

THE STATES OF DELIBERATION
of the
ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

14th July 2021

Proposition No. P.2021/69

COMMITTEE FOR EDUCATION, SPORT & CULTURE

SECONDARY AND POST-16 EDUCATION REORGANISATION

AMENDMENT

Proposed by: Deputy J P Le Tocq

Seconded by: Deputy A H Brouard

To delete the Propositions and substitute therefor:

1. To agree that sixth form education, in the States'-maintained secondary sector, should continue to be provided within an 11-18 setting, rather than in a stand-alone sixth form college, and to direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture to design the optimal model for providing secondary education in Guernsey which retains an 11-18 educational offer inside the States'-maintained secondary sector, based as equitably as possible, on the following:
 - three 11-18 schools based at existing educational sites;
 - ensuring that the intake is such that the 11-16 section of the schools are of roughly the same size;
 - including at one school site the main sixth form centre;
 - facilitating sixth form 'satellites' at the other two schools sites working together in partnership with the main centre; and
 - maximising vocational and academic option mix between the sixth form centre and The Guernsey Institute.

Or if Proposition 1 has not been approved:

2. To agree that sixth form education, in the States'-maintained secondary sector, should continue to be provided within an 11-18 setting, rather than in a stand-alone sixth form college, and to direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture to design the optimal model for providing secondary education in Guernsey which

retains an 11-18 educational offer inside the States'-maintained secondary sector, based as equitably as possible, on the following:

- three 11-16 schools based at existing educational sites;
- ensuring that the intake is such that these schools are of roughly the same size;
- including at one of the 11-16 school sites a sixth form centre;
- seeking to investigate, develop and facilitate opportunities to continue post-16 studies, including A levels, where practicable, at the other two school sites through partnership with the sixth form centre; and
- maximising vocational and academic option mix between the sixth form centre and The Guernsey Institute.

And, if Propositions 1 or 2 have been approved:

3. To approve 'Secondary & Post-16 Education Reorganisation' as a project in the capital portfolio, subject to the States approving the relevant Propositions in the Government Work Plan policy letter which is being considered by the States later in July 2021.
4. To direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture to work in conjunction with the Policy & Resources Committee to deliver the proposals outlined in Propositions 1 or 2 above within the delegated capital budget and ongoing revenue costs as proposed in the policy letter.

Or, if Proposition 4 has not been approved:

5. To direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture to work in conjunction with the Policy & Resources Committee to return to the States as soon as practicable with proposals to deliver the proposals outlined in Propositions 1 or 2 above within the delegated capital budget and ongoing revenue costs as proposed in the policy letter.

Rule 4(3) Information

The alternative Propositions in this amendment will not increase costs committed at this stage beyond those anticipated in the original Propositions. These work streams are all manageable within existing committed resources of the States, without additional resources being required. Any expenditure which may become incurred beyond that envisaged in the policy letter and original propositions would require further approval by the States.

Explanatory note.

The top performing all-ability schools in the British Isles are generally 11-18 schools; whilst not exclusively so, it would seem that the highest operational efficiencies, teacher recruitment, and educational outcomes are more readily achieved in such educational

institutions, and this has been the case for some time. [<https://www.compare-school-performance.service.gov.uk/schools-by-type?step=phase&geographic=all®ion=0&phase=secondary>]

The current proposals from ESC are potentially expensive in terms of long term running costs unless either a significant reduction in curriculum subject offer occurs or they are ameliorated by forming a fully-fledged tertiary college, which whilst not impossible would simultaneously affect the governance and plans for the Guernsey Institute. This amendment therefore would not carry the degree of risk for narrowing curriculum options, plus with the main sixth form centre remaining potentially at Le Varendes, it would still be possible to facilitate synergies with vocational options between sixth form and the Guernsey Institute located just a few hundred yards away.

The current ESC propositions effectively close one 11-16 school, convert our one existing 11-18 school to 11-16 to create a new 16-18 school plus a brand new sixth form centre, exchanging one 4 school model for another 4 school model which is no more revenue efficient but which represents an untried education model by creating what would be by some margin the smallest standalone sixth form college anywhere in the British Isles.

There have been a number of indications of support for a three school model. This amendment builds on the work done by the committee on a three 11-16 school model with a separate sixth form college working in a federated manner, but allows for those who consider that 11-18 schools (currently operating successfully with smaller sixth forms in the Guernsey private school sector) can attract a broader cross-section of teachers, provide better educational outcomes, and be more cost-effective, flexible and sustainable in the long-term.

Thus this amendment proposes retaining our current 11-18 school, using the current sixth form centre as a base to facilitate three 11-18 schools, without the need for a new separated sixth form college and to be federated as practically as possible so as to ensure the broadest post-16 curriculum as possible. It gives two options to the Assembly about how such an arrangement might be facilitated, either through gradual evolution or more speedily.

The Assembly therefore needs to decide whether to risk an ambitious but untried model, effectively creating a stand-alone sixth form college for circa 400-450 pupils, which could prove to be unnecessarily expensive in both capital and revenue terms, and potentially operationally sub-optimal, being virtually half the size of the smallest sixth form colleges in the UK. In our current constrained financial circumstances it could be argued that this would not be a wise risk to take.

Furthermore there is very considerable evidence that retaining the 11-18 offering within the state sector could not only be more cost effective in both capital and revenue terms but, even more importantly, would help to optimise both educational outcomes and staff recruitment, whilst being less disruptive overall for both pupils and staff.

If this amendment is passed it would not send the Committee for ESC back to the drawing board in the sense that the States would have taken a definitive decision to retain an 11-18 educational offer within the States sector rather than leaving this type of education to the private colleges alone. It is recognised that there are several variables for a secondary education system within the state sector and whilst the current policy letter does not detail such comparisons it does emphasize the need for an equitable system. It is known that all of the possible models of secondary education which retain an 11-18 offer have already been examined in the recent past. Therefore armed with the clear direction from the States that it definitely does want to retain an 11-18 offering within the state sector it should be possible for the Committee for ESC to determine a preferred option and work with P&R and within current budgetary constraints to deliver it with minimal delay