed at 3.47 p.m.*

**States' Trading Supervisory Board –
Deputy Parkinson and Deputy Moakes elected as members**

2685 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, the voting for two Members to join Deputy Roffey on the States' Trading Supervisory Board as Members is as follows. Deputy Parkinson polled 20 votes, Deputy Moakes polled 21 votes; Alderney Representative Roberts polled 16 votes and Deputy Oliver polled 14 votes. I therefore declare that Deputy Moakes and Deputy Parkinson are duly elected to the Board. *(Applause)*

TRANSPORT LICENSING AUTHORITY

**XI. Transport Licensing Authority –
Election of four members –
Alderney Representative Roberts, Deputy de Lisle,
Deputy Le Tissier and Deputy Blin elected**

Article XI.

The States are asked:

To elect four sitting Members of the States as members of the Transport Licensing Authority to serve until 30th June 2025 in accordance with Rule 16 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation as set out in Section 1 of The Rules of Procedure of the States of Deliberation and their Committees.

The States' Greffier: Article XI – Election of Members to the Transport Licensing Authority.

The Bailiff: I turn to the President of the committee, the Authority, Deputy Gollop.

2690

Deputy Gollop: Thank you, sir.

It was partly consequential on who did what but I would like to propose for it Alderney Representative Steve Roberts, Deputy de Lisle, Deputy Le Tissier and Deputy Christopher Blin – assuming they all wish to stand! (*Laughter*)

2695

The Bailiff: Are the four Members proposed by Deputy Gollop seconded?

Deputy Meerveld: I will second all four, sir.

2700

The Bailiff: Thank you very much, Deputy Meerveld. Are there any other nominations for the Transport Licensing Authority? In that case, Members of the States, I will put the four Members proposed by Deputy Gollop and seconded by Deputy Meerveld to you. They are Alderney Representative Roberts, Deputy de Lisle, Deputy Le Tissier and Deputy Blin. Those in favour; those against?

Members voted Pour.

2705

The Bailiff: I declare all four of them duly elected.

ADMINISTRATIVE DECISIONS (REVIEW) (GUERNSEY) LAW, 1986 PANEL

XII. Administrative Decisions (Review) (Guernsey) Law, 1986 Panel of Members – Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman commenced – Deputy Meerveld elected Chairman

Article XII.

The States are asked:-

To elect, in accordance with the provisions of section 4(2) of the Administrative Decisions (Review) (Guernsey) Law, 1986:-

1. A Chairman of the Panel of Members, who shall be a sitting Member of the States of Deliberation and who has held a seat in the States for a period of three years or more, to fill the vacancy which will arise on 15th October 2020, by reason of the expiry of the term of office of Deputy Christopher Green, who is not eligible for re-election; and

2. A Deputy Chairman of that Panel, who shall be one of the Deans of the Douzaines but who shall not have a seat in the States, to fill the vacancy which will arise on 15th October 2020, by reason of the expiry of the term of office of Douzenier Richard Heaume MBE, who is not available for re-election.

The States' Greffier: Article XII – Administrative Decisions (Review) (Guernsey) Law, 1986 – new Chairman and Deputy Chairman of the Panel of Members.

2710

The Bailiff: Okay, so first of all we will deal with, shall we go with the Chairman of the Panel of Members, who has got to be a sitting Member of the States? Deputy Ferbrache.

Deputy Ferbrache: Sir, may I please put forward Deputy Carl Meerveld?

2715

The Bailiff: Is that seconded? Deputy Helyar. Thank you.

Are there any other nominations to be the Chairman of the Panel of Members, the first of the two Propositions? In that case I will simply put to you, Members, the nomination of Deputy Meerveld, proposed by Deputy Ferbrache, seconded by Deputy Helyar. Those in favour; those against?

Members voted Pour.

2720 **The Bailiff:** I declare Deputy Meerveld duly elected as Chairman.
We turn next to a Deputy Chairman, who is going to be one of the Deans of the Douzaines.
Deputy Ferbrache.

2725 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Sir, I nominate Douzenier Martin Ozanne.

The Bailiff: Is that nomination seconded?

Deputy Brouard: I will second, sir.

2730 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Brouard. Deputy Roffey.

Deputy Roffey: Sir, I nominate Mrs Christine Goodlass.

2735 **The Bailiff:** And is Mrs Goodlass' nomination seconded? Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: I am very happy to second her, sir.

2740 **The Bailiff:** You might have to remind me what happens next! (*Laughter.*) Are there any other nominations while we think about it? In the circumstances, Madam Procureur, what do we do now? Are we going to have speeches from the proposers?

The Procureur: Yes, if you are minded to do that, we could have speeches from the proposers.

2745 **The Bailiff:** Ah, we could do. Why do we not, then? Shall we give them as long as they like to move their nominations or shall we give them a time limit. Why do we not go for a maximum of five limits but ask you to keep it to three? But if you slip beyond three, then so be it. Obviously, the candidates themselves are not here and cannot speak for themselves, so I will simply turn to Deputy Ferbrache to speak about Mr Ozanne.

2750 **Deputy Ferbrache:** Well sir, I thought until you time limited it, my good friend and colleague Deputy Lester Queripel would invite me to be longer than my education speech, perhaps not. But in relation to Douzenier Ozanne, he is a well-known former Member of the States, he served in a distinguished fashion for a long time and again he is a person of real quality, so I do not think I need to take any more time than that.

2755 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much. Deputy Roffey to speak about Mrs Goodlass.

Deputy Roffey: Thank you, sir.

2760 Maybe I will make the unusual step of saying former Deputy Ozanne is a good friend of mine, so I am certainly not putting somebody up against him just because I think that he needs opposition, but because I think it is always good to have two good candidates to choose between.

Now, Christine Goodlass is the Dean of St Peter Port Douzaine. She has been since 2015. She has served on the douzaine since the last century. I have also come across her in person quite a lot in various roles but, particularly, because she is Chairman of the Amherst and Vauvert Schools

2765 Committee. Indeed, as Herm comes under Vauvert, we have taken Trident journeys together over to inspect the primary school in Herm.

She is indeed a retired teacher herself, as well as being a former hotelier and a sewing machine consultant. I think in particular importance here is that she has been, for a number of years, on the Parochial Appeals Tribunal. In fact, she has just been reappointed to it and she has had judicial training in that role, to enable her to discharge it properly and I think that will come in incredibly helpful here.

2775 She has broad experience of what can go before one of these tribunals, I remember, I am probably the only person in the States who remembers it being set up by the Deputy Perrot, it can come from any one of the Committees of the States. Anybody that is aggrieved with an administrative decision, if there is no obvious legal recourse, can take it to one of these tribunals and I think her very broad experience of life, in so many facets, and her judicial training as far as the Appeals Panel is concerned, will really help her to discharge that mandate very well indeed and I recommend her to you.

2780 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much. Well, Members of the States, it will be a vote by way of a secret ballot between the two candidates proposed as the new Deputy Chairman of the Panel of Members, under the 1986 Law. The first candidate is Martin Ozanne, proposed by Deputy Ferbrache and seconded by Deputy Brouard and the second candidate is Christine Goodlass, proposed by Deputy Roffey and seconded by Deputy Gollop. Are there any more voting slips from any Member?

2785 *A secret ballot took place.*

COMMITTEE FOR HEALTH & SOCIAL CARE

VI. Committee for Health & Social Care – Election of four members resumed – Deputy Bury, Deputy Leadbeater, Deputy Matthews and Alderney Representative Snowdon elected

The Bailiff: Now, Members of the States, whilst those votes are being counted, because they are for one of the Deans of the Douzaine to become the Deputy Chairman of the Panel of Members, perhaps we can return to the one item that we deferred, crack on in other words, action rather than anything else, can we call that matter back and I will turn to Deputy Brouard and see if he is ready?

2790 **Deputy Brouard:** Thank you, sir. I am ready and thank you to the States for allowing the deferment. I am extremely pleased to put forward to you Deputy Tina Bury, Deputy Marc Leadbeater, Deputy Aidan Matthews and Alderney Representative Alex Snowdon.

2795 **The Bailiff:** Thank you very much. So, are those four nominations seconded?

Deputy Roffey: They are, sir.

2800 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Roffey, thank you very much.

Does anyone else wish to stand in the election to become a Member of the Committee for Health & Social Care? On that basis, I will put to you, Members, the four nominations proposed by Deputy Brouard, seconded by Deputy Roffey. They are Deputy Bury, Deputy Leadbeater, Deputy Matthews and Alderney Representative Snowdon. Those in favour; those against?

Members voted Pour.

2805 **The Bailiff:** I declare all four of them duly elected. (*Applause*)

**Procedural –
Acceptable forms of address and seating arrangements**

2810 **The Bailiff:** I tell you what, I will do a bit of filling in of the time, while we are waiting for a result. If there is a silence, fill a gap, that is my motto! During the course of some of the nominations speeches, etc., over the last few days, those of you who know me will have been surprised that I did not leap down people's throats for addressing other Members by their Christian names only and not giving them their proper title. I think it is only appropriate, during the course of these Election Meetings, to give that degree of latitude.

2815 However, come 4th November, you have been given fair warning that, if you fail to refer to an Alderney Representative as an Alderney Representative and a Deputy as a Deputy, and you simply go down to the individual's first name or their first name and their surname, or just their surname heaven forbid if we are back to our schooldays, then you will be called to account for doing so and asked to apologise.

2820 It is just a matter of respect that people know the names of Members and use them accordingly in a parliamentary context. When we get to the Meeting on 4th November, which because there is no other business for this Meeting, just to explain to you there will be free seating down on the floor of the Assembly, other than the presidential benches, and the dock seats.

2825 But in order to assist me in particular, I am going to allocate three blocks of seating and that will be front row and the first two seats going around on my right, for the Members of the Guernsey Party, the front four seats here, plus either where Deputy Trott is or where Deputy McKenna is, I do not really mind which, but one of those two, for the five Members of the Guernsey Partnership of Independents, and everyone else will have free seating, except what we will avoid is that somebody sits in the middle of a row of five, on both sides there, and that people do not sit in the middle of the rows of three there and where Deputy Bury is, is a vacant seat, from 4th November, rather than having three people sat together over there.

2830 So that will be the seating arrangements. That will be circulated for you. It encourages you to get here early to lay out your little towel on whatever seat it is that you would like to occupy. The two Alderney Representatives will have the two seats at the back corner, one of which is currently occupied by Deputy Queripel on the basis that that way we can see them arrive and leave if, for any reason, they arrive late or leave early. So the two of them should sit together.

2835 So those two seats cannot be taken by anyone else. Those six seats cannot be taken, those five seats cannot be taken, but the rest are wherever you want and you can sit in different seats at different times of the day if it suits you, depending on what policy matters are being debated by you.

2840 Deputy Kazantseva-Miller?

2845 **Deputy Kazantseva-Miller:** Sir, if you would permit me I am humbled by my esteemed colleagues' efforts to pronounce my name. I know it might take a little while but I just wanted to say it myself, which might help in those circumstances – but I really appreciate that. So it is Sasha Kazantseva-Miller. I really appreciate it, it is a bit of a strange surname, but thank you for your efforts.

Thank you, sir.

2850 **The Bailiff:** Would you like to say it again for us?! (*Laughter*) That way some people might actually get it. Repetition is a great thing for getting things into people's minds.

Deputy Kazantseva-Miller: So, it is Kazantseva – accent on the second syllable.

The Bailiff: Kazantseva?

Deputy St Pier: Sir, perhaps whilst we are waiting we could all do it together? *(Laughter)*

2855

The Bailiff: You have to wait no longer Deputy St Pier, on the basis that a piece of paper has been handed to me.

**Administrative Decisions (Review) (Guernsey) Law, 1986 Panel of Members –
Douzenier Goodlass elected Deputy Chairman**

2860

The Bailiff: The voting for the Deputy Chairman of the Panel of Members is as follows. Martin Ozanne secured 16 votes, Christine Goodlass secured 18 votes and there were six blank papers and therefore I declare that Douzenier Goodlass is elected as the Deputy Chairman of the Panel. *(Applause)*

**Procedural –
Query on election of Chairman of the Panel of Members**

2865

The Bailiff: Before I ask the States' Greffier to close this Meeting and thank you for speeding up a little bit this afternoon, perhaps we can do what Deputy St Pier suggested and all just have a quick go at pronouncing Deputy Kazantseva-Miller's name!

Yes, Madam Procureur?

2870

The Procureur: Sir, I just wanted to double check, I apologise my computer is crashing, I just wanted to check on the nomination of Deputy Meerveld as Chair of the Panel, because there was an amendment law in 2018 on the Administrative Review Board legislation and I am not absolutely sure – my apologies my computer crashed – whether a Member of the States of Deliberation can be the Chair, but I am not sure if this has been raised before. Apologies to raise it now, sir, but I have just spotted that.

2875

The Bailiff: Let us just take a pause shall we. Which Law are we looking for? Greffier, are you able to get the Law up please? Madam Procureur, do you want to have a quick look over the States' Greffier's shoulder for a moment, rather than rising and trying to deal with it, if there is an issue.

2880

Deputy Queripel: Sir, apologies, could I have further clarification please on the seating for the future Meetings? I did not take that all in, I am afraid. Did you say free seating only for the next Meeting or free seating for the whole of the next term?

2885

The Bailiff: The intention, Deputy Queripel, is that free seating, until further direction. So, as a non-party Member, you will have a seat around the back, effectively, but not where you are sitting at the moment, because one of the Alderney Representatives will be there and I doubt that they want you on their lap!

Deputy Queripel: Thank you, sir.

2890

The Bailiff: Members of the States, do bear with us. An issue has been raised, as you heard, by HM Procureur. I am going to crave your indulgence, so rather than closing the Meeting, we will just adjourn for a few minutes, just to check to see what is the position in respect of that Proposition,

and Deputy Meerveld's purported election to be the Chairman of the Panel of Members. Do bear with us because we have got a little bit of time. Stretch your legs, have a cup of tea or whatever, and we will be back in a few minutes.

*The Assembly adjourned at 4.05 p.m.
and resumed at 4.25 p.m.*

**Procedural –
Query on election of Chairman of the Panel of Members –
Election of Deputy Meerveld and Douzenier Goodlass confirmed**

2895 **The Bailiff:** Members of the States, thank you for giving us just the time to double check a few matters. I am going to ask HM Procureur to clarify the position for us please.
Madam Procureur.

2900 **The Procureur:** Thank you, sir and thank you to Members for being so patient. Sir, I can confirm that there is no problem with Deputy Meerveld being Chairman. The difficult is simply in the terminology. There is a complaints panel, under the provisions of the Law, as amended in 2018, which provides that Members of the States cannot be on the complaints panel. There is also a Panel of Members, which is different, to which Members of the States are eligible, provided they have a minimum of three years' service.

2905 Therefore in these circumstances, Deputy Meerveld is eligible but the distinction was simply around that terminology and, unfortunately, my computer crashing at the wrong moment. But the position is now clear, sir. Thank you.

2910 **The Bailiff:** More particularly, the States have complied with section 4(2) of the Law as amended, because it is within six weeks of the General Election and therefore one of the Members is the Chairman and one of the Deans is the Deputy Chairman of the Panel of Members now and therefore all is resolved. So I can confirm that Deputy Meerveld has been duly elected as the Chairman of the Panel of Members and that Douzenier Goodlass has been elected as the Deputy Chairman of the Panel of Members, in accordance with those two Propositions.

2915 I think that now does conclude the business for this Meeting. Thank you all very much for your attendance and efforts over the last few days. It has been quite intensive and now, hopefully, things will settle down and we will see you all on 4th November, ready for fireworks the next day.

We will close the Meeting now, please, thanks Greffier.

The Assembly adjourned at 4.27 p.m.