# **ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT PLANNING DIVISION**

# **OPEN PLANNING MEETING AGENDA**

An Open Planning Meeting will be held at Beau Sejour, Cambridge/Delancey Room, on **Tuesday 04/11/2014** at 8.45am for a 9.00am start.

The following applications will be considered at the Open Planning Meeting:-

# Agenda Item 1:-

APPLICATION NUMBER:	FULL/2014/1938
APPLICATION ADDRESS:	Le Tertre Rue Du Tertre/La Route Du Braye Vale.
DESCRIPTION OF WORK:	Demolish existing properties and erect 51 sheltered housing units, wardens apartment, wardens stores and community building, create new access and service road, associated parking and carry out landscaping.
NAME OF APPLICANT:	BMP Limited.

# Agenda Item 2:-

APPLICATION NUMBER:	FULL/2014/1975
APPLICATION ADDRESS:	Frie Plaidy Reservoir Rue Des Morts Le Preel Castel.
DESCRIPTION OF WORK:	Relocation of Transmitting Station comprising of a 45m lattice tower, antenna and associated equipment cabinets, erection of fencing and new landscape planting.
NAME OF APPLICANT:	Arqiva Limited.

The agenda for the open planning meeting, along with the planning application reports relating to the applications to be considered, which follow below, are made available five working days before the date of the Open Planning Meeting on the Department's website and also in hard copy at the Department's offices. The planning application reports below contain a summary of consultation responses and of any representations received on the applications from third parties.

There will be provision for **public speaking** at the open planning meeting. The opportunity to speak is afforded only to persons who:

- a) have submitted a representation in writing within the period specified for publicity of the application under section 10 of the Land Planning and Development (General Provisions) Ordinance, 2007, along with the applicant and/or their agent for the application; and
- b) who have notified the Department in writing (by letter or by e-mail addressed to <u>Planning@gov.gg</u>) of their intention to speak which is received by the Department by 12.00 Noon on the working day immediately preceding the date of the Open Planning Meeting.



## **PLANNING APPLICATION REPORT**

Application No: FULL/2014/1938
Property Ref: C011390000
Valid date: 23/07/2014

Le Tertre Rue Du Tertre/La Route Du Braye Vale Guernsey GY3 5QR

**Proposal:** Demolish existing properties and erect 51 sheltered housing units, wardens

apartment, wardens stores and community building, create new access and

service road, associated parking and carry out landscaping.

**Applicant:** BMP Limited

**RECOMMENDATION - Grant: Planning Permission with Conditions:** 

1. All development authorised by this permission must be carried out and must be completed in every detail in accordance with the written application, plans and drawings referred to above. No variations to such development amounting to development may be made without the permission of the Environment Department under the Law.

Reason - To ensure that it is clear that permission is only granted for the development to which the application relates.

2. The development hereby permitted shall be begun within 3 years from the date of grant of this permission.

Reason - This condition reflects section 18(1) of the Land Planning and Development (Guernsey) Law, 2005 which states that planning permission ceases to have effect unless development is commenced within 3 years of the date of grant (or such shorter period as may be specified in the permission).

3. The development hereby permitted and all the operations which constitute or are incidental to that development must be carried out in compliance with all such requirements of The Building (Guernsey) Regulations, 2012 as are applicable to them, and no operation to which such a requirement applies may be commenced or continued unless (i) plans relating to that operation have been approved by the Environment Department and (ii) it is commenced or, as the case may be, continued, in accordance with that requirement and any further requirements imposed by the Environment Department when approving those plans, for the purpose of securing that the building regulations are complied with.

Reason - Any planning permission granted under the Law is subject to this condition as stated in section 17(2) of the Land Planning and Development (Guernsey) Law, 2005.

4. The premises to which this permission relates shall be used to provide sheltered housing and warden's accommodation as defined under Residential Use Class 3 of the Land Planning and Development (Use Classes) Ordinance, 2007 or in any provision equivalent to that Use Class in any Ordinance revoking or re-enacting that Ordinance, and for no other purpose including any other within the residential use classes.

Reason - The permission is limited to the specific use applied for and subject to such restriction can be met on site without unacceptable harm to other interests.

5. No means of enclosure shall be erected on the site, either on the site boundaries or within the site, until full details of those means of enclosure have been submitted to and approved by the Environment Department.

Reason - To ensure a satisfactory form of development.

6. The alterations hereby approved to the Rue du Tertre, the Route du Braye/Rue du Tertre junction and the adjacent boundary walls shall be completed in accordance with the approved details prior to the commencement of any other work on site, including any ground works, unless in accordance with a submitted proposal for phasing of the development agreed in writing by the Environment Department.

Reason - To ensure that the existing road network is capable of supporting the development hereby approved and to ensure road safety during construction works on site.

7. Notwithstanding the information submitted, prior to development being commenced on the site, precise details of the finished site levels and internal floor levels intended at the completion of the development, which shall be shown in relation to the existing site levels (and levels of adjoining land) and related to a fixed datum point, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Environment Department.

Reason - To ensure a satisfactory form of development.

8. Notwithstanding the information submitted, prior to development being commenced on the site, precise details of the extent of excavation and treatment of the northern boundary of the site, to the rear of Units 47-50, in particular detailing the change in levels, any retaining features and measures to ensure the protection of the Protected Tree shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Environment Department. The development shall thereafter be completed in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - To ensure that the detailed design of the development is satisfactory.

9. Notwithstanding the information submitted, prior to development being commenced on the parking areas forward of Units 19-30, precise details of those parking areas, particularly in terms of site levels and proposed boundary features shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Environment Department. The development shall thereafter be completed in accordance with the approved details. (See informative below)

Reason - To ensure that the detailed design of the development is satisfactory.

10. All blockwork walls hereby approved shall be rendered and any fencing shall be dark stained on both sides within two months of construction.

Reason - To ensure a satisfactory external appearance in the interests of visual amenity.

11. No hardsurfacing shall be undertaken until full details of the surfacing materials proposed to be used on any paved or metalled areas have been submitted to and approved by the Environment Department; and no dwelling shall be occupied until the works have been completed in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - To ensure a satisfactory external appearance in the interests of visual amenity.

12. Building operations shall not commence until a sample of the proposed external facing and roofing materials to be used has been submitted to and approved by the Environment Department. The development shall be completed only as agreed.

Reason - To ensure a satisfactory external appearance in the interests of visual amenity.

13. Notwithstanding the information submitted, prior to the installation of any means of any lighting on the site, a lighting strategy shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Environment Department. The development shall thereafter be completed in accordance with the approved details.

Reason - To ensure that the detailed design of the development is satisfactory.

14. The windows shall be of vertical sliding sash design and method of opening, unless otherwise agreed beforehand in writing by the Environment Department.

Reason - To ensure a satisfactory design and external appearance in the interests of visual amenity.

15. The car parking indicated on the approved plans shall be surfaced, marked out and made available for use prior to the building(s) hereby approved being first occupied/brought into use.

Reason - To ensure that a satisfactory form of development is achieved.

16. No development shall take place until there has been submitted to and approved by the Environment Department a comprehensive scheme of landscaping, which shall include indications of all existing trees and hedgerows on the land, details of measures for the retention and protection of existing trees during the course of the development and details of the type, number and size of new trees/shrubs at the time of planting.

Reason - To ensure that a satisfactory form of development is achieved in the interests of amenity.

17. All planting, seeding or turfing comprised in the hereby approved details of landscaping shall be carried out in the first planting and seeding seasons following the occupation of the building(s) or completion of the development, whichever is the sooner. Any trees or plants which die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar size and species, unless the Environment Department gives written approval to any variation.

Reason - To ensure that a satisfactory form of development is achieved in the interests of amenity.

18. Before any work is commenced on the site including site works of any description, each of the trees required to be retained under the terms of this permission shall be securely fenced off by a chestnut paling or similar fence erected in a circle around each tree to coincide with the extremity of the canopy of the tree. Within the areas so fenced off the existing ground level shall be neither raised nor lowered, and no materials or temporary buildings or surplus soil of any kind shall be placed or stored thereon. If any trenches for services are required in the fenced off areas they shall be excavated and backfilled by hand, and any tree roots encountered with a diameter of 5cms or more shall be left unsevered.

Reason - To adequately protect existing trees in the interests of amenity.

#### **INFORMATIVES**

For the avoidance of doubt, this permission confers no consent whatsoever for the erection of any fencing forward of the front building line of Units 1/2, towards La Route du Braye and details of enclosure to that boundary shall form part of the details required under Condition 5.

With regard to Condition 9 and the parking areas forward of Units 19-30, the scale elevations for

these elements do not reflect the wall heights indicated on the site layout plans and the method of addressing the change in levels indicated on the plans, in conjunction with the use of rendered concrete retaining walls topped with aluminium railings would introduce an inappropriate urban aesthetic to this area. It is therefore recommended that further consideration be given to the design of these parking areas.

In accordance with the Development Brief, the built form should achieve high environmental and energy efficiency performance where possible.

The application site is located within an area of known archaeological importance and your attention is drawn to the provisions of Annex 4 of the Urban Area Plan with regard to archaeological assessment where a site is known or suspected to be of archaeological importance. It is also desirable that access be granted to the Archaeology Officer, Culture and Leisure Department, to enable archaeological recording during any earth moving on the site. The Archaeology Department can be contacted on 700477 or mobile 07781 102219.

#### **OFFICER'S REPORT**

## **Site Description:**

The site comprises a 1.2 ha (7.4 vergees) parcel of land located between Le Petit Essart to the north, Carriere Lane to the west and Rue du Tertre to the east, set to the north of La Route du Braye in the Vale. The land rises from south to north and from east to west, with a difference in levels of over 9 metres between the north and south boundaries and 1.2 metres between the east and west boundaries.

The site comprises two distinct sections, divided by a steep escarpment running east-west across the site.

The northern section includes the protected farmhouse known as Le Tertre which sits in the northeast corner of the site, within a formal walled garden, and a derelict barn located in the north-west corner. Permission has been granted, and implemented, to create a separate access to this section of the site from Carriere Lane. There are six protected trees located on the northern part of the site, two within the walled garden and four along the western boundary. This part of the site does not form part of the current application.

The southern section of the site, which forms the subject of this application, comprises approximately 1 ha (6.1 vergees) and includes five detached bungalows fronting on to Rue du Tertre to the east, three detached dwellings fronting on to La Route du Braye to the south and a backland area of former horticultural land. The south-east corner of the site, located on the Rue du Tertre/Route du Braye junction, is presently open land however prior to 2009 this area supported a single dwelling. That dwelling was demolished under a consent issued in 2007 to replace the dwelling with three new dwellings. The remainder of the consent was not implemented.

The site is bounded to the south-west by two rows of States Houses, which front on to La Route du Braye to the south and Carriere Lane to the west. Those properties fronting onto La Route du Braye are served by car parking forward of the dwellings. Consent was granted in 2010 for the creation of car parking to serve the dwellings fronting onto Carriere Lane, to be located between those dwellings and the boundary of the application site. This consent has lapsed, however there is a pending application for a revised proposal.

A residential property located to the north of the States Houses on Carriere Lane did project into the application site, however consent was issued in 2013 for the demolition of the dwelling at this property and its reconstruction in line with the remainder of the development along Carriere Lane. This consent has been implemented and the eastern half of that property now falls within the application site.

The eastern boundary of the site along Rue du Tertre, returning around the southern boundary to La Route du Braye, is formed by an historic boulder wall. The wall is punctured by 7 vehicle gateways and 4 pedestrian gateways along Rue du Tertre and 2 vehicle gateways and 1 pedestrian gateway along La Route du Braye. The boundaries to the rear of the States Housing are generally formed by post and wire fencing and planting. There is no boundary treatment between the northern and southern parts of the site.

The site falls within a Settlement Area in the Urban Area Plan.

## **Relevant History:**

PREA/2012/2962 Pre-application discussions for a sheltered housing development.

01/10/13	FULL/2013/1234	Permit to create new vehicular access on to
		Carriere Lane to serve the existing dwelling known as 'Le Tertre', with associated driveway and
		parking area adjacent to the dwelling.
19/09/13	FULL/2013/1975	Permit to demolish existing dwelling and
		outbuildings and erect replacement dwelling and
		detached double garage, create new vehicular
		access and parking area and erect boundary walls
		at L'Etac on Carriere Lane.
26/07/11	FULL/2011/1262	Refusal to convert existing dwelling at Le Tertre
		into three dwellings, demolish barn and construct
		new dwelling and form new vehicular access.
24/04/09	PAPP/2009/0708	Permit granted for alteration to road junction at
		La Route du Braye/Rue du Tertre.
13/04/07	PAPP/2007/0003	Permit granted to demolish dwelling and
		outbuildings; erect two semi-detached dwellings
		and a bungalow and create vehicular access in
		south-east corner of site.

#### Existing Use(s):

Eight dwelling houses (Residential Use Class 1) Former horticultural land (Agricultural Use Class 44)

## **Brief Description of Development:**

The application relates to the southern section of the site where it is proposed to undertake the following:

- Demolition of the existing eight dwellings along the east and south boundaries of the site.
- Construction of 51 sheltered housing units, comprising blocks of four two bedroom apartments of c900 sq ft each with communal lift access and stair for each block.
- Construction of a 3 bedroom apartment and store for an on-site warden.
- Construction of a central community building.
- Creation of a new access point from Rue du Tertre.

- Creation of internal access road and parking courts.
- Demolition of east boundary wall and widening of Rue du Tertre to 5m between the junction with La Route du Braye and the new access point.
- Alter road boundary at Rue du Tertre/La Route du Braye junction.

# <u>Supporting information provided in the Planning & Design Statement submitted with the application:</u>

- The rehabilitation of the protected building known as 'Le Tertre' will be dealt with separately.
- Additional land has been acquired subsequent to the preparation of the Development Brief and the previous applications on the site, reducing the constraints to development.
- A character assessment of the area, summarised as:
  - Varying building lines, whilst some road frontages enable parking in front of the buildings, in many cases gables and building facades are in close proximity to the road:
  - Generally traditional materials and pitched roof construction, with varying details such as projecting gables and bay windows;
  - Generally Victorian design;
  - Majority of residential buildings are 2 to 2 ½ storeys in height;
  - Boundary treatments generally low granite walls and earthbanks or dry stone walls.
  - Little modern/contemporary architecture.
  - Street scenes generally comprise of block developments terraces or semi-detached dwellings.
  - Parking/hardstanding generally gravel or tarmac, with some brick paving.
  - Fenestration varies but generally vertical sliding sash.
  - Building designs are relatively clean and simple, with some detailing such as bay windows, rendered quoins and raised render detailing.
  - Long urban street scenes, particularly along La Route du Braye, with dwellings built close to roadsides.
- The existing buildings are generally old, dilapidated and of no particular distinction. The
  proposed development would comprise a sympathetically designed quality scheme which
  makes better use of land and a more positive contribution to the character and appearance of
  the area.
- The development will benefit the community. Sheltered housing is significantly under provided in the Island and much needed to address the challenges of an ageing population.
- The development is within an established residential area and well related to the pattern of development, situated close to the Bridge and convenient for local facilities.
- The corner block has been designed so that all unit frontages are parallel to the adjacent road.
- The windows to the side walls will be obscurely glazed with opening restrictors.
- The terraces on Units 31-38 have been minimised to prevent overlooking.
- The proposed access accords with advice in the Development Brief and Traffic Standards.
- A Traffic Impact Assessment was undertaken for previous applications.
- The existing properties are accessed directly from La Route du Braye or Rue du Tertre, with informal access from Rue du Tertre to the backland horticultural site.
- Road and pavement widening are proposed, in accordance with the Brief, although the
  pavement is to be only 1.2m to match the remainder of the pavement along La Route du
  Braye.
- No direct pedestrian access is provided through the site as security is a major factor for sheltered housing and public access is not appropriate.
- Each unit will have one allocated parking space, with additional allocation for visitor parking, all in compliance with Lifetime Home Standards.

- A comprehensive landscaping scheme will be professionally prepared, including the boundary
  of the site with Le Tertre.
- Refuse stores are incorporated within the communal entrances.
- Discussions with utility providers indicate that there will be sufficient capacity to accommodate the proposed development, although existing services will require upgrading.
- The site is served by the public main drain.
- Surface water drainage will be via on site soak away.

# Relevant Policies of any Plan, Subject Plan or Local Planning Brief:

Rue du Tertre Development Brief: June 2009

Urban Area Plan policies:

GEN1	Sustainable development	DBE4	Landscape design
GEN2	Comprehensive development	DBE5	Open space
GEN3	Landscape, ecology and wildlife	DBE8	Buildings of special interest
GEN4	The built environment	DBE9	Demolition of buildings and
			features
GEN5	Design	DBE10	Archaeological remains
GEN6	Character and amenity	HO1	Housing provision in the urban
			area
GEN7	Roads and infrastructure	HO2	New housing development in
			settlement areas and on
			previously developed land
GEN8	Safe and convenient access	HO10	Residential density and amenity
GEN9	Open space and parking	HO11	Housing for smaller households
GEN11	Public enjoyment	HO12	Housing for people with mobility
			impairment
GEN12	Effect on adjoining properties	HO13	Accommodation for the elderly
DBE1	Design	CO3	Landscape character
DBE2	Developments with significant		
	townscape impact		

#### **Representations:**

Six letters of representation were received objecting to the development on the following grounds:

- Compliance with the Development Brief.
- The effect on the character and quality of the natural and built environment; introducing two storey buildings in place of detached single storey bungalows on a tranquil lane, dominating the lane and contrary to Policy DBE3 (High buildings).
- The effect on the amenity of the locality.
- The appropriateness of the development in relation to its surroundings in terms of its design, layout, scale, siting and the materials to be used.
- The number of units and density of development proposed.
- Loss of the outer site walls, which are the original boundary walls constructed in association with Le Tertre protected building and were identified to be retained in the Development Brief.
- The extent of development which has occurred in the area over recent times, putting pressure on the infrastructure.

- Impact on existing infrastructure, e.g. roads, water mains and drains, telecoms links, schools, public transport, shops and parking.
- Impact on open land the opportunity identified for the northern part of the Brief to enhance the rural aspect of the lanes has been overlooked.
- Impact on schools, parks and playing fields.
- Impact on views.
- Road safety
  - o The proposal will result in an increase in the amount of traffic in the area.
  - Rue du Tertre is too narrow to accommodate additional traffic and the only entrance road to the development.
  - Vehicles park along Rue du Tertre which exacerbates existing road safety issues.
  - The Rue du Tertre/Braye Road junction is difficult, particularly in terms of visibility, and this will be compounded by the new units on the corner.
  - The pavement does not extend the full length of the development.
  - o La Route du Braye would be a better option for the new access.
- Insufficient parking for the number of units proposed and associated visitors. Good public transport links and nature of accommodation will not reduce car ownership.
- Insufficient amenity space proposed.
- Impact on neighbour amenity:
  - Noise from the additional traffic generated.
  - Proximity of corner terrace to adjacent properties and resultant loss of privacy and light to those properties, contrary to Policy GEN12.
  - Loss of open outlook.
- No consideration to the restoration of the listed building.

## **Consultations:**

## Vale Constables:

The Douzaine has discussed this at length at their July meeting and the plans were tabled and discussed, which had favourable comments on the design and layout. Concerns were made regarding the associated car parking and it was thought that there was possibly not enough parking for visitors.

The Douzaine has noticed that since the development of 38 units at Tertre Lane, car parking in Tertre Lane and adjoining roads has increased and has even made it difficult for emergency services to get through. Therefore the Douzaine would like to see no parking at all in this very narrow lane.

The Douzaine has also noticed that there are quite a number of estates being built in the Mares Pellees, in the former Coq du Nord, and also replacing Cleveleys, Braye Road, with fifty-one units being built, this will make a huge impact on the traffic using an already very busy road.

## **States Archaeologist:**

There are a few areas of this large site – principally in the north, and to a lesser extent in the south, behind the properties along the Braye Road – where there has been little, if any, previous development. We consider that it would be useful to excavate perhaps four or six test-pits in these areas in order to assess whether any significant archaeological deposits have been preserved. This work could be done well in advance of the development itself, and so we will express our interest in this to the developers.

#### **Public Services Department:**

Some years ago, when we resurfaced Braye Road, the owner/developer of this plot make special representations to us to delay the resurfacing of this junction as they were expecting to be making a planning application for development. PSD agreed to this and removed the junction from the project.

Over the ensuing years, the road surface continued to deteriorate, to the point where we decided that resurfacing had to go ahead. As no further approach had been made by the owners of this site, we went ahead and notified everyone concerned, prior to resurfacing over the first week in July. Our letter prompted a response saying that a planning application was about to go in and asking if we could delay this further. Unfortunately, the condition of the road was such that this was not possible.

Now, you have the application (which incidentally does not appear on your Digimap applications webmap) which includes works in the highway, including alterations to the drainage system. Unfortunately, this junction is now under a three year embargo. Also, the works to the drainage system would be quite a large and expensive project.

Public Services could not, at this point, support this application. Furthermore, as the highway is effectively owned by PSD, the applicant does not have our permission to make application for works in the highway.

Whilst the applicant has the right to challenge the embargo, we would not expect it to be successful.

#### Traffic Services – current application:

I refer to our previous comments of March 2014, a copy of which is attached for your information, in which it was noted that whilst the level of parking provision appeared to exceed the UAP Annexe 2 Guideline figure, the bulk of the parking provision was allocated to specific dwellings, leaving 10 spaces as communal visitor parking as opposed to the recommended number of 25. The TSU strongly recommended that serious consideration be given to re-allocating spaces to address the shortfall in communal parking.

The supplied plans have not addressed this point, therefore our previous concern remains in this regard.

It was also noted that the parking for Units 19-30 is to be served from Rue Du Tertre rather than from within the access roadway serving the main development; whilst the TSU accepts that the sightlines from these access points would meet with the sightline and access criteria outlined above, and that there are current access points serving the existing dwellings, its preference would be for vehicular access to be served via the main development road to reduce frontage activity on Rue du Tertre. The TSU notes with some disappointment that the supplied plans show that the previous arrangement of serving the parking for Units 19-30 from Rue du Tertre, has been favoured in the current application.

Given the above observations, the Traffic Services Unit considers that whilst there are no significant Traffic related grounds on which to oppose the application in its current form, it would recommend that consideration be given to addressing the two points previously raised so that any concerns are satisfactorily addressed.

## Traffic Services March 2014 (pre-application):

I refer to previous comments made in February 2009, a copy of which is attached for your information, in which the following recommendations were made –

- 1. Widen the section of Rue du Tertre between the proposed access and the junction with Route du Braye to properly accommodate 2 way traffic flow and include a footpath
- 2. Introduce a bellmouth on the western side of the junction with Braye Road to improve turning movements
- 3. Remedial measures being carried out to ensure that the sightlines for drivers exiting the development access and exiting Rue du Tertre onto Braye Road meet the minimum

recommended guidelines (and in regard to the sightlines onto Braye Road - preferably exceed the minimum recommended guidelines as there appears to be an opportunity to do so)

It is noted from the supplied plan 13 - 550 - 02, that the points raised above have been satisfactorily addressed and the Traffic Services Unit welcomes the changes incorporated in the current scheme.

Whilst there has been an increase in the level of Sheltered Housing provision to that previously commented on, the TSU is of the opinion that a further TIA would not be required as the previous assessment provided sufficient information for the TSU to base its current observations and comments upon. In which case, the TSU is of the view that the additional units of sheltered housing proposed in the latest scheme, would not raise significant Traffic Management concerns in regard to the access via Route du Braye.

Notwithstanding this observation, the TSU does however have some concerns relating to the potential dispersal of traffic associated with the proposed development, into the network of narrow lanes to the north.

In regard to the main development, the overall design and dimensions of the access, internal roadway and parking bays, would appear to meet Engineering Guidelines. The level of parking provision would appear to exceed the UAP Annexe 2 Guideline figure, however the TSU notes that the bulk of the parking provision is allocated to specific dwellings, leaving 10 spaces as communal visitor parking as opposed to the recommended number of 25. The TSU would therefore strongly recommend that serious consideration be given to re-allocating spaces to address the shortfall in communal parking.

It is noted from the supplied plans that the parking for Units 1 9 - 30 is to be served from Rue Du Tertre rather than from within the access roadway serving the main development; the TSU accepts that the sightlines from these access points would meet with the sightline and access criteria outlined above, and that there are current access points serving the existing dwellings. However, its preference would be for vehicular access to be served via the main development road to reduce frontage activity on Rue du Tertre.

Given the above observations, the Traffic Services Unit considers that there are no significant Traffic related grounds on which to oppose the application in its current form, and does not consider that a new TIA is required as a consequence of the increase in level of Sheltered Housing being currently proposed.

#### **Summary of Issues:**

Compliance with Development Brief; Access, parking and road safety; Impact on character and amenity of the area; Impact on landscape character; Impact on neighbours.

## **Assessment against:**

- 1 Purposes of the law.
- 2 Relevant policies of any Plan, Subject Plan or Local Planning Brief.
- 3 General material considerations set out in the General Provisions Ordinance.
- 4 Additional considerations (for protected trees, monuments, buildings and/or SSS's).

Policy HO2 of the Urban Area Plan allows for housing development within Settlement Areas, provided that the site is suitable having regard to the existing characteristics of the site and its relationship with the surrounding area; the development is acceptable in terms of design, density, and amenity; and the development does not conflict with other relevant policies of the Plan. Where a site exceeds 0.5 hectare, or for developments of more than 20 dwellings or exceeding 2000 square metres gross floor area, a Development Brief is required.

The Development Brief for this site was approved in June 2009, and sets out the relevant policy framework for consideration of any application on the site, in addition to providing comprehensive guidance for development.

This proposal falls to be considered principally against the approved Development Brief, and the cited policies of the Urban Area Plan.

## Compliance with Development Brief

The application site includes three dwellings to the east, fronting on to Rue du Tertre, and an area of land to the west, formerly part of the property known as L'Etac, which were not included within the scope of the original Development Brief. The majority of the application site however falls within the boundaries identified in the Brief, and the requirements of the Brief remain valid.

The Brief relates to both the northern and southern sections of the site. The current proposals relate to the southern section of the site only, however it is considered that the proposals would in no way prejudice the renovation of the protected building located in the northern section of the site and it is acceptable to consider the proposed development in isolation.

The detailed requirements of the Brief are addressed below.

## Access & parking proposals, road safety and traffic management

The access and traffic section of the Development Brief draws from a Transport Statement prepared for the site by Ove Arup in 2009 and consultation with Traffic Services and the Public Services Department.

Subsequent to the preparation of this Transport Statement the site has been enlarged as described above, however the alteration is not considered sufficient to impact on the conclusions of the Statement and a further Traffic Impact Assessment was not required.

Independent access to serve the protected building to the north of the site was granted consent in 2013, and the approved works have been carried out. The access proposed under this application is therefore to serve the sheltered housing development only and access to the north of the site does not form part of the consideration of this application.

## Site access and road widening

The Brief states that the main access for the site should be via a single access point on to Rue du Tertre, designed as a priority junction, at a point 40m to 50m north of the junction between Rue du Tertre and La Route du Braye. An alternative access on to La Route du Braye was considered during the preparation of the Brief, however, in accordance with the Traffic Engineering guidelines, new accesses on to Traffic Priority Routes are generally resisted on road safety grounds. The access proposed under this application accords with the requirements of the Brief and the overall design and dimensions of the access, internal roadway and parking bays meet Traffic Engineering guidelines.

The application however includes three additional access points on to Rue du Tertre, to the north of the main access, each to serve four units (Units 19-30). This proposal was not envisaged in the Development Brief, however the site did not include this section of boundary at the time the Brief was prepared. The proposed accesses meet the sightline and access standards of Traffic Services, and are located in similar positions to the accesses serving the existing bungalows along the road. Due to the additional frontage activity on Rue du Tertre, this element of the proposal is not the preferred approach of Traffic Services, however the proposal would comprise a reduction in the number of access points on to Rue du Tertre, albeit with an increased intensity of use, and no significant road safety grounds are identified to oppose the proposal.

Achieving the sightline for the northernmost access would however involve a significant reduction in height to the historic roadside wall. This wall does form part of the character of the area, however it does not form part of the listing of Le Tertre and the section to be altered does not form part of the walled garden associated with that building. On balance therefore the alteration of the last 4m section of the wall, retaining the height of the remaining 33m would not have a significant impact on the setting of the protected building or the character of the area.

To ensure adequate access to the development, the Transport Statement prepared by Ove Arup recommended the following improvements to the existing infrastructure surrounding the site:

- i) The corner radius on the left-turn from La Route du Braye into Rue du Tertre be increased to approximately 7m, improving the visibility splay to/from the west.
- ii) A footway be provided from the Rue du Tertre/La Route du Braye junction along the western side of Rue du Tertre. The footway should be 1.5m wide.
- iii) In addition to provision of a footway, the Rue du Tertre carriageway be widened to 4.8m from La Route du Braye to the proposed site entrance.
- iv) The existing footway along La Route du Braye be widened to a width consistent with the existing footway further west on La Route du Braye.

The application includes alterations to the Route du Braye/Rue du Tertre junction in accordance with point (i), increasing the corner radius and reducing the height of the roadside walls to improve visibility; the introduction of a footpath along the west of Rue du Tertre in accordance with point (iii); and the widening of the existing footpath along the site frontage on La Route du Braye in accordance with point (iv).

The new and widened footpaths are to be 1.2m wide, falling short of the 1.5m suggested by the Brief, however this comprises an improvement on the existing situation and is considered sufficient for road safety purposes.

The alterations proposed to the Route du Braye/Rue du Tertre junction were previously approved 24/04/09 (ref PAPP/2009/0708) however that permission has not been implemented and the consent has lapsed. The proposal would constitute an improvement in road safety terms, and the corner units proposed under this application are sufficiently set back from the roadside to prevent any impact on visibility from the junction. In conjunction with the proposed pavement widening, the works would however result in the complete removal of the roadside wall along the south roadside boundary of the site and the construction of a lower wall, set back marginally from the roadside.

In addition, the proposals include widening of the Rue du Tertre between the junction with La Route du Braye and the site entrance to 5m, in accordance with point (iii). To achieve this widening the whole of the roadside wall along the western side of the Rue du Tertre would also be removed. This wall, and that continuing around the south boundary of the site, although not protected, is a historic feature of boulder and bank construction and is identified as of landscape value and to be retained within the Brief.

The submitted plans indicate that the width of the actual road surface along Rue du Tertre would not be substantially altered as a result of the proposal, and the set back of the roadside wall is predominantly to accommodate a footpath along the side of the road. This footpath would only extend to the new site access point, and would not continue along Rue du Tertre to the north. In addition, as noted above, there is separate pedestrian access from within the site on to La Route du Braye and an additional footpath may be considered superfluous. The footpath would however improve pedestrian use of the Route du Braye/Rue du Tertre junction and would link to the quieter lanes to the north and the pedestrian throughway from La Courtil de Fontaine to the east, and consequently the inclusion of this footpath was a recommendation of the Transport Statement.

Alternative options for the footpath, such as relocation within the existing site boundary, were discussed with the applicant, however it was noted that this would impinge upon the security and amenity of the proposed units, to the detriment of the development.

Whilst the existing wall does make a contribution to the character of Rue du Tertre and it is unfortunate to lose such a feature in its entirety, it is considered, on balance, that the road safety benefits arising from the works would outweigh the impact on the character of the area. The new roadside wall must however be constructed in an appropriate manner and further details should be required by condition.

It is noted that there is currently informal on street parking along the southern section of Rue du Tertre which can prevent two-way traffic along the road. It is however noted that there is a yellow line along the majority of this section, allowing for a maximum of three spaces on the road. The majority of properties in this area appear to have on-site parking and Traffic Services have not raised any concerns from a Traffic Management perspective. Should any conflict arise with regard to this parking, the situation could be addressed through an extension of the yellow line, with only a small loss of parking provision to the area.

The proposed alterations to Rue du Tertre, the Route du Braye/Rue du Tertre junction and the roadside walls are fundamental to ensuring that the road network is capable of supporting the additional traffic generated from the development, and would also facilitate access to the site by construction vehicles during the build. The decision should therefore be conditional upon these works being undertaken prior to the commencement of any other development on the site, unless otherwise agreed as part of a comprehensive phasing plan for the development. It is noted from the Public Services Department's comments that the road is currently under embargo, however this is not a material planning consideration and is a matter for the developer to address with the Public Services Department.

## Traffic generation

The Transport Statement prepared by Ove Arup concluded that due to the nature of the development, the proposal was unlikely to generate a significant number of vehicular trips either in the AM or PM peak hours and was unlikely to impact on highway capacity or road traffic accident levels.

Whilst there may be some traffic dispersing from the site into the road network to the north, it is likely that the majority of traffic would exit on to La Route du Braye to the south and the development would not place undue pressure on the smaller road network to the north.

## Permeability

The Development Brief encourages permeability through the site, including by provision of pedestrian access to La Route du Braye. The submitted proposals do include a pedestrian link to La Route du Braye from the parking court associated with Units 1-18, however the Planning and Design Statement submitted with the application states that the layout of the development has been purposely designed not to encourage permeability from outside of the site boundaries. The Statement notes the importance of security in this form of development, and therefore states that such permeability would be undesirable.

As stated above, the proposals do however include improvements to the pedestrian pavements along the site boundaries.

There are no specific cycle routes in the immediate locality, and there would be little benefit to including such a route within this development site, particularly given the nature of the proposed development.

## Parking provision

The Development Brief identifies that car parking should reference the Parking Standards of the Urban Area Plan (UAP Annex 2), and should be adequate for the density and profile of the users. The Parking Standards of the UAP identify a requirement of 8 spaces per 10 dwellings for sheltered housing, plus 1 space for the warden. This requirement is generally equivalent to or higher than Parking Standards for similar developments in UK authorities, although the maximum requirement found was 1 space per dwelling. These Standards are based on the assumption that, due to the nature of the accommodation provided, there will be a lower than average car ownership on the development.

The current application proposes 55 parking spaces allocated to the individual units (1 space per dwelling for Units 1-46 & 51 and 2 spaces per dwelling for Units 47-50), 2 spaces for the warden's accommodation and 10 visitor spaces. All spaces are designed to Lifetime Home standards; located in close proximity to the associated unit and with sufficient separation between spaces to enable convenient use by all.

The proposed car parking provision therefore exceeds the requirements of the Urban Area Plan, and is consistent with the requirements for such developments in the UK. Traffic Services indicate that the provision of visitor spaces is low, however note that the provision of allocated spaces exceeds requirements. It is therefore considered that overall the number of parking spaces provided on site will be sufficient to service the development. If necessary, further assessment of the allocation of spaces could be undertaken by the management company once the development has been brought into use.

The proposed parking layout uses a combination of strategies, including courtyard parking (behind high walls), on-street parking and on-plot parking in the front garden to effectively integrate the parking into the scheme and to avoid over-dominance by cars.

There is no specific provision for the storage of cycles on site, however, as stated above, given the nature of the proposed development it is unlikely that cycle storage would be a requirement of the occupants.

## Demolition of existing buildings

The application involves the demolition of eight existing buildings; five bungalows located along Rue du Tertre and three dwellings located along La Route du Braye, comprising one bungalow, a 1½ and a 2 storey dwelling.

The demolition of these properties is not explicitly addressed in the Development Brief, however is implicitly accepted. Policy DBE9 (Demolition of buildings and features) sets out criteria for demolition of existing buildings.

In this case, the existing bungalows were constructed prior to 1938, with the two dwellings constructed by 1963. The buildings are not of particular special interest and do not make a significant contribution to the character of the area. The proposed development on the site is to provide sheltered housing units for the over 55s, a sector of the market which is experiencing increasing demand in the Island, and would therefore provide a benefit to the wider community. Provided that the proposed development is considered to comprise a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the area through the assessment below, the demolition of the existing buildings would meet the criteria of Policy DBE9.

The proposal will result in the provision of a substantial number of new residential units and the demolition of the existing dwellings to facilitate this development would be acceptable under Policy HO9 (Retention of the existing housing stock).

## Detailed design

The Brief sets out an Urban Design Framework for any development of the site, relating to the character, layout, scale and height, appearance, density and mix and sustainability of any proposal.

The scheme follows the broad principle of creating two character areas as set out in the Brief; a low density development at the north of the site which respects the setting of the protected building and a higher density development at the south of the site, with terraces of buildings following the front building lines of La Route du Braye and Rue du Tertre.

The Brief identifies a potential density range of 45-50 dwellings per hectare for the southern section of the site. The area of the southern section of the site, as proposed under this application, is 1 hectare and the application proposes 51 units of sheltered housing accommodation and a warden's unit. Given the semi-urban nature of the southern section of the site, the pattern of the surrounding development, and the provision of adequate access, parking and amenity for the development, it is considered that the proposed density is acceptable for this site.

The Brief sets out strong support for sheltered housing development and an expectation for the majority of accommodation to be no more than two bedrooms per unit, and the proposal accords with both of these elements.

The layout for the southern part of the site provides positive enclosure to the surrounding streets and reinforces the existing settlement pattern. Although the proposals would result in an increase in the scale and bulk of the built form along the western side of Rue du Tertre, this would not be inappropriate at the southern end of the road as proposed. The interior of the site is developed using a 'U' shaped form of development that encloses an open space and community building, engendering a sense of community and safety for the occupants.

The buildings in the surrounding area are predominantly two storeys, particularly along La Route du Braye, and domestic in scale. The proposed development is predominantly two storey, and the

design and form, including the steep pitched roofs, gable orientation and incorporation of bay windows, draws from the surrounding context. The proposals do not relate to 'high buildings' within the terms of Policy DBE3. A limited palette of materials has been used, reflecting the use of materials in the area. Opportunities to provide features to the buildings (e.g. at the corner of La Route du Braye/Rue du Tertre or locating the warden's building to provide a vista stop from the entrance to the development) have been taken. These approaches help to provide visual interest in the existing and new townscape.

The Brief states that the built form should achieve high environmental and energy efficiency performance. No information has been submitted with regard to the sustainability of the development, however there is no strong development plan policy to support this approach and the Department is not currently in a position to require sustainable construction techniques outside of those required under the Building Regulations. It is therefore recommended that an informative be added to any decision encouraging the use of sustainable construction techniques.

Amenity space on the development is predominantly communal, through the provision of communal gardens and a community hall. Each unit has a small private amenity space, either in the form of a balcony or terrace, however the wider lawned areas have been kept open to facilitate maintenance by the warden. The amenity provision is considered suitable and appropriate for the form of development proposed.

The accommodation on the site is arranged to minimise inter-visibility between units and to ensure the privacy and amenity of those units, whilst fostering a sense of community through the shared areas.

#### Impact on adjoining properties

The road frontage units along La Route du Braye and the majority of Rue du Tertre, and those located at the north of the site (Units 47-50) are positioned to ensure that there would be no adverse impacts on neighbour amenity.

The units located to the west of the site (Units 39-46) are set approximately 7m from the site boundary and approximately 24m from the rear elevations of the adjoining dwellings to the west, with a negligible change in levels between the sites.

The units located to the south of the site (Units 31-38) are set approximately 6m from the site boundary and approximately 22m from the rear elevations of the adjoining dwellings at the closest point. Those units are also proposed to be built up, with floor levels and modest rear terraces approximately 1.2m above ground level.

It is proposed to install 1.8m fencing along the site boundaries adjacent to Units 31-46, and to undertake supplementary planting, providing some protection to the amenity of the adjoining properties from garden and ground floor level. This proposal would have no adverse visual impact where the fence would be located between properties, or adjacent to parking areas, however the plans indicate extension of the fencing forward of the building line towards La Route du Braye. This would have an unacceptable visual impact and should be omitted by condition.

Given the distance of the adjoining dwellings from the site boundaries and the relative orientation of the buildings, the Units would not have any significant impact in terms of overshadowing.

The proposals do however comprise the introduction of large buildings in relatively close proximity to the site boundary, particularly to the south, and with first floor windows facing towards the neighbouring properties. The first floor units are however orientated to face into the site and the windows facing the boundaries are generally bedrooms and bathrooms. The length of the rear amenity spaces associated with the neighbouring dwellings, and the resulting distance between buildings also provide some mitigation of the impact on the adjoining properties. On balance, it is considered that the building locations proposed are adequate to respect the amenity of existing residents.

The units located at the southern end of Rue du Tertre (Units 9-14) would face across the Rue du Tertre to the east towards the private amenity space associated with the semi-detached properties known as Asta (labelled Bernica on the submitted plans) and Beinn Ghuilean, which front on to La Route du Braye. The facing windows in this case would serve a mix of bedrooms and habitable rooms, and would be located approximately 8m from the boundary of the nearest property. Representations have been received from both of these properties. The proposed units however comprise road frontage development and are separated from the adjacent units by the public highway. In light of the intervening road and the distance between the windows and the property boundary, the level of overlooking arising from the proposal is however not considered to be unreasonable in a Guernsey context.

## Landscape character

The Development Brief identifies that the lower southern section of the site has no important features worthy of protection, except the historic boulder walls/stone faced banks around the roadside perimeter of the site. As stated above, the loss of the existing roadside boundaries in their entirety as proposed is unfortunate, however, on balance, the road safety improvements are considered to outweigh the impact of the loss of the existing roadside features.

The slope up towards the north end of the site is a distinctive feature of the locality, and views of this feature and up to the protected building in the north-east corner are identified as of importance within the Brief. As proposed, the development would involve excavation at the base of this slope and the formation of retaining features up to 3m high. This excavation is not sympathetic to the underlying landscape character or historical topography related to the setting of Le Tertre, however it does have the benefit of a clear definition between the new development and the protected building, retaining the protected building in isolation on the higher ground, and ensuring that the development is accessible for those with mobility issues. Public views across the site from outside of the site boundaries will be limited by the roadside development and the excavation will be of negligible impact in those views. Views of the protected building and associated walled garden will however be retained from within the site, over the open garden area. On balance, and subject to the provision of accurate plans detailing the alterations in levels across the site and specifically of the proposed retaining features and mitigating planting, the proposed excavation is considered acceptable.

The soft landscaping scheme submitted provides few details of species or density of planting and a detailed scheme should be required by condition to ensure the development will assimilate with its surroundings. The detailed scheme should make a positive contribution to ameliorating the impact of the whole development, including the use of planting to define spatial structures and enclosures and to enhance amenity for the benefit of residents.

The Brief identifies that the southern part of the site, whilst supporting no particularly rare or distinctive wildlife habitats, does allow for considerable populations of common hedgerow flora and fauna and forms part of a corridor across the Clos du Valle which provides a range of habitats. To maintain this environmental value, it is recommended that where possible the landscaping scheme should provide opportunities to encourage wildlife. It is noted that the proposed hedging species (Griselina litoralis) along La Route du Braye/Rue du Tertre frontage is not appropriate in this location and an alternative species should be considered. This hedging would also need to be appropriately positioned to maintain the visibility splays from the relevant accesses.

The Brief also identifies that the majority of the important trees on the site are located in the northern section, and those trees are the subject of Tree Protection Orders. The majority of the development is set away from those trees, however works are indicated in close proximity to the tree in the south-west corner of the walled garden of Le Tertre. Consideration of impact on that tree should form part of the details of the retaining structure required above. Measures should be taken to protect trees during the course of works, including locations where new trees or other structural planting could provide greatest benefit.

The Tree Survey Plan appended to the Brief identified a number of trees of moderate quality and value located in the southern section of the site, and the Brief indicates that as many of those native/naturalised trees as possible are included within any development.

Subsequent to the preparation of the Brief, a number of the trees shown on the Tree Survey Plan have been removed, including the row through the centre and those on the east boundary of the southern section of the site. The trees located along the existing access track from Rue du Tertre remain, however these are in the proposed location of the access. The trees along the south and west boundary, and those located at the point where the land begins to rise, however remain on site and could be incorporated within the landscaping scheme.

The Brief recommends that the materials for the hard surfacing should be selected from both locally distinctive and ordinary surface materials to achieve mutually compatible textures/colours, variety and interest. The submitted plans indicate the use of a variety of surfacing materials, used to differentiate between different areas of the site. It is however noted that the inclusion of pedestrian paths to both sides of the primary access road is an urbanising feature, which could be ameliorated through the use of shared surfacing.

There are concerns regarding the boundary treatments proposed to the parking areas forward of Units 21-10, and the proposed method of addressing the change in levels along the road. The scale elevations for these elements do not reflect the wall heights indicated on the site layout plans and the use of rendered concrete retaining walls, topped with aluminium railings would introduce an inappropriate urban aesthetic to this area. It is recommended that this element is reserved for further consideration.

## **Protected Building**

This application does not propose any alteration to, or works within the immediate setting of the protected building known as Le Tertre located in the north-east corner of the site. The proposed division of the site would retain the grounds around the building, preserving the outbuildings and setting and would not prejudice the future renovation of the building.

The 'motte' or raised area surrounding the building and the falling escarpment to the south are identified in the Brief as important to the setting of Le Tertre. As outlined above, the proposed excavation to accommodate Units 47-50 would impact on the fall of the escarpment, however, providing that the division between the sites is adequately detailed, it is considered that any impact can be mitigated against.

#### **Archaeology**

The Development Brief sets out the desirability of undertaking archaeological investigations prior to development commencing on site, and this approach is reflected in the Archaeology consultation response reproduced above.

No scheme of investigation has been submitted as part of the current application, however the Archaeology response indicates the southern part of the site, which forms the subject of this application, is of less interest than the north and the archaeologist has contacted the developers independently. The applicant has confirmed that initial investigations have commenced on site.

It is however recommended that an informative relating to the archaeology of the site is attached to any decision.

#### **Building Regulations**

The submitted plans do not raise any significant issues with regard to the Building Regulations, subject to minor alterations to address the detail of the Guernsey Technical Standards.

#### Further comments in relation to representations

The utility providers were consulted during the preparation of the Development Brief for this site, and all indicated there was capacity for connection to the services in the area. The Planning and Design Statement reflects this indication, noting that some upgrading of existing infrastructure provision will need to be undertaken as part of the development, including the provision of soakaways and upgrading of drainage systems.

The development is for Sheltered Housing for the over 55s and would not result in an influx of children into the area. The development would not therefore impact on the education provision in the area.

#### Conclusion

Having regard to the matters set out above, the proposal is considered to be in compliance with the Development Brief and to accord with the relevant policies of the Urban Area Plan and it is recommended that the application be approved subject to the following conditions and informatives:

#### Recommended conditions:

- Restrict use to sheltered housing only.
- Implementation of road widening and junction alterations prior to commencement of any other work on site, unless otherwise agreed as part of comprehensive phasing proposals.
- Further details of:
  - Site levels.
  - Means of enclosure to all boundaries.
  - The proposed excavations and treatment of the northern boundary of the site, to the rear of Units 47-50, in particular detailing the changes in levels, any retaining features and measures to ensure the protection of the Protected Tree.
  - The parking areas and associated boundary treatments forward of Units 19-30.
- Samples of external facing, roofing and surfacing materials.
- Completion of parking prior to occupancy of site.
- Lighting strategy.
- Landscaping scheme.
- Planting requirements.
- Rendering of walls and dark staining of fences.
- Protection of trees during the course of works (including on northern part of site).

# Informatives:

- No consent for the erection of fencing forward of the building line on Route du Braye.
- Archaeology watching brief.
- Incorporation of sustainable construction techniques where possible.

Date: 23<sup>rd</sup> October 2014



## **PLANNING APPLICATION REPORT**

 Application No:
 FULL/2014/1975

 Property Ref:
 D006570000

 Valid date:
 14/07/2014

Location: Frie Plaidy Reservoir Rue Des Morts Le Preel Le Preel Castel Guernsey GY6

7DL

**Proposal:** Relocation of Transmitting Station comprising of a 45m lattice tower,

antenna and associated equipment cabinets, erection of fencing and new

landscape planting.

Applicant: Argiva Limited

**RECOMMENDATION - Grant: Planning Permission with Conditions:** 

1. All development authorised by this permission must be carried out and must be completed in every detail in accordance with the written application, plans and drawings referred to above. No variations to such development amounting to development may be made without the permission of the Environment Department under the Law.

Reason - To ensure that it is clear that permission is only granted for the development to which the application relates.

2. The development hereby permitted shall be begun within 3 years from the date of grant of this permission.

Reason - This condition reflects section 18(1) of the Land Planning and Development (Guernsey) Law, 2005 which states that planning permission ceases to have effect unless development is commenced within 3 years of the date of grant (or such shorter period as may be specified in the permission).

3. The development hereby permitted and all the operations which constitute or are incidental to that development must be carried out in compliance with all such requirements of The Building (Guernsey) Regulations, 2012 as are applicable to them, and no operation to which such a requirement applies may be commenced or continued unless (i) plans relating to that operation have been approved by the Environment Department and (ii) it is commenced or, as the case may be, continued, in accordance with that requirement and any further requirements imposed by the Environment Department when approving those plans, for the purpose of securing that the building regulations are complied with.

Reason - Any planning permission granted under the Law is subject to this condition as stated in section 17(2) of the Land Planning and Development (Guernsey) Law, 2005.

4. Prior to the commencement of any development on the site a full airport safeguarding and airport approach/departure profile check must be carried out and submitted to and approved in writing by the Environment Department. The report shall be commissioned through Guernsey Airport with the National Air Traffic Services. Any works required as a consequence of these checks to adjust airport profiles shall be introduced before construction works are completed on site. The costs of these checks and of any necessary works shall be paid by the applicant.

Reason - To ensure that the development would not have a detrimental impact on the safe running or operation of the airport, in full accordance with National Air Traffic Service regulations.

5. The development for which permission is hereby granted shall not be commenced until full details of the surfacing materials proposed to be used on the proposed access track have been submitted to and approved by the Environment Department.

Reason - To ensure a satisfactory external appearance in the interests of visual amenity.

6. Prior to the commencement of any development works all trees to be retained on/adjacent to the site and likely to be affected by the development or contractors work areas shall be fenced within the site along a line 1.0m beyond their crown spread or to a radius of 12 times their stem diameter, whichever is greater, with a 1.8m steel mesh panel fence with anchor blocks and backstays securely pinned to the ground, and maintained in place until the effective completion of the development. Pre-printed laminated waterproof signs, A4 size, reading "ROOT PROTECTION AREA No Storage or Operations within the fenced area" shall be fixed to the fencing at 7.0m minimum intervals. Where specifically approved development would encroach into a protected area, the Root Protection Area fence may be set back as necessary to allow a maximum 1.5m access width between the fence and approved construction works, provided that this access width is and remains protected by close-butted scaffold boarding laid on a compressible layer (e.g. min 50mm depth of woodchips) on geotextile fabric on the existing undisturbed ground, all in accordance with BS5837:2012 Trees in Relation to Construction.

Reason - To protect existing trees at or adjoining the site in the interests of amenity.

7. No equipment, machinery or materials shall be brought on to the site for the purposes of the development until agreement is obtained from the Environment Department that tree root protection area fencing has been constructed in a satisfactory manner. Materials must not be stored within any area fenced in accordance with this condition and the ground levels within those areas shall not be altered, or any excavation made (including for any underground services) without the written consent of the Environment Department. Material which may contaminate the soil, e.g. concrete mixings, diesel oil and vehicle washings, shall not be discharged within 10m of any tree stem, and fires shall not be lit where flames could extend to within 5m of the edge of any tree canopy.

Reason - To protect existing trees at or adjoining the site in the interests of amenity.

8. No trees shall be lopped, topped or felled without the express prior written consent of the Environment Department.

Reason - To protect existing trees at or adjoining the site in the interests of amenity.

9. All planting comprised in the hereby approved landscape scheme shall be carried out in the first planting season following the substantive completion of the development. Any trees or plants which die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar size and species, unless the Environment Department gives written approval to any variation.

Reason - To ensure a satisfactory form of development in the interests of visual amenity.

10. The cabins and cabinets hereby approved as part of this application shall be painted green.

Reason - To ensure that the detailed design of the development is satisfactory.

11. The equipment hereby approved shall be removed from the site when no longer required for broadcasting purposes and the land reinstated to its former condition to the satisfaction of the

**Environment Department.** 

Reason - In the interests of visual amenity.

12. The mast hereby approved shall be made available for mast sharing in the event of other telecommunications or radio operators requiring similar facilities in the future, so as to prevent a proliferation of masts in this area.

Reason - To comply with States policy to require mast sharing wherever practicable.

13. A scheme for the removal of the existing mast and all associated equipment and structures on that site shall be submitted to and approved by the Environment Department prior to the commencement of any works hereby approved. The scheme shall include a comprehensive methodology for the remediation and reinstatement of the land to its former condition, or such alternative condition as shall be first agreed by the Environment Department in writing. The scheme shall then be implemented in accordance with these approved details, and the existing mast shall be removed from that site in its entirety within 14 days of installation of the mast hereby approved.

Reason – To ensure that the existing mast is satisfactorily removed from that site and that the land is returned to an appropriate condition in the interests of visual amenity.

#### **OFFICER'S REPORT**

#### **Site Description:**

The application site is part of the Frie Plaidy Reservoir, a covered reservoir and associated infrastructure and plant operated by Guernsey Water. The site is bounded to the north by Rue Des Morts, to the east a residential property (Les Muriers), and Rue de Frie Plaidy to the west. On the southern boundary a hedge bank and trees separate the reservoir from open land.

The site is in an Area of High Landscape Quality, in the Rural Area Plan area. Annexe 1 of the Rural Area Plan identifies the site as within an Upland Landscape.

The application site is 145m in length, 70m in width narrowing to 15m towards the west. The site is accessed from the junction of Rue Des Morts and Rue Du Frie Plaidy via an existing gate. A track runs from this gate to the east of the site where there is a subterranean reservoir. The reservoir measures approximately 28m by 28m and projects above ground by approximately 3.5m. The above ground walls have been earthed up to form banks laid to grass and the roof of the reservoir is also grassed over. To the north and east of the reservoir there are a number of above ground cabinets and associated works. Palisade fencing surrounds the underground works to the west with an established hedge to the north.

## **Relevant History:**

PREA/2014/1019	Environmental Impact	April 2014
	Assessment Screening	
	Opinion for Relocation of the	
	Les Touillets Transmitting	
	Station	
FULL/2009/3691	Erect enclosure to house	Permitted
	pump control equipment	07/01/2010

PAPP/2009/0835	Reinforce field surface	Permitted
		29/05/2009
PAPP/2008/2338	Install on site electro-	No objection raised
	chlorination plant and	26/08/2008
	equipment.	
PAPP/2003/1519	Erect security fencing.	No objection raised
		17/11/2003

## Existing Use(s):

Covered water reservoir

#### **Brief Description of Development:**

The application is for the relocation of a transmitting station, involving the erection of a 45m lattice tower surmounted by TV antenna, mobile telephone antennas, radio dish links and other assorted antennas and 8 equipment cabins, a meter cabinet with feeder gantries. An existing track within the site would be extended to the tower, and security fencing erected. The tower and equipment would be sited on the south east part of the site. The existing mast and equipment will be removed from its current site.

## Relevant Policies of any Plan, Subject Plan or Local Planning Brief:

## Rural Area Plan

Marar 7 (1 Ca 1 Tall	
RD1	<b>Essential Development</b>
RCE3	Areas of high landscape quality
RCE7	Public views
RCE8	Landscape design
RGEN13	Airport safety
RGEN3	Landscape, Ecology and wildlife
RGEN5	Character and amenity
RGEN6	Design
RGEN7	Safe and convenient access
RGEN11	Effect on adjoining properties

#### **Representations:**

6 Letters of objection have been received raising points including:-

- The present site should be subject to compulsory purchase by the States of Guernsey as a major item of Island infrastructure
- The towering bulk and mass of the mast would have a significant impact on the two properties in Rue Des Morts
- The impact of the proposed development on the trees in neighbouring gardens and on the site has not been considered in light of Policies RCE3 and RGEN3
- The impact of the development on the reasonable enjoyment of properties on Route De L'Eglise
- The heritage impacts on the neighbouring conservation area
- The arboriculture impacts on protected trees in the immediate vicinity
- The character and quality of the natural and built environment that will be created specifically in terms of potential health issues to residents and potential unlawful access to the site
- The appropriateness of the development in relation to its surroundings in terms of its design, layout, scale and materials to be used

- Tree Protection Orders should be considered for the trees on and surrounding the site
- The removal of one side of the grass bank covering the reservoir would have a detrimental impact on visual amenity
- Little information has been given to nearby residents on the location of alternative sites, appearing to be a fait accompli
- Alternative sites that would have less impact on the surrounding properties and be better screened are available
- Moving the tower closer to Rue Du Frie Plaidy would significantly affect the visual impact of the Ruette Tranquille as well as the properties that surround it, at present it is shielded by huge trees having minimal impact
- The proposed position, size, scale and design of the development does not represent a solution with the least possible impact and would be contrary to Policy RD1
- The design of the mast and missed opportunities to reduce the height of it
- The approach by the agents in demonstrating that there is no suitable alternative sites for the proposed development
- The alternative sites put forward by the agents relate to operational and environmental perspectives, however the environmental impact is difficult to assess, looking at the site however it is not clear how the proposed siting will not affect the trees
- There is a lack of assessment of the visual impact of the alternative sites within the application; an alternative site to the west of the reservoir has the potential to have less of a visual effect on the landscape character, by appropriate screening this site would be less visually dominant on the conservation area.

In addition to the letters of representation, four reports have been commissioned by objectors in relation to landscape and visual amenity impacts; technical justifications and two separate Arboricultural impact assessments.

Objectors have also requested that the Board makes a site visit and views the development from adjacent private properties.

## **Consultations:**

**Guernsey Water** – we are fully involved in the planning of the tower and have no comments other than to confirm that Guernsey Water is happy for the development to go ahead.

**Constables of Castel** – No objections raised, however the Douzaine is disappointed that the application to move a vital part of the Island's infrastructure is necessary particularly when it has served the island very well in its current location for years.

**La Societe Guernesiaise** – the on-site block of planted Oaks to the west of the water storage mound is entirely preserved, no objections to the scheme.

**Health and Social Services** – No objections based upon the 'declaration of Conformity with ICNIRP Public Exposure Guidelines'.

Guernsey Airport – The Initial view from the National Air Traffic Services (NATS) is that the move of the antenna would not have an impact on the existing procedure minima but a full assessment would be required. Our recommendation is therefore that the proposals should include a condition that the proposals are subject to a full airport safeguarding and airport approach/departure profile check to be commissioned through Guernsey Airport with NATS. These checks would need to be completed ahead of any construction works commencing on site and the costs shall be covered by the applicant.

## **Summary of Issues:**

The reason for the development
Why was this site chosen
Alternative sites
The proposed development
Design of the mast, potential alternatives and justification
Impact on the visual amenity and landscape character of the area
Impact on residential amenity
Issues surrounding the compulsory purchase of the site and the retention of the existing structure

#### **Assessment against:**

- 1 Purposes of the law.
- 2 Relevant policies of any Plan, Subject Plan or Local Planning Brief.
- 3 General material considerations set out in the General Provisions Ordinance.
- 4 Additional considerations (for protected trees, monuments, buildings and/or SSS's).

#### The reason for the development

The transmitting station is currently located adjacent to Route de L'Eglise on an area of land that is currently leased from a private landowner. The lease is due to expire in 2016 and the landowner has indicated that the lease may not be renewed. In order to safeguard this facility the applicant is seeking an alternative site.

Arqiva, the applicant, owns and operates the entire UK terrestrial television broadcast network and freeview platform and a service for the national and local radio. Les Touillets site was first established in 1976 to provide the required service coverage following enhancements in television broadcasting. Previously TV signals had been provided from the main station at Freemont Point in Jersey. Although little has changed on the site since 1976, this mast is still required to provide uninterrupted continuation of broadcasting services. In addition to the television broadcasting the mast also supports antennas for radio broadcasting services and a number of third party sharers including RNLI, St. John's Ambulance and some mobile telephone network providers. The development proposed would provide a single site solution to replicate signal coverage over the Islands.

The proposed development is considered to be physical infrastructure essential to the public interest and therefore Rural Area Plan Policy RD1 is engaged. Under this policy, the Environment Department will generally support proposals where they are in compliance with the primary objective of the Plan in conserving and enhancing the rural environment, even if they may conflict with certain specific policies. However the Department will need to be satisfied that the particular location can be clearly justified and that the proposals represent the best practicable environmental option. Such developments may, exceptionally, be allowed where:-

- a) there is no alternative site available that, in the opinion of the Department, is more suitable for the proposed development;
- b) the chosen position for the development within the site will have the least possible visual impact on the surrounding landscape and would present the best practicable environmental option;
- c) materials sympathetic to the surrounding landscape are utilised. The preference will be for materials that will assist in harmonising the development with its surroundings;
- d) the development is of very high design quality and accords with Policy RGEN6; and,
- e) landscape design, as may be required by Policy RCE8, forms an integral part of the proposal.

## Why was this site chosen

The applicant has submitted a comprehensive statement in support of the application and the chosen site. The Frie Plaidy site is considered by the applicant as the optimal site. The proposed development would be located circa 80m to the south west of the existing site. The close proximity of this site to the existing site is operationally important and this is considered by Arqiva to be the best site, providing the best alternative coverage solution for terrestrial television whilst providing a satisfactory alternative for the other operators that utilise the tower. The applicants also state that the existing reservoir site already accommodates public utility infrastructure and as such the further use of the site for electronic communications infrastructure represents a sustainable form of land use. The characteristics of the site with the earth banks means that these can be utilised to help screen the ground based equipment and the existing access from the junction of Rue Des Morts and Rue du Frie Plaidy can also be used. The applicants consider this site to minimise the impact of the development on the environment and amenity of neighbouring properties.

## Alternative sites

The applicant, in assessing the suitability of alternative sites, considered certain general attributes capacity to accommodate a large mast and to provide the same geographical spread of broadcast coverage. In order to achieve the latter Arqiva states that the broadcasting antennas need to be roughly the same height as the existing antennas and therefore either the tower must be higher or the land height needs to be similar to the existing site. Consideration to lateral displacement has also influenced consideration of alternative sites as an alteration from the original location can also lead to loss of coverage, and the further away a new mast is located from the existing more viewers would need to re-orientate their aerials. The relocation of the mast may also need to be approved by OFCOM and given the close proximity of the Island to France, international agreement may also be necessary.

On the basis of the above constraints as identified by Arqiva, alternative site selection considered existing masts, undeveloped sites and also included a desk top analysis of sites up to 2km away from the existing mast and with similar contours. Nine sites were identified as part of this research. These sites following on-island inspections were reduced down to eight possible sites, however after further analysis the chosen site Frie Plaidy was identified as the only site being likely to be acceptable in coverage terms whilst maintaining the same height. The other alternative sites would have required higher masts of up to 100m in height.

Representations question how the search for alternative sites was conducted and in addition to this a report on 'Alternative engineering of Les Touillets TV, radio and telecommunications tower' is produced by BITSTREAM BROADCASTING. Whilst this report states that there is no argument with the predictions submitted by Arqiva, given that their brief was to use identical transmission parameters to those that currently exist, they fail to acknowledge that transmission will be affected by height changes or location movements. The report states that on the basis that only the height parameter has been considered then the application site would appear to be the optimal location. The Bitstream report concludes that alternative designs could however be utilised making the alternative sites more suitable both from operational and environmental perspectives.

#### The proposed Development

The proposed development comprises a 45m lattice steel tower surmounted by a TV antenna; the mast would accommodate a number of antennas and apparatus, to a total height of 54.86m. The mast would be sited to the south east of the underground reservoir adjacent to open fields and landscaped boundaries. Ground based equipment in the form of five equipment cabins and three cabinets and feeder gantries would be positioned parallel to the site boundary and north of the mast.

All elements of the development will be enclosed within a fenced compound. In addition to the above works a new section of track is proposed to serve the mast and equipment. To accommodate the track a section of the earth bund to the north section of the reservoir would be removed. The track would be constructed of hard core mixed with existing topsoil.

#### Design of the mast, potential alternatives and justification

The mast would be of the same design, materials and height as the existing mast sited circa 80m from the site. Representations submitted have questioned the need for a tower of this height and design. The height of the tower at 54.86m overall (inclusive of the TV transmission antenna) particularly given the 24 metre high tree line is questioned in the Bitstream report which considers that with different transmitter power inputs and the technologies of different antennas the height of the proposed mast could be reduced. In addition it states that alternative technologies now available could result in a much reduced structure profile.

The report considers 3 possible options that both reduce the height and slim the tower profile. These proposals include reducing the Les Touillets structure height by 10m to 45m; reducing the height to 41m and slimming the profile and a two tower solution. The report acknowledges that the penultimate and concluding options would be more radical approaches and result in the possible displacement of some of the operators from the existing tower, but that the first option would be possible concluding that the mast could be reduced by 10m - 15m in height, but that Arqiva had failed to explore this option.

Arqiva has responded to these options stating that different designs and heights have been explored at the design stage, however given the regulator licence in relation to Effective Radiated Power (ERP) that Argiva are licensed to operate at by OFCOM, lowering the height of the mast would result in a need to increase ERP beyond that for which they are licensed. Although they acknowledge that alternative slim-line antennas may be available and capable of use by increasing the ERP, the company's ability to effectively and safely maintain the equipment would be called into question. In addition Argiva has explored the option with OFCOM of increasing the ERP level for which they are licensed, but have been informed by OFCOM that this would require international regulatory approvals and that such an approach at this time would be unlikely to be successful. The combining of antennas to reduce the number as suggested by Bitstream would require the approval of the broadcasters but would impact on new services to be provided from the site, such as Digital radio. Operational implications on the Horizontal Radiated Pattern (HRP) and Vertical Radiated Pattern (VRP) would be affected by a slimmer tower and would affect the ability to maintain the equipment and tower in situ. In conclusion whilst changes to the structure may be possible the implications of doing this could severely affect operational process and services to Islanders. Argiva believe that the existing design and structure should be retained and that the Frie Plaidy site is the optimal site to best balance environmental and operational factors.

## Impact on the visual amenity and landscape character of the area.

The application site is an Area of High Landscape Quality as defined within the Rural Area Plan and as such regard should be given to Policy RCE3. This policy states: "In Areas of High Landscape Quality, development will only be permitted where:

- a) the development would not have a significant adverse effect on the visual quality or landscape character of the area; and,
- b) in the case of proposals to rebuild, extend or alter existing structures the development would respect the size, form, bulk and siting of the original structure.

Permission will not be granted for the replacement of buildings or other structures that are derelict or structurally unsound and, in cases involving dwellings, currently not habitable."

Policy RGEN3 of the same Plan relates to Landscape, ecology and wildlife and states: "In considering proposals for development the Department will take into account existing features of landscape, ecological or wildlife value and the appropriate provision of new or improved landscape, ecological or wildlife features."

Like the existing mast, the proposed mast will be visible in numerous distant views across the Island. However in those long views, the proposed position would not be perceived as significantly different to the existing.

The impact is more significant in close views. The removal of the existing tower will benefit views along Rue du Preel/ Route de l'Eglise, particularly from the west. The existing mast is to the east of Les Muriers. The proposed position is to the south west of that house, approximately 50m from the rear elevation, and to the south east of the two houses fronting Rue des Morts, The Elms and Alice Springs, approximately 65m from the front elevation. The proposed site is virtually due west of Les Touillets, on Ruette de Touillets; the existing site is to its north west.

The mast would be sited on the south east corner of the site where existing trees and landscaping to the south and east boundaries would help screen the lower sections of the development whilst to the north and west the lower sections would be screened by the above ground sections of the reservoir.

The development will have an impact on visual amenity; the applicant has tried to mitigate these impacts by siting the development away from the public highway and utilising the existing structures on the site. The mast although substantial in height is a lattice tower, which gives some relief to the structure and the siting of the mast in an area that contains infrastructure, apparatus and structures limits the visual impact compared to an entirely new site on undeveloped land. Landscape mitigation measures are also proposed and are considered effective in reducing the impact of the proposed mast to the greatest reasonable extent. The mast is proposed close to the reservoir area to limit the impacts on the existing landscape and the position of the mast would not require the removal of any trees. Although pruning is proposed to two trees outside of the site that overhang the reservoir, when taken in context and viewed with the existing landscape this would have no impact on the landscape character of the area.

The effect of development on the trees, affecting root systems and proposed crown lifting, is raised in the tree reports submitted on behalf of objectors.

Arboricultural reports have been submitted from both the applicant and objectors which contradict each other. Although both agree that works will be carried out in close proximity to the boundary trees, the applicant's Arboricultural adviser indicates ways that these works can be carried out successfully without substantial harm to or subsequent loss of the trees. It is this conclusion which the reports commissioned by the objectors dispute and a request for the trees to be protected under a Tree Protection Order has also been made. The request has been considered but it is not concluded that the trees are under considerable threat. The use of conditions and the implementation of these coupled with the management works indicated in the applicant's arboriculture report are considered satisfactory to ensure that the proposed works would not have a detrimental impact on the existing landscaping.

The re-siting of this mast to the Frie Plaidy site is therefore not considered to have such a significantly greater detrimental impact on visual amenity or landscape character than currently exists so as to warrant refusal of planning permission on these grounds. The proposed development would not conflict with Policies RCE3 or RGEN3, or with Policy RGEN6 regarding design. It includes proposals for landscape design in compliance with Policy RCE8.

The representations also raise concerns regarding the impact of the proposed development on the

conservation area. The nearest conservation area is to the west of the site, bounded by Rue du Frie Plaidy and Ruette de St Briocq, more than 100m from the proposed site. It is not considered that the character, appearance or setting of the conservation area will be affected by the proposed development.

#### Impact on residential amenity

Policy RGEN11 of the Rural Area Plan states: "In considering proposals for development the Department will take into account any significant impact on the reasonable enjoyment of adjoining properties, particularly in relation to overshadowing, overlooking, emissions, noise and disturbance."

Whilst it is not disputed that the mast will be visible from residential properties in the near vicinity, it is the impacts of that on residential amenity and whether it is detrimental in relation to overshadowing, overlooking, noise and disturbance which need to be considered.

The mast would be a minimum distance of 50m away from the nearest residential dwellings 'Alice Springs' and 'The Elms' on Rue des Morts, and 'Les Muriers' on Route des L'Eglise, circa 70m from 'Les Touillets' on Ruette Des Touillets and around 145m from the five dwellings on Rue du Frie Plaidy. Although the views of the mast from 'Les Muriers' would be, given the orientation of the property on the plot, from a more oblique angle than the outlook from 'The Elms', 'Alice Springs', 'Les Touillets' and the other dwellings to the west of the site, the mast will be adjacent to the boundary of this property. An invitation to view the site from the garden area of 'Les Muriers' was provided by the occupiers and the case officer has viewed the application site from the rear garden area of this property. As previously stated the mast is of a lattice tower design meaning that although significant in form and size views through the open lattice structure are maintained. The mast is also proposed to be sited to the furthest point away from these residential properties within the Frie Plaidy Reservoir site. Presently the outlook from the surrounding properties is over the earth mound and associated reservoir equipment and although the visual appearance of this has been softened by the earth covering, the site is still very much man-made. The lower sections of the mast would be screened by the existing structures and landscaping. The upper sections of the mast would be seen above the ground works. Views of the existing mast particularly from the properties on Rue Des Frie Plaidy, Ruettes des Touillets and Le Muriers are possible and as such despite the re-location of the mast, the impact on residential amenity from these properties is not considered to be significantly different from at present.

Whilst the views of the mast will be increased from those currently experienced from 'Alice Springs' and 'the Elms' on Rue Des Morts, the proposed siting and design of the mast, the utilisation of the existing site characteristics and the proposed mitigation measures are considered to reduce the overall impact of the mast. Although it is acknowledged that these factors will not totally alleviate views of the mast from these dwellings, the proposed tower is not considered to be overbearing, or to cause overshadowing. The proposed transmitting station will affect private views, which are not a material planning consideration or protected under planning law. It is not considered that the development would have an adverse impact on residential amenity or interfere with the enjoyment of these properties to such a degree that the application would be contrary to Policy RGEN11 – Effect on adjoining properties.

Concerns by nearby residents have been raised in regard to health and safety issues and the security of the mast. In respect to health, an ICNIRP certificate has been submitted with the application. An ICNIRP Certificate is an international recognised declaration of conformity that the development accords to the limits of exposure of the general public to electromagnetic fields in all areas legitimately accessible by the public. The siting of the mast within an existing secure site compound and some distance from the entrance to the site from the junction with Rues Des Morts and Rue du

Frie Plaidy would mean that access to the mast and the associated equipment will be restricted. Additional palisade fencing surrounding the development is proposed as part of the application.

Issues surrounding the compulsory purchase of the site and the retention of the existing structure

Questions have been raised by objectors regarding retaining the existing site through compulsory purchase.

The existing site is in private ownership and leased to Arqiva. In Guernsey, the States of Deliberation has powers to compulsorily acquire land and the possibility of doing so has not been presented for debate.

The Telecommunications (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2001 provides rights to certain licensed parties to remain on land. The applicant has confirmed they have explored the potential to obtain such a licence under the Telecommunications (Bailiwick of Guernsey) Law, 2001. Arqiva does not have such a licence and there is no provision for the company to apply.

However even if that Law was amended, before compulsory acquisition can be made, it must be demonstrated that all other potential solutions had been considered and that compulsory purchase is the last resort. On this hypothetical basis therefore it would first have to be demonstrated that the relocation of the mast had been fully explored.

Those Laws however are not considerations for the Environment Department and the application is presented for decision and requires to be determined in accordance with the Land Planning and Development (Guernsey) Law, 2005.

#### Conclusion

An application of this type is without doubt going to raise neighbour concern and have an element of impact. However given the nature of the development many factors need to be considered and whilst the development will have some impact on landscape character, visual and residential amenity, these impacts have been assessed against operational requirements and the need to secure the uninterrupted continuation of this essential Island infrastructure which falls within the terms of Rural Area Plan Policy RD1 – Essential Development. The application has been supported by comprehensive studies and justification for the proposed works in terms of siting and the structure of the mast and although this information has been questioned and disputed by representors the supporting information is accepted as accurate and appropriately addresses the planning issues raised by the proposal.

The application has been subject to a detailed assessment in light of a number of policies within the Rural Area Plan, material planning considerations and purpose of the Law. The Department has also carried out a comprehensive consultation process and due consideration has been given to the letters of representation and the reports submitted as part of those representations.

It is therefore concluded that in light of all the information and for the reasons above, the application complies with the relevant policies of the Rural Area Plan, including Policies RD1, RCE3, RCE8, RGEN3, RGEN6 and RGEN11, and would not have a detrimental impact on the Area of High Landscape Quality, visual amenity or residential amenity sufficient to warrant refusal of planning permission. The application for the reasons above is therefore considered to accord with the provisions of the Rural Area Plan, material planning considerations and purpose of the Law and is recommended for approval.

Date: 24th October 2014