

THE STATES OF DELIBERATION
of the
ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

14th July 2021

Proposition No. P.2021/69

COMMITTEE FOR EDUCATION, SPORT & CULTURE

SECONDARY AND POST-16 EDUCATION REORGANISATION

AMENDMENT

Proposed by: Deputy Jonathan Le Tocq

Seconded by: Deputy Andy Cameron

To delete the Propositions and substitute therefor:

“1.

1.1 To agree that:

- from the earliest date practicable, States’ maintained secondary education should be delivered through an 11-18 learning partnership across three 11-16 schools and a Sixth Form Centre located on a site separate to those schools, and Le Murier and Les Voies Schools and St Anne’s School in Alderney;
- the three 11-16 schools will be located on the existing school sites at Les Beaucamps, Les Varendes and St Sampson’s and the Sixth Form Centre in a new building at Les Ozouets Campus co-located with The Guernsey Institute, the development and implementation of which is estimated to have:
 - a) A capital cost of £43.5m as set out in table 8 in paragraph 9.4;
 - and
 - b) An ongoing revenue cost which will not, in the medium term, exceed the current revenue costs associated with these phases of education; and
- ‘Secondary & Post-16 Education Reorganisation’ shall be approved as a project in the capital portfolio, subject to ratification by the States as part of the Government Work Plan debate

And if Proposition 1.1 has been approved,

1.2 To delegate authority to the Policy & Resources Committee, following approval of the necessary business cases, to open capital votes of up to £54m, (which includes an allowance for optimism bias as described in section 9.8) to fund the model for the reorganisation of the secondary and post 16 education infrastructure agreed by the Assembly, subject to ratification by the States as part of the Government Work Plan debate.

Or, if the Propositions in 1 have been defeated:

2. To agree that:

- i) from the earliest date practicable, in addition to Le Murier and Les Voies Schools and St Anne's School in Alderney, States'-maintained secondary education shall be delivered through an 11-18 learning partnership across three 11-16 schools at La Mare de Carteret, Les Beaucamps and St Sampson's and a sixth form centre at Les Varendes; and
- ii) before the end of 2021 the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture shall submit a policy letter which allows the States to make the resolutions necessary to put this model into effect, including the estimated capital and revenue costs and the appropriate delegations of authority to the Policy & Resources Committee.

Or, if the Propositions in 1 and 2 have been defeated:

3.

3.1 To agree that sixth form education, in the States'-maintained secondary sector, should continue to be provided within an 11-18 setting, rather than in a stand-alone sixth form college and to direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture to design the optimal model for providing secondary education in Guernsey which retains an 11-18 educational offer inside the States'-maintained secondary sector, based as equitably as possible, on the following:

- three 11-18 schools based at existing educational sites;
- ensuring that the intake is such that the 11-16 section of the schools are of roughly the same size;
- including at one school site the main sixth form centre;

- facilitating sixth form 'satellites' at the other two school sites working together in partnership with the main centre; and
- maximising vocational and academic option mix between the sixth form centre and The Guernsey Institute.

Or if Proposition 3.1 has been defeated:

3.2 To agree that sixth form education, in the States'-maintained secondary sector, should continue to be provided within an 11-18 setting, rather than in a stand-alone sixth form college, and to direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture to design the optimal model for providing secondary education in Guernsey which retains an 11-18 educational offer inside the States'-maintained secondary sector, based as equitably as possible, on the following:

- three 11-16 schools based at existing educational sites;
- ensuring that the intake is such that these schools are of roughly the same size;
- including at one of the 11-16 school sites a sixth form centre;
- seeking to investigate, develop and facilitate opportunities to continue post-16 studies, including A levels, where practicable, at the other two school sites through partnership with the sixth form centre; and
- maximising vocational and academic option mix between the sixth form centre and The Guernsey Institute.

And if the Propositions in either 3.1 or 3.2 have been approved:

3.3 To approve 'Secondary & Post-16 Education Reorganisation' as a project in the capital portfolio, subject to the States approving the relevant Propositions in the Government Work Plan policy letter which is being considered by the States later in July 2021.

3.4 To direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture to work in conjunction with the Policy & Resources Committee to deliver the proposals outlined in Propositions 3.1 or 3.2 above within the delegated capital budget and ongoing revenue costs as proposed in the policy letter.

Or, if Proposition 3.4 has been defeated:

3.5 To direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture to work in conjunction with the Policy & Resources Committee to return to the States as soon as practicable with proposals to deliver the proposals outlined in Propositions 3.1 or 3.2 above

within the delegated capital budget and ongoing revenue costs as proposed in the policy letter.

Or, if the Propositions in 1, 2 and 3 have been defeated:

4.

4.1 To agree that from the earliest date practicable, alongside Le Murier, Les Voies and St. Anne's in Alderney, States' maintained secondary education should be delivered through an 11-18 learning partnership across three 11-16 schools at Les Beaucamps, St. Sampson's and Les Varendes and a Sixth Form Centre co-located at Les Varendes, maximising the use of the existing estate and optimising equitable educational outcomes, taking into account equitable curriculum choice, access to subject specialist teachers, pupil teacher ratios and class sizes.

And if Proposition 4.1 has been approved,

4.2 To note that:

- a) The capital cost of reorganising secondary and post 16 education is anticipated to be substantially lower than those set out in the Policy Letter in table 8 in paragraph 9.4; and
- b) The ongoing revenue cost is anticipated to be lower, in the medium term, than both the current revenue costs associated with these phases of education and the cost of the option set out in this Policy Letter;

and to agree that revenue savings should be reinvested in improving the educational offer and student experience.

4.3 To direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture, having consulted with school staff, to return to the States with the propositions necessary to put the model described in the preceding propositions into effect and to include in its proposals measures to upgrade facilities at each of the school sites to make better and more efficient use of the existing estate, including mitigation for existing constrictions due to the design or layout, plus any other measures considered practicable to improve the student and staff experience and support improved educational outcomes.

- 4.4 To note the interdependencies between the 11-18 learning partnership and Le Murier, Les Voies and St. Anne's in Alderney, and to agree the principle that the reorganisation of secondary and post 16 education within that learning partnership does not negatively impact – and wherever possible aligns or indeed positively impacts – the provision of education in these other settings.
- 4.5 To agree that Les Ozouets should be developed solely as the site of The Guernsey Institute, and to direct the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture to progress the development of The Guernsey Institute at Les Ozouets, as agreed in Proposition 2, 'Transforming Education Programme & Putting Into Effect The Policy Decisions Made By The States In 2018', Billet XVI 2019, as a priority.
- 4.6 To approve 'Secondary & Post 16 Education Reorganisation' as a project in the capital portfolio, subject to ratification by the States as part of the Government Work Plan debate.

Or, if the Propositions in 1, 2, 3 and 4 have been defeated:

5. To agree that:

- i) from the earliest date practicable, alongside Le Murier, Les Voies and St. Anne's in Alderney, States' maintained secondary education should be delivered through an 11-18 learning partnership, including sixth form studies, in a genuine 'three-school model', i.e. from three locations, with sixth form studies being delivered at one or more of those locations; and
- ii) before the end of 2021 the Committee *for* Education, Sport & Culture shall submit a policy letter which allows the States to make the resolutions necessary to put this model into effect, including the estimated capital and revenue costs and to give the appropriate delegations of authority to the Policy & Resources Committee.

Or, if the Propositions in 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 have been defeated:

6. To agree that the Review called for in the policy letter entitled 'Review of the Structure of Secondary & Further Education: Next Steps' in Billet d'Etat VIII of 2020, shall be resumed and completed in accordance with the terms of reference laid out in that policy letter, save that such Review will be completed by an independent panel, the chair of which panel shall be appointed by the Committee for Education, Sport and Culture's Independent Overseer and that the appointed Chair will be responsible for appointing a further six members with relevant and appropriate skills to the panel and that the panel will submit its report to the Committee for Education, Sport and Culture by December 2021."

Rule 4(3) Information

The alternative Propositions in the amendment will not increase costs committed at this stage beyond those anticipated in the original Propositions. The alternative work streams are all manageable within existing committed resources of the States, without any additional resources being required. Any expenditure which may become incurred beyond that envisaged in the policy letter and original propositions will, under the alternative propositions, require further approval by the States.

Explanatory note

This amendment attempts to use States' meeting time efficiently by organising debate in a way which avoids the need for individual deputies to repeat points through multiple mini-debates on each amendment lodged.

If all the amendments which have been lodged to the Committee for Education, Sport & Culture's proposals on secondary education are debated separately, then there will be a series of quite similar debates, involving inevitable repetition. If, however, this amendment is accepted then the States can have a single debate on all the proposals, both those in policy letter and those in the amendments. Importantly, this amendment also enables amendments to be compared directly against each other in a way that debating them as a series of individual amendments would not. Each deputy would need to speak only once, before voting on the various options at the end of that debate.

*This amendment puts the Committee's proposals first, in proposition 1, before moving on to the various alternatives suggested by amendment **if, and only if**, the Committee's*

proposals have been rejected. Therefore, if the Committee's proposals have majority support in the Assembly, voting will be much quicker as it will negate the need for further rounds of voting.

As well as saving time, this "cascade" approach makes a positive decision far more likely compared to a series of separate votes.

Alternative proposition 2 provides for 3x 11-16 schools at La Mare, Les Beaucampes and St. Sampson's with a Sixth Form Centre at Les Varendes.

Alternative proposition 3 provides for 3x 11-18 schools (as per the Le Tocq/Brouard amendments.)

Alternative proposition 4 provides the 'do minimum' option (as per the Cameron/De Sausmarez amendment.)

Alternative proposition 5 provides for a 3 school model but does not determine their locations.

Alternative proposition 6 is a backstop, just in case all the suggested models are rejected. It simply provides for completion of the previously agreed review.