



OFFICIAL REPORT

OF THE

STATES OF DELIBERATION

OF THE

ISLAND OF GUERNSEY

HANSARD

Royal Court House, Guernsey, Wednesday, 12th March 2014

*All published Official Reports can be found on the
official States of Guernsey website www.gov.gg*

Volume 3, No. 5

ISSN 2049-8284

Present:

Richard J. Collas, Esq., Bailiff and Presiding Officer

Law Officers

H. E. Roberts Esq., Q.C. (H.M. Procureur)
Miss M. M. E. Pullum, Q.C. (H.M. Comptroller)

People's Deputies

St. Peter Port South

Deputies P. A. Harwood, J. Kuttelwascher, B. L. Brehaut,
A. H. Langlois, R. A. Jones

St. Peter Port North

Deputies M. K. Le Clerc, J. A. B. Gollop, P. A. Sherbourne,
R. Conder, M. J. Storey, E. G. Bebb, L. C. Queripel

St. Sampson

Deputies G. A. St Pier, K. A. Stewart, P. L. Gillson,
P. R. Le Pelley, S. J. Ogier, L. S. Trott

The Vale

Deputies M. J. Fallaize, D. B. Jones, L. B. Queripel,
M. M. Lowe, G. M. Collins

The Castel

Deputies D. J. Duquemin, C. J. Green, M. H. Dorey,
B. J. E. Paint, J. P. Le Tocq, S. A. James, M. B. E., A. H. Adam

The West

Deputies R. A. Perrot, A. H. Brouard, A. M. Wilkie,
D. de G. De Lisle, Y. Burford, D. A. Inglis

The South-East

Deputies H. J. R. Soulsby, R. W. Sillars, P. A. Luxon,
M. G. O'Hara, F. W. Quin, M. P. J. Hadley

Representatives of the Island of Alderney

Alternate Alderney Representative R. N. Harvey

The Clerk to the States of Deliberation

J. Torode, Esq. (H. M. Greffier)

Absent at the Evocation

Deputies R. Domaille (*absent de l'Île*); A. R. Le Lièvre (*absent de l'Île*);
A. Spruce (*absent de l'Île*); Alderney Representative L. E. Jean (*absent de l'Île*)

Business transacted

Evocation.....	245
Convocation.....	245
Welcome to Alderney Representative Rowley	245
Welcome and good wishes to Bailiff of Jersey, Sir Michael Birt and the Hon. Michael Beloff QC	245
Billet d'État VI.....	246
I. Election of a Chief Minister to serve until May 2016 – Question Time and secret ballot	246
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 11.00 a.m. and resumed its sitting at 11.10 a.m.</i>	<i>264</i>
Election of a Chief Minister to serve until May 2016 – Results announced – Deputy Le Tocq elected as Chief Minister.....	264
<i>The Assembly adjourned at 11.12 a.m.</i>	<i>264</i>

PAGE LEFT DELIBERATELY BLANK

States of Deliberation

*The States met at 9.30 am in the presence of
His Excellency Air Marshal Peter Walker C.B., C.B.E.
Lieutenant-Governor and Commander-in-Chief of the Bailiwick of Guernsey*

[THE BAILIFF *in the Chair*]

PRAYERS

The Greffier

EVOCATION

CONVOCATION

The Greffier: Billet d'État VI.

To the Members of the States of the Island of Guernsey, I hereby give notice pursuant to Rule 1(4) of the Rules of Procedure that a meeting of the States of Deliberation will be held at the Royal Court House on Wednesday, 12th March 2014 at 9.30 a.m. to consider the Item contained in this Billet which has been submitted for debate.

Welcome to Alderney Representative Rowley

The Bailiff: Members of the States of Deliberation, good morning to you all.

May I begin by extending a very warm welcome on behalf of you all to Alderney Representative Rowley who is sitting this morning for the very first time in this Assembly? Welcome.

10 **Alderney Representative Rowley:** Thank you, sir.

Welcome and good wishes to Bailiff of Jersey, Sir Michael Birt and The Hon. Michael Beloff, QC

15 **The Bailiff:** May I also draw attention to the presence, in the Public Gallery, of the Presiding Officer of the States of Jersey, my brother Bailiff, Sir Michael Birt, who, together with the Hon. Michael Beloff, who is sitting alongside him, is sitting in our Court of Appeal this morning, together also with Sir John Nutting, and they wished to come along and observe the start of our proceedings before they go and open their court very shortly. And, as this may be the last occasion on which Sir Michael sits in the Public Gallery before he retires as Bailiff next January, may I just wish him and Lady Birt all the very best for their retirement and thank him for all that he has done on behalf of this Island, as well as his island in the various Crown offices that he has held. Thank you very much. (*Applause*)

Billet d'État VI

ELECTION OF A CHIEF MINISTER

I. Election of a Chief Minister to serve until May 2016 – Question Time and secret ballot

Article I.

The States are asked:

To elect a sitting Member of the States as Chief Minister to complete the unexpired portion of the term of office of Deputy Peter Andrew Harwood, who has resigned from that office, namely to serve until May 2016, in accordance with Rule 7 of the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees.

20

The Bailiff: I turn now to the business of the day.

As you well know, this is the first election to be held under the new Rules, so this is both a test flight and a maiden flight for our new Rules of Procedure. I have circulated to you all a memorandum, indicating how I intend to interpret those Rules this morning. I will summarise it now, very briefly, by way of a reminder and also for the benefit of those listening on the radio.

25

In a moment, I will ask the supporters of the two candidates formally to propose and second their respective nominees. Then we will pass the hat around. One of the significant changes under the Rules for this election is that Members will be able to ask questions of the two candidates. The Rules provide a maximum of 60 minutes on this occasion for Question Time. Each question is to be limited to 30 seconds and each reply to one minute. The effect of that is that it is possible that only about half of you may be able to ask questions. So, in order to decide who is to be permitted and, by implication, who is not to be permitted to ask a question, I will be selecting questioners by ballot.

30

So shortly I will be inviting you all to place the pink slip that has been provided to you with your name. If you wish to ask a question or may wish to ask a question, I will ask you to hand that up to one of the ushers and, in due course, it will be placed in the hat – Her Majesty's Sheriff has very kindly loaned his hat for this purpose – and when we get to it, I will draw names out of the hat. Once the pink slips have been collected up, each of the two candidates will be entitled to speak for five minutes. Deputy Langlois will speak first, as his nomination was received first in my office and he will be followed by Deputy Le Tocq. Thereafter, we move on to Question Time.

35

I will begin by drawing the first two questioners' names out of the hat before I call the first questioner. As soon as I have called the name of a questioner, 30 seconds will start to run. You will therefore need to have your question ready. If you delay, in any way, you will be eating into the time available for you to ask the question, but all of you will have a forewarning, because you will always know one question in advance if your name is going to be called, so that will give you time to prepare your question.

40

As to the candidates, the 60 seconds that they have allotted to answer a question will begin to run as soon as their name is called and all these time limits will be strictly enforced.

45

The first question will be answered first by Deputy Langlois, then by Deputy Le Tocq and then we will alternate through Question Time.

When 60 minutes have elapsed, a bit like the question master on 'Master Mind' on television, I will allow the last question to be answered by both candidates, but when the last question has been answered that will be the close of Question Time and you will then cast your votes using the voting slips provided, on which your names are written, so that in due course this can be published of those who have supported each candidate. I do not know whether the voting slips have been provided to you already. I think the Greffier has them and they will be handed out at the appropriate time.

50

Whilst we are dealing with matters of procedure, can I just mention three other matters? I can announce that a Billet will be issued on Friday of this week to convene the meeting to fill any vacancies that arise as a result of this morning's election. We know that there will be a vacancy on the Policy Council; there may or may not be a vacancy for Deputy Chief Minister. The meeting to elect persons to fill those vacancies will be held at the end of the month at the regular meeting on 26th March which is already convened for the election of a new Chair of the Scrutiny Committee to replace the late Alderney Representative Arditti, and so that Billet will be issued on Friday so that all these elections are convened before the end of the month.

55

When we come to that meeting, I will be proposing that we take those elections in advance of all the other business for that meeting. Just giving you advanced notice of that; I am not asking you to agree to that today, but when we get to the end of the month, I will propose that we deal with those elections right at the outset of the meeting.

60

65

And just a final point I want to mention is that, once the vacancies have been filled and that Members are in their new seats with the new Policy Council assembled on this bench, I will be proposing to you that the media be invited to come in and take photographs and film States Members in their new seats. I am sure there will be a request. In fact, we have already had a request from the media to do that, so I will be putting that to you, once Members are in their new places.

70

I think that deals with all the house-keeping points that I wanted to raise. Are there any questions from anybody on the procedure that we are going to follow this morning?

Deputy Lester Queripel.

75

Deputy Lester Queripel: Sir, are we allowed two-part questions?

The Bailiff: No. The Rules say that you may ask a question. Once everybody has had an opportunity to ask one question, if the time for question time has not elapsed, you may be able to ask a second question.

80

Deputy Lester Queripel: Thank you, sir.

The Bailiff: No composite questions: single questions.

If there are no other procedural questions, we will now get under way and I turn first to Deputy James. Do you formally confirm that you are proposing Deputy Allister Langlois for the post of Chief Minister?

85

Deputy James: Yes, sir, I do.

The Bailiff: Thank you. Deputy O'Hara, do you formally second Deputy Langlois' nomination?

90

Deputy O'Hara: I do, sir.

The Bailiff: Thank you, very much. And Deputy Duquemin, do you formally propose Deputy Le Tocq for the post of Chief Minister?

95

Deputy Duquemin: I do, sir.

The Bailiff: And Deputy St Pier, do you formally second Deputy Le Tocq?

Deputy St Pier: Yes, I do, sir.

100

The Bailiff: Thank you very much. Can I now invite those who wish to or may wish to ask a question to hand the pink slips that have been provided to you for this purpose; hand those pink slips to an usher for them to be placed in the hat. Anybody who wishes or may wish to ask a question, please hand out your pink slip.

105

Now, I have had a request that Members be permitted to remove jackets if they wish to do so and I grant permission.

Any more slips? No. Well, I wish all the best of luck to both candidates and we will now begin with Deputy Allister Langlois who may speak in favour of his candidacy for five minutes.

Deputy Langlois.

110

Deputy Langlois: Thank you, sir.

Sir, I would like to thank the Assembly and my proposer and seconder most humbly for this opportunity to put myself forward as a candidate for the office of Chief Minister. I come before you as a Guernseyman with considerable wider experience of 15 years living in the UK and working extensively outside the Island since my return.

115

I have had the good fortune to develop effectively three careers: the first as a further and higher education lecturer, supporting students across a very wide subject range, mainly involving management, finance, statistics and economics.

In 1989, my entrepreneurial spirit got the better of me and I established a business consultancy company, which has traded successfully for 25 years. Together with the co-founder, I led a consultancy team serving a broad client base across every economic sector, but especially for Government and in financial services in Guernsey and further afield. This has included work for, amongst others, the UK Department for Education, the Cabinet Office and the Treasury.

120

Much of this work has given me a very firm foundation in strategy and corporate policy, a cornerstone in the Policy Council's co-ordination responsibilities. I have had some 14 years political involvement with the States of Guernsey as well as serving on the Education, Treasury and Resources and Social Security

125

130 Departments, I have taken the lead on Employment and Remuneration matters, first as Chairman of PSRC and, more recently, as Policy Council lead on those matters. This, of course, includes my work on the Public Servants' Pension Scheme. As many people have remarked, I am not scared of taking on the more difficult jobs.

135 With regard to external relations, I totally endorse the policy of spreading the load of travelling in specific external relations projects amongst Minsters and, if elected, would plan to continue that, because a Chief Minister should allocate enough time, both to external relations and to States' work within the Island. I also believe that in the remainder of this term, the position of Alderney and its relationship with Guernsey must be a priority. Within Guernsey, both through my professional career and later as a States' political representative, I have had direct involvement with every single States Department.

140 I pause at this moment to pay an unreserved tribute to the outgoing Chief Minister. Deputy Harwood stepped up to the plate. He has done an excellent job and it is essential that we should put ourselves in the right position to build on that. But, sir, let us consider carefully where we are in the electoral cycle that is so important to the achievement for the States of Guernsey. It is foolish to think that we can ignore political realities. A year from now, this Assembly will be entering a period of electioneering. I will not be taking part in that, as I will be standing down from the States in 2016. Therefore, if elected, I will be able to concentrate 100% on the Chief Minister role, free of electoral pressures.

145 The new Assembly in 2016 will have a significant choice of talent and experience when another Policy Council is elected. Several issues deserve particular mention. I believe that any incoming Chief Minister must respect the process of the States Review Committee and should not be seeking to change its direction after so much work has been done. As with all policy matters in our consensus system, ultimately the decision will be made by the States.

150 In population, significant changes are being considered, after extensive consultation. Once again, in this area, the most important task will be bringing proposals before the States soon so that all Members can decide. The Personal Tax, Benefits and Pensions Review has advanced significantly. If elected, I will plan to continue my central involvement in this, as a longer term view of Guernsey's fiscal strategy is urgently required.

155 In conclusion, I offer the chairmanship, leadership and skills and experience needed to complete the States programme for this term. Today, we are electing a Chief Minister for the whole States, to see through the programme, the planned programme. All the Members must be engaged with implementation. We cannot afford to drift into semi-executive government when we still have a consensus system. I offer courage, integrity and resolve. Let us all work together to complete solid achievements while making difficult decisions. As my contribution, I will ensure that my time commitment and dedication to the Island of Guernsey are unreserved.

160 Thank you. (*Applause*)

The Bailiff: Next, Deputy Le Tocq may speak for five minutes.

Deputy Le Tocq.

165 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Thank you, Mr Bailiff.

I, too, would like to thank my proposer and seconder, and also particularly honour the work done by Deputy Harwood as Chief Minister, who I have enjoyed working alongside greatly over the last two years.

170 Sir, I do not like talking about myself and I am certain Members of this Assembly would probably unanimously agree that we have heard quite enough about me recently, but I do love talking about these Islands. I love talking about Guernsey, where I was born and brought up, schooled and shaped. I love talking about our unique history, our heritage and our peculiar constitutional relationship with the UK, through the Crown; our culture; our unique language; our identity. And sir, in so doing, I often will talk about John Le Tocq, but actually one Jean Le Tocq to be precise, who lived at Albecq in the 1300's. In 175 Guernsey's ancient tongue, Norman French, there is a long ballad, sometimes referred to as *La Déscente des Aragousais* or the *Ballade d'Yvain de Galles* which talks about the invasion of a Welshman, actually, and some French mercenaries, hired by the King of France at the time, to try and regain these Islands that were lost at the time of King John.

180 Now, this Jean Le Tocq lived at Albecq in the 1300's. He was a shepherd and the ballad, which I will not go into do it now, because we have not got time, some 20-odd stanzas of it, but the ballad recounts him getting up early one morning and at Albecq he was able to see Evan and his mercenaries arrive and land and he grabbed a passing horse. It seems that public transport in those days was more reliable than it is today, perhaps. And he grabs this horse. It just seems to have been passing by and mounts it and then runs around between Parish to Parish crying, 'aux armes', trying to form a militia to protect the Island against 185 this invasion.

He was misunderstood to begin with. Now, this may be due to his Castel-ian accent in Torteval, I am not too sure. But, clearly to begin with people did not understand quite what he was doing or what he was

190 actually trying to protect people from, but, bit by bit, people gathered and in the end an army of some 800 was assembled and, in fact, the conflict that ensued is marked today in place names nearby. Not far from where we assemble today is Battle Lane. Also Rouge Rue, which is said to be named after the blood that flowed down that hill after so many were slaughtered.

195 In the end, that ballad recounts, the enemy was chased from our shores with a little help from the Governor of the day and our unique Island life continued. *Plus ça change*, some people may say. It seems to me, never mind what you may think constitutes the role of the Chief Minister, it should certainly be this, to be able to speak up for and about Guernsey, in an articulate, memorable and passionate way, often off the cuff and at the drop of a hat; to be able to represent these Islands effectively in an often suspicious and hostile outside world; to be able to gather and galvanise the support of fellow Islanders in like manner and to pool resources and act for the common good; to rally, to define and defend our ancient rights and lifestyles in words, if not by the sword.

200 Indeed, this is what I have been doing for the last two years as Deputy Chief Minister, alongside Deputy Harwood. I find it a privilege and thoroughly enjoy doing so and, moreover, I promise and assure this Assembly that that is exactly what I intend to continue to do whatever the outcome of today's vote is; whatever post I hold and whatever title you chose to give me.

205 For my ancient Albecq ancestor had no rank or title. He simply did what I believe every Islander should do and what we are certainly called to do now. He did the right thing for Guernsey. (*Applause*)

The Bailiff: Now, if the Deputy Greffier will pass me the hat, I will in a moment draw out the first questions.

210 Give it a shake. In a moment, I will be calling the first questioner, who will be Deputy Lowe and Deputy Lowe will be followed by Deputy De Lisle. And, as soon as I have called Deputy Lowe's name, 30 seconds will start, and so too will the 60 minutes allocated to Question Time. I see it is just about coming up to 9.54 a.m. Why don't we wait till the clock says exactly 9.54 a.m. precisely and then we will start?

The first question will be for Deputy Langlois first. Deputy Lowe.

215 **Deputy Lowe:** Thank you, sir.

Would the candidates please inform States' Members how they would see sharing the role for external affairs and whether they would be wanting to travel themselves or whether they would go through the same route as Deputy Harwood used to do and share the load to the appropriate Minister?

220 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

225 **Deputy Langlois:** Thank you, sir, and thank you for the question. I have, of course, in my speech outlined some aspects of that already and I certainly believe that it totally appropriate for us to share that role. I think that there are occasions on which the person with the title Chief Minister is expected to be in attendance, but I see no point in them trying to invest every single aspect of the job and the wider aspects of Commerce and Employment and so on and so forth.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

230 **Deputy Le Tocq:** It is very much a case of the right man for the right job or the right person for the right job. I have enjoyed working particularly with regard to Europe and France and relations with Brussels. I think, for me, the ability to be able to speak and communicate in French has been an advantage and has helped those relationships, but actually what matters most is that we assign – in the way that Deputy Harwood has done, indeed – different matters to different people and it is a matter of diarising it, as well, because we do not want any particular individual being too busy.

The Bailiff: The third questioner will be Deputy Le Pelley, who will follow Deputy De Lisle.

240 **Deputy De Lisle:** Sir, given the potential new role as Chief Minister, I would like to address a question to Deputy Le Tocq and, given his statements in the past that the Church comes first in his order of priorities, how does he intend to reconcile his activities with church and state?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

245 **Deputy Le Tocq:** I am willing to answer. I answer this question, in fact, and question like it –

Deputy Trott: On a point of process –

250 **The Bailiff:** I am going to stop the clock.

Deputy Trott: Sir. On a point of process, is it acceptable for Members to ask the question of just a single candidate or should all questions be addressed to both?

255 **The Bailiff:** All questions should be addressed to both. The reason I was hesitating – and Deputy Langlois will have a chance to answer the question as well – is that I am not sure that this is within the Rules. I am not sure that this is within the mandate of the Policy Council. I look to Her Majesty's Procureur.

260 **The Procureur:** That is the Rules which you have drawn attention to. You have, if I may respectfully say, sir, very wisely indicated that you will allow a certain degree of flexibility, but we have to have regard, as you said in your notes, to the spirit of that Rule. We said the questions must relate to matters of policy within the mandates of the Policy Council. And that, of course, does allow each of the candidates to sensibly answer and for answers to be compared. Questions which can only possibly relate to one candidate are not within the spirit of the Rules and I do not know whether Deputy Langlois is prepared to deal with that in the general way.

265 **The Bailiff:** Yes. I do not know –

If Deputy Langlois is happy to answer the question as well, then, as you say, candidates can answer it within the scope of the mandate of the Policy Council, so yes. We will restart the clock and Deputy Le Tocq.

270 **Deputy Le Tocq:** In terms of my previous employment in being senior minister of a church, I said two years ago, and it still stands, that I had spent the previous four years ensuring that I handed on to a new executive pastor that we brought in, who now leads the church and whilst I am still a member of the church and I am still involved on Sundays, occasionally preaching, actually my leadership of that church has dramatically changed. So, my involvement was very much leading it before I was previously a member of this Assembly. That is no longer the case.

280 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Thank you sir.

Sir, I have made it clear all the way through this campaign that I am going to give 100% to this job if appointed. I am in a position to do so. I am further helped by the fact that, having said that I would stand down after two years, there will be no distractions for electioneering or whatever in due course and I have very limited family obligations now and therefore that, combined with the end of my business involvement, leaves me totally free to commit full time.

285 **The Bailiff:** The fourth questioner will be Deputy Conder, immediately after Deputy Le Pelley.

290 **Deputy Le Pelley:** In their submissions to the States Review Committee, did the candidates encourage the Committee to propose a retention of Guernsey's traditional committee system of government, or did they encourage the committee to propose the more executive or ministerial system of government?

295 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois. You have switched your microphone off.

Deputy Langlois: Thank you.

Sir, my submission to the States Review Committee was fairly early in the piece and I do remember majoring very much on the possibility, in the future, of having a foreign minister, which I still believe should still be explored. In terms of the straight binary choice, executive or non-executive government, I wish to make it absolutely clear that I think we are in great danger and we could be in great danger of throwing out the baby with the bathwater; of doing something which... We have got a system here that works and which many of us love and therefore change for change's sake would not be acceptable to me.

Beyond that, I think there are plenty of evidence that executive government has had its weaknesses when tried in similar communities.

305 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Tocq.

310 **Deputy Le Tocq:** My submission, actually, was an amendment to the current system, reducing the number of Members in this Assembly and, indeed, the number of Departments and Members on those Departments. I also said, in my submission, that I did not think that Guernsey was anywhere near ready to have an executive form of government in my lifetime.

The Bailiff: The fifth questioner will be Deputy Trott, immediately after Deputy Conder.

315 **Deputy Conder:** Thank you, sir.
Overseas Aid falls within the mandate of the Policy Council. Do you consider that Guernsey is making an appropriate contribution?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

320 **Deputy Le Tocq:** When I was Chairman of Overseas Aid, we sought to increase the contribution that we gave to the levels that were recommended by the UN. It is a fact that, whilst we increased, we are still way below the recommended levels per GDP that we should be giving as an Island. At the same time, I recognise that much is done in our Island compared to other places in terms of private giving, but I would still recommend increasing the amount that we give to overseas aid.

325 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Thank you, sir.

330 If Members have looked in any detail at my CV, one of my university courses which I did related to Third World Development Studies and therefore the economics of development are very important. All overseas aid, in my view, must be very targeted. The question of how much we give, I have been completely consistent in the past, if you want to check back on the records, that I have, every year, consistently expressed the view that we should be gradually raising our contribution. But how we do that and, more importantly, in many ways, how we sell it as the right thing to do to the public, at a time when there are a lot of focus on our own fiscal issues, which are trivial and meaningless compared with many areas in world, is a big question. But yes, we should be aiming to raise that contribution.

335 **The Bailiff:** The sixth question will be from Deputy Fallaize, immediately after Deputy Trott.

340 **Deputy Trott:** Thank you, sir.

Sir, with external relations work costing the same, in real terms today as it did in the last term, but now split between at least four members of the Policy Council, can the differential in the Chief Minister's salary be justified and, if not, why not?

345 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Thank you, sir.

350 I am not sure if this is within the Policy Council's remit, but I am very happy to answer. I was unaware, when the job evaluation was carried out, that the assumption was made that all of that overseas work would be done by the Chief Minister. I had no awareness of that. If that is the case, then it maybe does need revisiting, but, other than the fact that you work 24/7 in this sort of job, I do not quite see the reason why it should be different, because if you are travelling, you are travelling. If you are at home, you are still working, because that is the sort of the job it is and, therefore, we may revisit it. I would be very happy to bring it before the Policy Council for that consideration.

355 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Tocq.

360 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Deputy Trott is right that the amount spent now is comparable to the amount spent when he was Chief Minister, although the amount spent per Minister has obviously gone down, but Deputy Trott also often says and I think it is on his bio, on the web, that being Chief Minister of Guernsey is like being Chairman of a FTSE 100 company and so I think it is up to those outside who set our pay levels, if you like, our remuneration, to decide and make that judgement. In order to do that, there actually needs to be quite a lot of work done on the role of the Deputy, the role of Minister or Chairman and that is work that yet is to happen and I know that every pay review body has said there is not enough information on that.

365 **The Bailiff:** The seventh question will be from Deputy Ogier, immediately after Deputy Fallaize.

Deputy Fallaize: Thank you, sir.

370 Thinking purely domestically, are the candidates able to explain what they regard as the key functions of a Chief Minister within the Island in terms of domestic policy making and the relationship of the role of Chief Minister with the rest of the States?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

375 **Deputy Le Tocq:** I think the first function of the Chief Minister is to enable and to oil the wheels of communication. Deputy Harwood has gone a long way in doing that and I am talking, particularly to our electorate, first of all, in helping them to understand the sort of issues that we are dealing with. We have to, I think, have a senior leader, whatever he is called. In fact, it is a role of certainly all senior leaders in this Assembly, for all Deputies, to be involved in that. So, the Chief Minister needs to lead in communicating
380 effectively and finding new means of communication so that people understand. People, I have particularly grasped, do not understand all that we deal with and we need to do our utmost to make sure they have every opportunity to do so, and that goes for within the Assembly and within the States as a whole.

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

385 **Deputy Langlois:** Sir, I believe very much that the job of the Chief Minister is to receive careful and accurate briefing from senior staff in the right areas so that his or her time is freed up to relate more closely to every States Member. There are 47 people in this Assembly and it is very important that I, if it is me, and the other 46 have an awareness of what each way is thinking and that, as I see, is the central role. That
390 clearly knocks on into an area where we need to relate closely to the groups of Members who make up each Department, because there is no point in something coming to the Chief Minister as a surprise when a Department has been working on something for some time.

The Bailiff: The next in line for questioning will be Deputy Lester Queripel, immediately after Deputy Ogier.
395

Deputy Ogier: Thank you, sir.

The elephant in the room, well one of them for me, is attendance. Deputy Le Tocq, when running last time for Chief Minister, indicated that what could perhaps have been described as patchy attendance in his
400 previous terms would improve. That seems to me, this has not occurred and figures for 2013 bear this out. Can we receive an idea from the candidates how they envisage their attendance will be and how their attendance has been?

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

405 **Deputy Langlois:** Sir, I do not keep records of my attendance, because by and large it is nearly 100%. I have missed one or two meetings, because of a trip to see the family. For example, when I became a grandfather I was very pleased to not be here for a couple of days and I think that is fair enough, but I will carry on with that intention. I think if you are here to serve the Guernsey public for this period of time, it
410 absolutely goes without saying that the attendance in both these meetings and in sub-group meetings and board meetings comes first.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

415 **Deputy Le Tocq:** It is true that my attendance previously, up to 2008, when I did not stand was 80%, I think it was at the time, and the way in which we record attendance of course is a bit bizarre if you look at it in that fashion. So, for example, I have had arguably quite a busy role in the way that I have worked as Deputy Chief Minister and the Home Department Minister. We have meetings in the mornings at the Home Department and Policy Council in the afternoon. Sometimes those meetings have overlapped and I have
420 been late for Policy Council, but it cannot be recorded as States business, because you are just late or not. At the same time, Deputy Harwood and myself have co-ordinated holidays and there have been more than one occasion where I have been on holiday and he has called a meeting of the Policy Council while I have been away and I have not been able to return for that reason. So, there are reasons why my attendance is not 100%, but it is much higher than it was a few years ago and I would continue to ensure that I am at all of
425 the important meetings and obviously serving to my best capacity.

The Bailiff: The ninth question will be from Deputy Perrot, after Deputy Lester Queripel.

Deputy Lester Queripel: Thank you, sir.

430 We have a major problem in the States regarding a person or persons leaking information to the media at Policy Council level. If you are elected, will you be addressing this extremely unprofessional, totally unacceptable and damaging issue?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

435

Deputy Le Tocq: One of the things – it surprises me sometimes as well – but one of the things I seem to be able to do is to bring different people together and to gain trust in doing so, which I understand is behind the reason why I have got the majority of the support of the Policy Council and there are differing views around that and even those who support me have differing views on political issues. But I would seek to ensure that we have got good respect and understanding in terms of confidentiality and in terms of the dealing with the issues by getting people together on a regular basis to ensure that leaks do not occur.

440

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

445

Deputy Langlois: I am fully aware, sir, that as Chief Minister, you do not have executive authority over your Ministers, but I take the point about the question that is being asked. Deputy Queripel will recall that, earlier in my career, I also had a hobby with football refereeing and I used to carry my yellow and red cards with me. I still carry them in my case. As Chief Minister, I would not be able to use the red card to any effect, but I can assure you there is no real problem about giving a yellow card when I believe that a transgression has been there. That is one way of dealing with it and certainly we have to be firm.

450

The Bailiff: And next in line for questioning will be Deputy Laurie Queripel, after Deputy Perrot.

Deputy Perrot: Without prejudging the conclusion of the Constitutional Investigation Committee which the successful candidate will chair, would the candidates agree with me that in principle it would be appropriate now for the Privy Council to be phased out of the progress of our primary legislation?

455

The Bailiff: Thirty seconds are up.
Deputy Langlois.

460

Deputy Langlois: Certainly, sir, in principle, I have supported the formation of that Committee and I will look forward to the work that it does. I believe that, in relation to that Committee, I have made no undertakings during the last two weeks to anybody about participation in replacement posts and so on and so forth. I think we may need to come back to the States, if I was appointed, to suggest that Deputy Harwood would be a very appropriate candidate for staying on that Committee, not necessarily just staying on that Committee because his input is going to be invaluable, but in principle, yes, it must go in the direction that Deputy Perrot is suggesting.

465

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

470

Deputy Le Tocq: I would not disagree with what my colleague, Deputy Langlois has said. I would only add that I am fully aware, as I am sure we all are, that one other Crown Dependency has, for many years, had a greater degree of freedom from the Privy Council process, which seems to have worked very well indeed. I think we should certainly head in that direction.

475

The Bailiff: The next in line for questioning will be Deputy O'Hara, after Deputy Laurie Queripel.

Deputy Laurie Queripel: Thank you, sir.

480 Sir, would the candidates be open or agreeable to the idea of the Policy Council facing the public, say either on a quarterly or half yearly basis, in a Question Time-type forum?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: Absolutely.

485

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Yes, sir, I would have no objection to it, providing that it can be organised in a way that is meaningful and produces appropriate reporting and that, in Guernsey, is not always easily achieved. I

490 think there are dangers in the sense that such an event, if not carefully controlled, can be hijacked and can
lead to an awful lot more work than the good that it can actually do through transparency. But, in principle,
it must be explored.

The Bailiff: And the next questioner will be Deputy Gillson, after Deputy O'Hara.

495

Deputy O'Hara: Thank you, sir.

A press release this week announced, 'Policy Council proposals regarding electricity' when the mandate
of Commerce and Employment includes, 'to advise the States on matters relating to the strategic approach
to utilities'. Do the candidates believe that the Policy Council should take the lead in areas of policy which
500 are explicitly mandated to other States Committees?

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Thank you, sir.

505 This is a very delicate balance that has to be struck. If we take it beyond Guernsey Electricity in its
present form, there are also the question of some of the other States owned bodies such as Aurigny, that
have to be considered and the responsibility relating to who makes decisions regarding such things as
lifeline, work-line, services run by Aurigny to Alderney, the electricity supply and so on, we must be in a
position to have expert input from those who know what they are talking about. There is no point a group of
510 States Members trying to redesign a cable system, but, at the same time, we have to have political control
over the policy of this and the policy in electricity is going to be an extremely important and therefore must
have a central involvement.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

515

Deputy Le Tocq: The Policy Council is responsible for policy co-ordination and where policies like
energy policy impinge upon more than just one particular issue that is in one mandate, so energy policy
impinges upon transport links, it impinges upon infrastructure issues as well, it is important the Policy
Council has a role in that, but it needs to be in conjunction with and in participation with the various
520 mandates of the Departments. That is what co-ordination is about and, so, I agree with the comments that
you have made. It does look confusing sometimes, but it is important that the policy co-ordination is done
by Policy Council.

The Bailiff: And the next questioner will be Deputy Gollop, after Deputy Gillson.

525

Deputy Gillson: Sir, do the candidates view the role of the Policy Council as being to co-ordinate
policy development or to lead and initiate policy development?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

530

Deputy Le Tocq: That is a very, very good question. I think the Policy Council can actually do both,
but in terms of initiating it, it is this Assembly that needs to work together to do that so the Policy Council
takes the lead. Someone needs to take a lead and the various policy groups that I have been involved in, we
try our best to engage and we are continuing to do so with as many different stakeholders as possible,
535 including, for example, in terms of the population policy, there have been workshops and forums which
have helped to do that. I think this is a learning curve, but someone needs to do it and, at the moment, I see
Policy Council obviously co-ordinating it and in certain instances has to initiate things when a block
between departmental mandates.

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

540

Deputy Langlois: Sir, I have a concern. The straight answer to the question is definitely co-ordination.
That is what the mandate says and that is what a consensus system of government implies. However, there
is a difficulty and I think it has been partly displayed in the first part of this term and that is that once you
545 turn up for a regular meeting you get a bunch of people sitting together with a particular interest in a
specific area: FEPG, the Social Policy Group, or whatever, it is all too easy to forget after an hour of the
meeting that there are Departments with responsibilities in these particular areas and therefore it has got to,
I think, come from the Departments, from the Members, and then feed into the groups rather than the
groups effectively ending up formulating policy.

550

The Bailiff: The next questioner in line will be Deputy Wilkie, after Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: Thank you, sir.

555 The States, last November, proved ‘we all matter, eh?’ by supporting unanimously the Disability Strategy. Will the two candidates continue to push, cajole and drive this Disability Strategy forward, perhaps in a chairmanship role and that might include more resources for social policy?

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

560 **Deputy Langlois:** Deputy Gollop uses ‘push, cajole and persuade’. He has been sitting on my Board for the last two years, maybe those words were very carefully chosen, because I think, on occasions, there is a lot of pushing and cajoling that goes on with particular Members. But, yes, this has got to happen. This has got to now be moved forward. I think the difficulty is, of course, that the Chief Minister can only do this in conjunction, especially on this issue, with Treasury, because there is a price tag involved and therefore it is not as simple as saying we simply put more money to it.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

570 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Yes, for me, the unanimous support for social policy issues like the Disability Inclusion Strategy was one of the successes of the first half of this term and one we can be proud of, but we must not lose momentum on it. Deputy Harwood, at the moment, because he is on the Social Policy Group, *ex officio*, is Chair of the Legislation Implementation Group for that. I would want him to continue to do that, because we need to see the next phase come forward and it is about working together, effectively, finding the right people for the right jobs.

575 **The Bailiff:** And the next in line will be Deputy Sherbourne, after Deputy Wilkie.

Deputy Wilkie: Thank you, sir.

580 I would like to thank Deputy Gollop for stealing my thunder here. Bearing in mind the leap forward in social policy over the last two years, i.e. the Mental Health Strategy and Disability Inclusion Strategy, what is the candidates’ vision for the progression of social policy for the next two years?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

585 **Deputy Le Tocq:** I think it has been heartening to a large section of our community to see that we do care and this Assembly, perhaps more than its predecessors and in difficult times, has focused its attention on social policy issues. I would certainly want, if elected as Chief Minister, to continue that, because I feel that that is something that I have personal interest in and personal remit in and can get different groups together. I would want to see, therefore, that we have all the resources available and that does not mean just within the States, but, also, pooling the resources that are available outside.

590 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: It would be extremely odd, sir, for a Social Security Minister to give anything other than a similar answer to this question. I think that progress has been made. I particularly am pleased with the fact that we are consciously forming partnerships with the voluntary sector and with the third sector in the right sort of way, because I think there is huge scope for a lot of the social policy implementation to be done jointly with that sector and I would want to continue along that line. I also believe that the Social Policy Group has got to take full account, particularly of the Social Services Department and the Social Security Department and their remits in order to make this happen.

The Bailiff: And the next questioner will be Deputy Dorey, after Deputy Sherbourne.

605 **Deputy Sherbourne:** Thank you, sir. My personal pledge in the last election was to focus on enabling and empowering our people to play a full part in our democracy and to use their intelligence and capacities to the benefit of all. What will you bring to the role of Chief Minister and Chairman of the Policy Council that will enable and empower States’ Boards and Committees to achieve their aspirations?

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

610

Deputy Langlois: I think I would bring approachability and a willingness to get alongside all States Members. I have already decided that, if successful today, I will be having a programme of meeting individually with all States Members in the near future in order to fully understand, further understand, their own aspirations and their own fears for the remainder of this term and that would be combined with a more regular attendance at board meetings when you can get a feel for what parts of the organisation are trying to do. Empowerment is absolutely essential.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: Engagement, also, with our community in more forums, in more areas, so that not only do we feel empowered, but that they feel empowered and engaged. That is vital, I think. I think a Chief Minister can help to do that, probably because of the sometimes wrong expectation that people have upon any senior leader, but he can choose to take the initiative in doing that and when he does so, he opens a door for other Members, other politicians to also come through and engage with our electorate and we need to do that and when we do that and we talk together in that environment, I believe, we bring people together and behind the sort of policies we want to see implemented.

The Bailiff: The hat is now empty. We will have a question from Deputy Dorey.

Deputy Dorey: Thank you, Mr Bailiff. The States' Population Policy is to keep population at the same level as March 2007: 61,175. What population level policy do the candidates support and why?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: I have said that I believe and we have proven it in a way, but we find it very difficult to control population and, indeed, we have got an aging demographic. We have got an issue to not just raise the number, which is a start number, but the amount of people in work. That is going to be very, very difficult for us and we need to all work together to make sure that the population that we have is the right balance of those in work, the right sorts of people paying into the system, paying into our income generating taxation systems, social security systems as well as supporting those that are retired. That is going to be always before us as a small Island and will have to come up with creative ways of dealing with that. I, at the moment, believe that our population will continue to increase until we have got a manageable policy that enables us to target resources.

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Thank you, sir.

I think the problem with the population target in its current form or limit, cap, in its current form, is that we simply do not have the powers, as a government to enforce it, to make it happen. It is subject to far more variables and it will continue to be so and I am very aware that the population of Guernsey, sorry, the voters, for many of them, this is an absolutely key issue and they do not want to see more expansion. The problem is that, if that lack of expansion in a particular area leads to a lowering of living standards, greater unemployment and so on and so forth, they will not want that either, so I think this resolution of the current population policy has got to be as swift as possible. I am not sure that we should put a number on it.

The Bailiff: We will now stop the clock. Can I just have an indication by Members standing in their places of anybody who has not yet asked a question and would like to do so? No, well there is nobody. Is there anybody who has asked one question, who would like to ask a second question? We have just have three Members standing, so we will hear your questions in the order in which you stood, which will be Deputy Trott, Deputy Lester Queripel and then Deputy Gollop. So Deputy Trott.

Deputy Trott: Thank you, sir. I am grateful for the second opportunity.

Sir, with more than 30% of our annual GDP held in reserves, as opposed to the United Kingdom with around 80% of their annual GDP in debt, what is the candidates' understanding of our true fiscal position, particularly whether we are actually in deficit or otherwise?

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: As Deputy Trott knows well, because of his early financial training, the precise definition of the meaning of the word 'deficit' is extremely complex and extremely difficult to establish, as you know well. I believe that all we can do is to carry on using the sort of figures we have got and making

sure that we understand where we are in relation to other places. There is no absolute breaking point, even saying that we need a break-even on the annual accounts is not meaningful. A minus figure, a deficit, is only a negative surplus and it is a sliding scale and we have got to maintain our understanding of that. The break-even point is of limited relevance.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: Our liabilities are certainly fewer than the UK and other countries, but we have them and they are somewhat hidden. At the same time some of our assets are also hidden as well and were we to have more fulsome accounting, we would be in a position where we would not just have these 'Churchillised', analysed, statistics, which you can compare against one another, but it is apples and pears, but we will be more able to plan effectively. The improvement of our statistical information has to be on our agenda over the next half of this term.

The Bailiff: Deputy Lester Queripel.

Deputy Lester Queripel: Thank you, sir.

Sir, I rise to seek further clarification in response to an earlier question. When Deputy Harwood was Chief Minister, he recognised the need to improve the levels of communication, both within the States and from the States to the good people of Guernsey. Do you have your own ideas about how those levels of communication can actually be improved?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: More personally, I would value being available to people, maybe via the radio on a regular basis for a personal phone in. I would be very happy to run with those sorts of things, maybe in conjunction with the Chief Executive or something like that. It is well known I make sure of social media. I know that does not contact everybody, but I believe we should communicate on all possible fronts. I mentioned forums before. We have had on policy, on certain social policies a number of forums that have been engaging and got members of the public and other interested bodies together. We need to now supply those opportunities for our electorate to engage with us and us with them on all fronts. It is not either/or for me. It is both/and.

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: I believe I have already made my position clear regarding communication with other Members and the sort of plans I have already got for that, if successful. In terms of engagement with the wider public, I think this is very critical and crucial, we are at a bit of a turning point and that is because at the moment, in various ways, I believe that the vocal minority are actually paid more attention than the silent majority. How you ever get to the silent majority and you open it up and you make sure that you are listening to the silent majority is very difficult, because vocal minorities have changed one or two crucial decisions in this Island in living memory and that must not be allowed to happen when things really matter.

The Bailiff: And Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: Sir, I am the vocal minority. Now, as the new leader, how will you, the candidates, manage the Policy Council fall-out, if one or more Departments overspends and/or faces a vote of no confidence, misguided or not?

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Yes, I think Deputy Gollop sometimes is the vocal minority on the Social Security Board and we both recognise that. The situation faced by an overspend which leads to a vote of no confidence, I think, places both the Chief Minister and the Policy Council in quite a difficult position, because ultimately the Minister, although he has not got executive responsibility, has got to carry responsibility, especially once the reporting of figures is good enough to know that it is happening in the first place, and what we had in the past is one or two situations where that has come about, but it has come about through inadequacy of accounting systems and the like, which I believe are now improving but we have got a long way to go yet.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

735 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Minority is actually important. Whilst majorities can be silent sometimes, we have
seen how minorities need to be listened to and taken note of and around the Policy Council, I believe we
can be more proactive in ensuring that if there are issues that are going to come up, issues of finance and
budgeting, then being proactive in getting the help necessary before that. At the moment, one of the
improvements that has happened in the last 12 months is regular updates on FTP, for example and on
budgetary control for each Department, where each Minister has to give an account for that and that means
740 that whilst it is maybe not a very popular thing, actually, we have more knowledge of what is happening in
real time.

The Bailiff: Are there any more questioners? Deputy De Lisle and then Deputy Trott.

745 **Deputy De Lisle:** Yes, sir. Can I ask the candidates to indicate whether they are in favour of bringing in
new taxes in order to deal with the current deficit, especially in reference to consumer tax, GST has been
mentioned in the past?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

750 **Deputy Le Tocq:** It is certain that we are going to have to find not only savings, which we are currently
finding, but, once we have got our budgets under control, we are going to have to find some other forms of
income in some form of taxation. I have said before and I will say it again, I will need some convincing if
the answer to that is to be GST or GST is to be part of that or any form of that sort of taxation, but I believe
we need to investigate it because there could be worse scenarios and we need to see all of them alongside
755 one another, make our decisions. We did that at such a time as Zero-10. We looked at all the scenarios
properly and we made an informed, intelligent decision at the time. We need to do so again.

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

760 **Deputy Langlois:** I am perfectly aware, sir, that the parallel between Zero-10 and the personal tax
review has been made. There is one crucial difference, however, and that is that Zero-10 could easily have
needed adjustment very shortly after, if other things happened in the outside world. What we are looking at
with the Personal Tax and Benefits Review is the long term and it is absolutely essential, what I am in
765 favour of, to do with new taxes, is I am in favour of an overall balanced debate that has looked at all the
possibilities. If we start a binary debate of is this right or is this wrong, then we will go nowhere because,
funnily enough, I think every member of the public, if asked whether they want to pay more of a particular
tax, I think I could predict the result of that poll.

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott.

770 **Deputy Trott:** Thank you, sir, I am grateful. Sir, what do the candidates believe are the other
candidate's strengths and weaknesses for the post of Chief Minister?

The Bailiff: I am not sure this is within the scope of the mandate –

775 **Deputy Trott:** I could easily add a final sentence, sir, in the knowledge of having worked together
closely as Members of the Policy Council.

780 **The Bailiff:** It is still not within the scope of the mandate of the Policy Council. I think that is not a fair
question. A clever question, but it is not within –
Mr Procureur, do you agree?

The Procureur: I have no question, sir.

785 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Fallaize.

Deputy Fallaize: Thank you, sir. The Policy Council's mandate includes some responsibility for
corporate fiscal policy. At the moment, it is the policy of the States that expenditure increases should be
restrained to no more than RPIX. Do the candidates believe that is sustainable in the long term?

790 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

795 **Deputy Langlois:** Once again, I repeat part of my previous answer and that is that what I think is essential is that the Personal Tax and Benefits Review is regarded as a long-term project, a project which relates to the long term. So, whether a particular indexation is going to work in the long term is, at this stage, a hypothetical question. I certainly believe that there must be some indexation and we must work hard at developing and refining the indexes that we use and their basis, because some of our statistics can occasionally be questioned by people who wish to do so or prove or point.

800 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: I would largely agree with Deputy Langlois on this issue. I think indexation is important. At the moment, looking from where we stand, the current system does not look like it can continue for much longer. Therefore, we need to have that debate. We need to work out how we are going to plan our public finances and spending in the future and that is something that I look forward to this Assembly discussing, debating and deciding policy on.

The Bailiff: Deputy Trott, do you have a legitimate question?

810 **Deputy Trott:** That will be for you to decide, sir. Sir, is the States better operating under a system of managing conflicts or would a system that avoided all conflicts whatsoever be preferable?

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

815 **Deputy Le Tocq:** I do not think avoiding a conflict is living in reality and I think if we manage things properly, if we face up to reality, we are stronger as a result of it. I think that applies to all of life. There is inevitably going to be things that will come to us from leftfield that we do not anticipate. We have got a risk register now, which is something we did not have before so we can properly assess what those issues might be and prepare ourselves for them, if they do reach our shores and I would like to see that built upon and well communicated amongst the whole of the Assembly.

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

825 **Deputy Langlois:** Sir, I find this a slightly surprising question from a previous Chief Minister. I would like to know from Deputy Trott, on another occasion, how practical he feels avoidance of all conflict for the States is even a vague possibility. So, it is rather surprising. I think what we must do is certainly manage conflict. I have had one or two well-known projects on the go recently where there is that requirement and I am absolutely sure that is the only way we can proceed. In doing that, we must always look at the risk of doing nothing, because the easy option is to avoid conflict by doing nothing, but often the downside risk of that is far greater than actually taking action.

The Bailiff: Are there any more? Deputy Burford.

835 **Deputy Burford:** Sir, one of the key strategies within the States' Fiscal and Economic Plan is the Fiscal Framework Strategy which has macro-economic and fiscal objective of a real-term freeze on aggregate States' revenue expenditure. That was from the 2009 Billet. How much longer is this policy tenable?

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

840 **Deputy Langlois:** I think this is a very pertinent question and one which is being certainly discussed within the Personal Tax and Benefit Review – not as we speak, because we are all in here, so we cannot be talking about it at the moment! But no, you are absolutely right, that is a framework; it is a framework which, perhaps, has had its day. I am not then going to say, therefore we should be looking to expand it, but the reality is that there are two pressing forces relating to healthcare and relating to longevity which will, in my view, force us to expand it eventually.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

850 **Deputy Le Tocq:** This Assembly cannot procrastinate. We tend to like to push things back into the future somewhere, but I believe this Assembly will need to address this issue. The real-term freeze cannot continue for much longer, but we needed to get our spending, our budgetary controls, under a tighter control than we have had in the past, but we all have to address that. This Assembly will need to address it,

before we enter into the next Assembly, because we need to send a signal very clearly into the future in order to have the sort of confidence that we want to have as an Island community.

855

The Bailiff: Any more questions? Deputy Lester Queripel.

Deputy Lester Queripel: Thank you, sir.

If elected, will you be recommending any new initiatives to assist our friends in Alderney?

860

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: I would like very much to work on the building work that has been done by Deputy Harwood. I believe that is something the whole of the Policy Council needs to get behind, indeed the whole of this Assembly does, because Alderney is in a unique situation and we sometimes deal with particular issues with Alderney, but we need to look at the whole. One of the advantages of Alderney, they do not have the population control issues that we do and that should be a distinct advantage in us helping them to build their population and build on their economy, build on the businesses that can be attracted to Alderney to give them the sort of assurance that they need for their future.

865

870

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: I mentioned the relationship with Alderney as a priority in my speech and I meant what I said. However, I think in the particular phrasing of this question, it would be presumptuous and patronising for us to say that, as a Chief Minister, we would initiate new moves relating to the other Island. The whole thing is neutral and you have got the 1948 agreement there. Has that seen better days? Maybe. And is the Alderney Liaison Group enough to actually help each side to move forward? There is no doubt about it, the other side of the whole thing is that, of course, supplying transfer services to Alderney is a costly operation per head and like us they have got their financial issues as well.

875

880

The Bailiff: Deputy Gollop.

Deputy Gollop: Yes, some of us have seen, some of us have not, the proposed new Transport Strategy from one Department, but will the successful Chief Minister undertake to drive forward a new approach on behalf of the entire States and Policy Council and not just on behalf of the Department?

885

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Sorry, I am slightly lost for words, because I am not sure what I am being asked to undertake, but in relation to the Transport Strategy, yes I have seen the draft policy letter and I think it is probably the most inappropriate audience ever to leak the contents of that to this Assembly here today, while it is still under discussion, but what we must do is to make sure that the Transport Strategy has got practicality in it, has got affordability in it, and all those other things.

890

But in reply to your question, I am not quite sure in what direction we are heading to do with the States and the Department. They have both got a role to play.

895

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: I think the role of the Chief Minister in this respect, bearing in mind he has one vote like anyone else, is to ensure that we have proper informed debate on various options available for us and that we minimise the amount of flip-flopping that has happened on certain of these polarising issues, so that we can send a clear signal to Guernsey of what we intend to do and we can do that in a civil way and a mature way. I believe we can do that, given the right sort of leadership.

900

The Bailiff: Does anyone else wish to ask a question of the candidates? Deputy De Lisle, then Deputy Dorey.

905

Deputy De Lisle: Sir, a question on the Zero-10 corporate tax regime, to the candidates. Are you in favour of the retention of the existing Zero-10 regime and would you support a wider section of industry to be taxed at 10% to reduce the deficit and lighten the burden on the individual taxpayer?

910

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

915 **Deputy Le Tocq:** My own personal views, which again are my own personal views, I think are well known, and this is part of the debate on our fiscal and economic future that we need to have. In terms of
tweaking the current strategy, we need to be very careful that we do so conscious of what is happening in
terms of our competitors, but I am absolutely confident, in fact, in the board of T&R and its Minister to
look at those things and provide us with the right information, so that this Assembly can make those sorts of
decisions. We will need to make some changes, there is no doubt about that, and what those are at the
920 moment, is too early to say.

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

925 **Deputy Langlois:** Any changes that were made in that area could be sprung upon us quite quickly. I, at that point, would have one vote, whether I am Chief Minister or not at that time, I would have one vote and would make the decision accordingly, as to which way I wanted to go. I think there is a slightly simplistic, if you pardon the word, but a slightly simplistic linkage here between saying, if we are able to raise more money through corporate taxation, we can simply then reduce the load on individuals, because the two are not totally, mutually exclusive. There are far more tunes that have to be played on all of that.

930

The Bailiff: Deputy Dorey.

Deputy Dorey: Could you outline your thoughts on the contents and future of the Government Service Plan?

935

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: Deputy Dorey asks a rather difficult question in view of the time limit. My thoughts on the future of the Government Service Plan are that it is there, it has certain guidance. It provides certain
940 guidance for the remainder of this term and the Policy Council should not totally ignore it. Whether it provides an absolute blue print – a road map, to use the other cliché – as to where we go in the remainder of this term, I do not believe it necessarily does, but I do regard it as having been a useful level of detail to have got to in strategic planning, because that is what you have to do.

945

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: If the role of Policy Council and its Chair is to co-ordinate and be involved in communicating on public policy issues like this, then it is important that we keep the message simple. We keep it clear. I remember Deputy Duquemin standing up and saying this page is enough to communicate
950 effectively. Sometimes, we need to be reminded of that because we have got to have some degree of constraint and focus, so that we can match and mark our delivery appropriately and prove that we can achieve what we set out to achieve. So, I support it, but there is a need for us to continually amend it.

The Bailiff: Deputy Conder.

955

Deputy Conder: Sir, if elected, the candidates would chair the Policy Council's University of the Channel Islands Liaison Group. Could the candidates outline their current thoughts on the development and efficacy of that initiative? Thank you.

960 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: As Deputy Conder knows, I am supportive of it, at the moment. It is in progress. There are some potential encouraging signs. It is a private enterprise, we have an interest in it, obviously, as an Island and as a Government and so we are monitoring that and making sure that all the help is given to
965 enable it to take place, but it is not going to happen very quickly. It will happen in due course, as and when each stage is appropriate and when funding becomes available. I am happy to be involved in that currently, in that liaison group, and look forward to the future too.

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

970

Deputy Langlois: I have expressed publicly, unreserved support for the project and realise that there are a whole load of public services issues which fall out from that, that have to be solved, but essentially they have to be solved most of all by the enterprise, the entrepreneurs, who are putting this forward. This is a business. It has a particular label, because it is to do with education, it is implied that it has something to do

975 with the Education Department. We have got this co-ordinating group that would be chaired by the Chief Minister, but I think we have got to be very, very careful about giving enough freedom to that business to flourish, because that is how this Island has grown in the past and that is what we must carry on doing. If we stifle every business that comes in, because of slight worries, then we are not going to ever diversify.

980 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Burford, to be followed by Deputy Kuttelwascher and then Deputy Fallaize.

Deputy Burford: Do the candidates support open ballots for elections such as this?

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

985

Deputy Langlois: I have consistently suggested that for elections such as this and for ministerial and Department elections, I believe that a secret ballot is better. I fail to understand why the secret ballot is such a sacred cow, to do with the popular election that we hold. If you are suggesting we all know how our neighbours have voted, then I bet you there would not be many supporters of that. Once we have finished with this, we have to work with people afterwards. What is the benefit in knowing who has voted which way?

990

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

995

Deputy Le Tocq: I largely agree with my colleague, Deputy Langlois. I think I have been in this Assembly long enough to see issues, particularly elections, but when we are dealing with appels nominals and they can have an unexpected influence in the way that names are read out and votes are made and I think that it is something that we will need to continually review. I particularly think that, in elections, as Deputy Langlois has said, that it can be unhelpful.

1000

The Bailiff: You have another five minutes. Deputy Kuttelwascher.

Deputy Kuttelwascher: Sir, in recent times, each elected Assembly has been described as the worst States ever. Through their leadership, what could the candidates do to turn this into the best States ever?

1005

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

Deputy Le Tocq: I said a few years ago, as I say, I am a dreamer, and it sounds like Deputy Kuttelwascher is also a dreamer. But dreams do come true and I am a believer in at least having a goal. It comes back to the question of communication. I really do believe there is a number of people, even electors, who have contacted me over issues, being very angry, but when you have sat down and talked together, effectively, even though we may still disagree, there is a respect that emerges from that and some of the public communication means that what I would seek to do, as Chief Minister, that I would hope that that would open the door to others and for greater trust to be engendered in this Assembly.

1015

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

Deputy Langlois: I now know that there are dreamers all around us, because the idea that one person, in a matter of two years, could turn greater trust into unanimous approval for the States would certainly be a dream that will not come true. I think all you can do is you can carry on, in that sense, doing what you believe in, carry on making sure that when the States make certain moves that they are making those moves in an informed way and making sure that, as Chief Minister, you are aware of why that decision is being made, because you were so close to other Members. I remember Deputy Fallaize, in the past, saying that he had aspired all his life to be a Member of the worst States and he has finally made it. So there we are, are we not all successes in one area?

1020

1025

The Bailiff: Deputy Fallaize.

Deputy Fallaize: Thank you, sir.

1030

Would the candidates agree with me that at the moment there is a very wide disconnect between the public's expectation of the role of Chief Minister and the actual powers of the Chief Minister? If so, what do the candidates believe could be done to address that misunderstanding?

The Bailiff: Deputy Langlois.

1035

1040 **Deputy Langlois:** I do not know what the answer is. The clue may be in the name. We are back to a debate that happened some time ago. There are various apocryphal tales about how the word 'Minister' ever came into existence. I think it is something to do with foot and mouth mainly, but that is another story. I believe that the public and people, very broadly, see the title and they see the role and believe you have real, real power, hence the number of times you get asked, 'Should we not have a popular election?' And, if we had a popular election, I think it probably would be 'President'. So, yes, there should be changes made.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

1045 **Deputy Le Tocq:** There is a disconnect, but my experience, having been in the States previous to the Machinery of Government and members of my family, as well, being involved before, is that actually there always will be. It does not really matter what was the name. It was the case when there was a President of Advisory and Finance Committee that there were expectations of what that particular senior member could do and, indeed, with the Bailiff, who used to be President of the States and what he could do when he had those sorts of seeming powers that the public perceived him to have. So, I think it is a problem that we always have. The title may be something that adds to that, but I do not think it will change people's expectations in their elected Members and they should be able to see things happen.

1055 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Ogier and this may well be the last question.

Deputy Ogier: Thank you, sir.

I am looking for continuity. I am looking for minimum disruption and I am looking a smooth transition. Would the candidates outline who they might be thinking of to ensure continuity at any Department vacated by their successful election and how many workstreams they are working on will continue uninterrupted?

1060 **The Bailiff:** That cannot be possibly within the mandate of the Policy Council, to disclose who they would wish to put forward for any vacancy.

1065 **Deputy Ogier:** Perhaps they will speak to continuity, smooth transition, at their Department level and workstreams.

The Bailiff: Deputy Le Tocq.

1070 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Certainly, I can do that. I am proud to be Minister for the Home Department and I am also proud that we have been early in getting some of the things that we want to achieve implemented and well under the way to being delivered. As a result of that a number of workstreams, although it is quite a diverse Department are already happening. We are ahead of the game on FTP and those targets, so I am confident that the current team can continue and with the addition of new Members into that team and deliver in the way that we have anticipated.

1075 **The Bailiff:** Deputy Langlois.

1080 **Deputy Langlois:** Well, I think that question rather presumes that the role of Members of the Department is slightly different from what it actually is. I have, in Social Security, an excellent staff team. The business as usual aspects of the business is done through complete trust and the scrutiny of that is part of the board's job, but I am absolutely sure that, in terms of continuity, that can be managed and I will be wanting to involve the existing members of the board in the way that it was managed including who would become Social Security Minister.

1085 **The Bailiff:** Well, Members, the 60 minutes have now elapsed, allowing for the stoppages. There was one minute 30 seconds of stoppages, so the 60 minutes have elapsed. So, we now come to the point where you will be casting your votes. I remind you that there are two candidates: Deputy Allister Langlois, proposed by Deputy James, seconded by Deputy O'Hara; and Deputy Jonathan Paul Le Tocq, proposed by Deputy Duquemin, seconded by Deputy St Pier.

1090 Slips are being handed out to you now.

Obviously, make sure that you vote and you cast your vote on the slip that has your name on it.

I would just like to thank all Members and particularly the candidates for the spirit and manner in which that Question Time was conducted. Thank you very much. (*Applause*)

So, everyone should have a voting slip.

1095 Deputy Jones.

Deputy David Jones: Sir, could I request a comfort break while you are counting the votes?

1100 **The Bailiff:** I was going suggest that we rise as soon as... while the votes are counted. I do not think it will take very long, but I would ask Members not to go too far away, but yes, I will be proposing that we rise while the votes are counted.

Can you please collect the candidates' votes? I think Deputy Langlois wishes to cast a vote as well. (Laughter) Have all the voting slips been collected?

1105 Can I just say, for the record, Alderney Representative Jean was announced as being *absent de l'Île*? I believe that is by reason of the fog. He was unable to land this morning. I had hoped that, perhaps, he would be here by the time we came to cast the votes, but –

Deputy Luxon: Prevailing winds.

1110 **The Bailiff:** Perhaps it was that as well, I do not know!

Have all the votes been collected in? We will rise and can you please just allow the Deputy Greffier and Greffier to leave first.

*The Assembly adjourned at 11.00 a.m.
and resumed its sitting at 11.10 a.m.*

**Election of a Chief Minister to serve until May 2016 –
Results announced –
Deputy Le Tocq elected Chief Minister**

1115 **The Bailiff:** Her Majesty's Greffier has handed to me a certificate of the record of votes cast for the election of a Chief Minister which I will read: Le Tocq, Jonathan, 22 votes; Langlois, Allister, 20 votes; spoiled papers, nil; blank paper, one. I declare Deputy Le Tocq to have been elected as Chief Minister. Congratulations. (Applause)

Deputy Le Tocq, do you wish to address the States?

1120 **Deputy Le Tocq:** Thank you, sir, I will be brief.

First of all, may I thank Deputy Allister Langlois for the way in which this has been conducted and, indeed, all of us for the manner in which this has taken place today? This has obviously been the first time we have done it in this way. It was done civilly and effectively.

1125 Can I also thank Deputy Harwood, again, for the legacy that he has provided for us all to build on? I count it an honour and a privilege to be able to serve my Island in this way. I hope to be able to follow in his footsteps and to build on what he has maintained. I hope he will take a continued active role wherever possible in our Government. We have work to do; let us focus and get on with the job.

Thank you. (Applause)

1130 **The Bailiff:** Well, congratulations, Chief Minister, and I thank you both for the spirit and manner in which this election campaign has been conducted.

That concludes the business for this meeting, Greffier.

The Assembly adjourned at 11.12 a.m.