



Date of Vote: 24th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
Social Security Department
Planning a Sustainable Future -
The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Amendment (1)
Proposed by: Deputy M J Fallaize
Deputy C J Green

To delete Propositions 6, 18 and 25 and substitute therefor:

- "6. *To agree not to incorporate in a States' Resolution an upper or lower limit on aggregate States' income or expenditure in relation to Gross Domestic Product.*"
- "18. *To direct the committee or committees of the States preparing the Supported Living and Ageing Well Strategy to ensure that any proposals made in connection with the Strategy have due regard to the fiscal and social policies and responsibilities of the States.*"
- "25. *To note that the mandate of the Social Welfare Benefits Investigation Committee already requires it "to develop a single, comprehensive social welfare benefits model...which single, comprehensive model shall be capable of fulfilling and balancing the social and fiscal objectives of the States."*



LOST: Pour: 20 Contre:25 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 2

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **C**
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **C**
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **P**
 Deputy Roger Domaille **C**
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois **C**
 Deputy Robert A. Jones **P**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **C**
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop **C**
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **P**
 Deputy Richard Conder **P**
 Deputy Martin J. Storey **A**
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb **P**
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel **P**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **C**
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **C**
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson **C**
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **C**
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier **C**
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **C**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **P**
 Deputy David B. Jones **C**
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **P**
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe **P**
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **P**
 Deputy Anthony Spruce **C**
 Deputy Garry M. Collins **C**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **C**
 Deputy Christopher J. Green **P**
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey **P**
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **C**
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **A**
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **C**
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam **C**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **C**
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **P**
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **P**
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle **P**
 Deputy Yvonne Burford **P**
 Deputy David A. Inglis **C**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **P**
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars **P**
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon **C**
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **P**
 Deputy Francis W. Quin **C**
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **P**

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **C**
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **C**

*Date of Vote: 24th March, 2015*

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Amendment (2)
Proposed by: Deputy Laurie B Queripel
 Deputy Lester C Queripel

1. To delete Proposition 13 and substitute:

"13. To direct the Social Security Department to investigate options for securing the sustainability of the Social Insurance Fund without increasing the age at which an individual is entitled to claim statutory old-age pension beyond 67, and to report back to the States with their recommendations as soon as possible."

2. To delete Proposition 14.

LOST: Pour: 10 Contre: 36 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 1

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood C
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher C
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut C
 Deputy Roger Domaille C
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois C
 Deputy Robert A. Jones C

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc C
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop C
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne P
 Deputy Richard Conder C
 Deputy Martin J. Storey A
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb C
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel P

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier C
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart C
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson C
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley C
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier P
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott C

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize C
 Deputy David B. Jones C
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel P
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe C
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre C
 Deputy Anthony Spruce C
 Deputy Garry M. Collins C

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin C
 Deputy Christopher J. Green C
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey C
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint P
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq C
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE C
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam C

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot C
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard P
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie P
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle P
 Deputy Yvonne Burford C
 Deputy David A. Inglis C

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby C
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars C
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon C
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara P
 Deputy Francis W. Quin C
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley C

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean P
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE C



2015/15

Date of Vote: 25th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Amendment (3)
Proposed by: Deputy M H Dorey
 Deputy A R Le Lièvre

To delete proposition 10, 11 and 12 and substitute therefor:

"10-12" To direct the Social Security Department to include in the 2015 uprating report the advantages, disadvantages and financial consequences of adopting a policy of uprating pensions annually at the midway point between increases in median earnings and increases in prices."

CARRIED: Pour: 26 Contre:20 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 1

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood C
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher C
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut P
 Deputy Roger Domaille C
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois C
 Deputy Robert A. Jones P

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc C
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop C
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne P
 Deputy Richard Conder P
 Deputy Martin J. Storey A
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb P
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel P

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier C
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart C
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson C
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley P
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier C
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott P

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize P
 Deputy David B. Jones P
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel P
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe P
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre P
 Deputy Anthony Spruce C
 Deputy Garry M. Collins P

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin C
 Deputy Christopher J. Green P
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey P
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint P
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq C
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE C
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam C

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot C
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard P
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie P
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle P
 Deputy Yvonne Burford P
 Deputy David A. Inglis C

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby P
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars C
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon C
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara P
 Deputy Francis W. Quin P
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley C

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean P
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE P

Date of Vote: 26th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
Proposition: The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
 Procedural Motion pursuant to Rule 14(1) of the
 Rules of Procedure
Proposed by: Deputy Lester C Queripel

That debate on the Amendment (6) proposed by Deputy R Conder and seconded by Deputy M H Dorey be closed.

LOST: Pour: 21 Contre: 25 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 1

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **P**
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **C**
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **C**
 Deputy Roger Domaille **C**
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois **C**
 Deputy Robert A. Jones **P**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **P**
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop **P**
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **C**
 Deputy Richard Conder **C**
 Deputy Martin J. Storey **A**
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb **P**
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel **P**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **P**
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **P**
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson **P**
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **P**
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier **C**
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **P**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **C**
 Deputy David B. Jones **P**
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **C**
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe **C**
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **C**
 Deputy Anthony Spruce **P**
 Deputy Garry M. Collins **P**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **C**
 Deputy Christopher J. Green **C**
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey **C**
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **P**
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **C**
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **C**
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam **P**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **P**
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **C**
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **C**
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle **C**
 Deputy Yvonne Burford **C**
 Deputy David A. Inglis **C**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **C**
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars **P**
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon **P**
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **C**
 Deputy Francis W. Quin **P**
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **C**

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **P**
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **C**



Date of Vote: 26th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Procedural Motion pursuant to Rule 14(1) of the
 Rules of Procedure
Proposed by: Deputy P R Le Pelley

That debate on the Amendment (6) proposed by Deputy R Conder and seconded by Deputy M H Dorey be closed.

LOST: Pour: 21 Contre: 24 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 2

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **P**
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **C**
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **C**
 Deputy Roger Domaille **C**
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois **P**
 Deputy Robert A. Jones **C**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **P**
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop **P**
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **C**
 Deputy Richard Conder **C**
 Deputy Martin J. Storey **A**
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb **P**
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel **P**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **P**
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **A**
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson **P**
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **P**
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier **C**
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **P**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **C**
 Deputy David B. Jones **P**
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **C**
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe **C**
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **C**
 Deputy Anthony Spruce **P**
 Deputy Garry M. Collins **C**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **C**
 Deputy Christopher J. Green **C**
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey **C**
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **P**
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **C**
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **C**
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam **P**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **P**
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **C**
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **C**
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle **C**
 Deputy Yvonne Burford **C**
 Deputy David A. Inglis **P**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **P**
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars **C**
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon **P**
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **C**
 Deputy Francis W. Quin **P**
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **C**

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **P**
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **P**



2015/18

Date of Vote: 26th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Amendment 6
Proposed by: Deputy R Conder
Seconded by: Deputy M H Dorey

To delete propositions 38 and 26 and substitute therefor:

"38. To agree that the States shall not introduce a broad-based consumption tax as described in that Report."

"26. To acknowledge that there are risks and challenges associated with the States' considerable reliance – by international standards – on direct personal taxes and social insurance contributions; and to agree in principle that it would be advantageous to diversify sources of States' income in ways which take account of the principle of 'ability to pay'."

CARRIED: Pour: 28 Contre: 18 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 1

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood C
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher C
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut P
 Deputy Roger Domaille C
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois C
 Deputy Robert A. Jones P

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc C
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop C
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne P
 Deputy Richard Conder P
 Deputy Martin J. Storey A
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb P
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel P

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier C
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart C
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson C
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley P
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier P
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott P

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize P
 Deputy David B. Jones P
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel P
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe P
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre P
 Deputy Anthony Spruce C
 Deputy Garry M. Collins P

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin C
 Deputy Christopher J. Green P
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey P
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint P
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq C
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE C
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam C

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot C
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard P
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie P
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle P
 Deputy Yvonne Burford P
 Deputy David A. Inglis C

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby P
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars P
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon C
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara P
 Deputy Francis W. Quin P
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley C

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean P
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE P



2015/19

Date of Vote: 26th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Amendment (7)
Proposed by: Deputy H J R Soulsby
Seconded by: Deputy R Conder

To insert a new proposition between propositions 27 and 28 as follows:

"27B. To direct the Treasury & Resources Department to investigate the implications of, and proposals, if appropriate, for the introduction of a progressive system of income tax with lower tax bands being applied to lower earners and higher tax bands being applied to higher earners and to report no later than 2016".

LOST: Pour: 11 Contre: 35 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 1

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood C
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher C
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut P
 Deputy Roger Domaille C
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois C
 Deputy Robert A. Jones P

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc C
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop C
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne P
 Deputy Richard Conder P
 Deputy Martin J. Storey A
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb C
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel P

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier C
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart C
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson C
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley C
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier C
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott C

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize C
 Deputy David B. Jones C
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel P
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe P
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre C
 Deputy Anthony Spruce C
 Deputy Garry M. Collins C

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin C
 Deputy Christopher J. Green C
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey P
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint C
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq C
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE C
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam C

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot C
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard C
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie P
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle C
 Deputy Yvonne Burford P
 Deputy David A. Inglis C

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby P
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars C
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon C
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara C
 Deputy Francis W. Quin C
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley C

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean C
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE C

*Date of Vote: 26th March, 2015*

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Amendment (8)
Proposed by: Deputy C J Green
Seconded by: Deputy A R Le Lievre

To insert a new Proposition 27A between Propositions 27 and 28 as follows:

"27A. To direct the Treasury & Resources Department, in conjunction with any decision to increase personal tax allowances along the lines set out in Proposition 27, to report to the States with detailed proposals to remove the universality of personal tax allowances and instead to introduce a scheme which provides for personal tax allowances to be withdrawn gradually as a person's income increases up to the point where a person whose income exceeds a certain amount receives no personal tax allowance."

CARRIED: Pour: 46 Contre: 0 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 1

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood P
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher P
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut P
 Deputy Roger Domaille P
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois P
 Deputy Robert A. Jones P

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc P
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop P
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne P
 Deputy Richard Conder P
 Deputy Martin J. Storey A
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb P
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel P

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier P
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart P
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson P
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley P
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier P
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott P

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize P
 Deputy David B. Jones P
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel P
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe P
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre P
 Deputy Anthony Spruce P
 Deputy Garry M. Collins P

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin P
 Deputy Christopher J. Green P
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey P
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint P
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq P
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE P
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam P

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot P
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard P
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie P
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle P
 Deputy Yvonne Burford P
 Deputy David A. Inglis P

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby P
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars P
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon P
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara P
 Deputy Francis W. Quin P
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley P

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean P
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE P



2015/21

Date of Vote: 27th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Amendment (11)
Proposed by: Deputy R Conder
Seconded by: Deputy A R Le Lièvre

*"In Proposition 28, to replace the year "2025" with the year "2035" and to delete the words
 "and that the withdrawal should broadly follow the schedule provided in Appendix 8d".*

LOST: Pour: 6 Contre: 34 Ne vote pas: 4 Absent: 3

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood C
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher C
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut C
 Deputy Roger Domaille C
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois C
 Deputy Robert A. Jones C

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc C
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop C
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne N
 Deputy Richard Conder P
 Deputy Martin J. Storey A
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb C
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel N

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier C
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart A
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson C
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley C
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier C
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott C

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize N
 Deputy David B. Jones C
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel P
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe P
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre P
 Deputy Anthony Spruce C
 Deputy Garry M. Collins C

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin C
 Deputy Christopher J. Green C
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey C
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint P
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq C
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE A
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam C

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot C
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard C
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie P
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle C
 Deputy Yvonne Burford C
 Deputy David A. Inglis C

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby C
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars C
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon C
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara C
 Deputy Francis W. Quin C
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley C

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean N
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE C

Date of Vote: 27th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Amendment (12)
Proposed by: Deputy M H Dorey
Seconded by: Deputy M J Fallaize

"In Proposition 37, to delete "as part of the ongoing budgetary process" and substitute " , and to include in that review consideration of its abolition or reduction and replacement with increases to Tax on Real Property; and further to direct that Department to report to the States as expeditiously as possible with appropriate recommendations, having first analysed the likely effect of such changes on the property market".

LOST: Pour: 14 Contre: 30 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 3

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood C
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher C
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut P
 Deputy Roger Domaille C
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois C
 Deputy Robert A. Jones P

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc C
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop C
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne P
 Deputy Richard Conder P
 Deputy Martin J. Storey A
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb P
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel C

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier C
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart C
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson P
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley C
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier P
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott C

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize P
 Deputy David B. Jones C
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel P
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe P
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre P
 Deputy Anthony Spruce C
 Deputy Garry M. Collins P

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin C
 Deputy Christopher J. Green P
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey P
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint C
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq A
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE A
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam C

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot C
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard C
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie C
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle C
 Deputy Yvonne Burford C
 Deputy David A. Inglis C

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby C
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars C
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon C
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara C
 Deputy Francis W. Quin C
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley C

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean C
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE C



2015/22



2015/23

Date of Vote: 27th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Amendment (14)
Proposed by: Deputy Y Burford
Seconded by: Deputy S J Ogier

To insert the following proposition between Propositions 38 and 39:

"38A. To direct the Treasury and Resources Department, after consultation with the Environment Department, Social Security Department, Commerce and Employment Department and Policy Council as appropriate, to lay before the States no later than March 2016 proposals to diversify the tax base by introducing or increasing environmental taxes, and to agree that a comprehensive energy efficiency programme to assist in mitigating any possible regressive effects of such taxes on low income households should form an integral part of such diversification."

CARRIED: Pour: 27 Contre: 17 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 3

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **P**
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **P**
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **P**
 Deputy Roger Domaille **P**
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois **P**
 Deputy Robert A. Jones **P**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **P**
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop **P**
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **P**
 Deputy Richard Conder **P**
 Deputy Martin J. Storey **A**
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb **P**
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel **C**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **P**
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **C**
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson **C**
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **C**
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier **P**
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **C**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **P**
 Deputy David B. Jones **C**
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **P**
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe **C**
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **P**
 Deputy Anthony Spruce **C**
 Deputy Garry M. Collins **C**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **P**
 Deputy Christopher J. Green **P**
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey **P**
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **C**
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **A**
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **A**
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam **P**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **P**
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **C**
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **P**
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle **C**
 Deputy Yvonne Burford **P**
 Deputy David A. Inglis **P**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **P**
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars **C**
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon **P**
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **C**
 Deputy Francis W. Quin **C**
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **P**

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **C**
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **C**



Date of Vote: 27th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Pursuant to Rule 16(a) of the
 Rules of Procedure
Proposed by: Deputy G St Pier

That the amendment annexed hereto be not debated and no vote be taken thereon.

CARRIED: Pour: 28 Contre: 15 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 4

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood P
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher P
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut C
 Deputy Roger Domaille P
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois P
 Deputy Robert A. Jones P

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc P
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop P
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne C
 Deputy Richard Conder C
 Deputy Martin J. Storey A
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb C
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel C

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier P
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart P
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson P
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley P
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier A
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott P

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize C
 Deputy David B. Jones C
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel C
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe C
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre C
 Deputy Anthony Spruce P
 Deputy Garry M. Collins C

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin P
 Deputy Christopher J. Green C
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey C
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint P
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq A
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE A
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam P

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot P
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard C
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie P
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle P
 Deputy Yvonne Burford C
 Deputy David A. Inglis P

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby P
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars P
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon P
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara P
 Deputy Francis W. Quin P
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley P

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean P
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE P



STATES OF DELIBERATION

24th March, 2015

**Billet d'État No. IV
Article 1**

AMENDMENT

Proposed by: Deputy M H Dorey
Seconded by: Deputy Laurie B Queripel

**Treasury & Resources Department & Social Security Department –
Planning a Sustainable Future – The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review**

To replace Proposition 4 as follows:

“4. To agree that:

- a) at their May 2015 meeting and in accordance with Rule 18 of the Rules relating to the Constitution and Operation of States Departments and Committees the States shall form the Population Policy Investigation Committee as a Special States Committee;
- b) the membership of that Committee shall comprise seven members of the States as follows:
 - i) A Chairman elected by the States who shall not be a member of the Commerce and Employment, Social Security, Environment or Housing Departments;
 - ii) 1 member of the Commerce and Employment Department determined by that Department;
 - iii) 1 member of the Social Security Department determined by that Department;
 - iv) 1 member of the Environment Department determined by that Department;
 - v) 1 member of the Housing Department determined by that Department;
 - vi) 2 other members elected by the States who shall not be a member of the Commerce and Employment, Social Security, Environment or Housing Departments;
- c) the mandate of that Committee shall be to review current population policy and a range of possible replacement population policies against the States Strategic Plan Statement of Aims; and to report to the States with recommendations to either continue the current policy or with any changes which they consider necessary by no later than July 2018.
- d) during the course of its deliberations that Committee shall consult with all relevant States' Committees, States' members and the general public.

Explanatory Note

The Statement of Aims in the current States Strategic Plan reads:

“The government of Guernsey aims to protect and improve:

- The quality of life of Islanders.
- The Island's economic future.
- The Island's environment, unique cultural identity and rich heritage.”

The current population policy which was agreed by the States in March 2007 is:

‘States policies should be consistent with maintaining Guernsey's population at approximately its current level.’



Date of Vote: 27th March, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: 1
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: Procedural Motion

That debate on Billet IV, Article 1, be adjourned to the April 2015 meeting of the States of Deliberation.

LOST: **Pour: 18** **Contre: 25** **Ne vote pas: 0** **Absent: 4**

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood C
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher C
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut P
 Deputy Roger Domaille C
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois C
 Deputy Robert A. Jones P

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc C
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop C
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne P
 Deputy Richard Conder P
 Deputy Martin J. Storey A
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb P
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel C

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier C
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart C
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson C
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley P
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier P
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott C

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize P
 Deputy David B. Jones P
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel P
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe C
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre P
 Deputy Anthony Spruce C
 Deputy Garry M. Collins C

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin P
 Deputy Christopher J. Green P
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey P
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint C
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq C
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE A
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam P

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot C
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard C
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie P
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle C
 Deputy Yvonne Burford P
 Deputy David A. Inglis C

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby C
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars C
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon C
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara P
 Deputy Francis W. Quin C
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley C

Alderney

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean A
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE A`

Date of Vote: 8th April, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: I
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: 6

"6. To amend the Fiscal Framework to place an upper limit on aggregate government income, incorporating General Revenue, Social Security contributions and fees and charges, such that total government income should not exceed 28% of Gross Domestic Product."

CARRIED: Pour: 23 Contre: 17 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 7

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **P**
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **P**
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **C**
 Deputy Roger Domaille **P**
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois **P**
 Deputy Robert A. Jones **C**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **P**
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop **P**
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **A**
 Deputy Richard Conder **C**
 Deputy Martin J. Storey **A**
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb **C**
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel **C**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **P**
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **P**
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson **P**
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **A**
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier **P**
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **P**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **C**
 Deputy David B. Jones **P**
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **C**
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe **C**
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **C**
 Deputy Anthony Spruce **P**
 Deputy Garry M. Collins **P**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **A**
 Deputy Christopher J. Green **C**
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey **C**
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **P**
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **P**
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **P**
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam **A**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **P**
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **C**
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **C**
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle **C**
 Deputy Yvonne Burford **A**
 Deputy David A. Inglis **P**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **P**
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars **C**
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon **P**
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **C**
 Deputy Francis W. Quin **P**
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **A**

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **C**
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **P**



2015/27

Date of Vote: 8th April, 2015

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: I
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
 Social Security Department
 Planning a Sustainable Future -
 The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: 30

"30. To agree to move towards a system of independent taxation in which all tax payers are treated as individuals, by removing the ability to transfer tax allowances between married couples or couples with children, with each tax payer being assessed on an individual basis, and direct the Treasury and Resources Department to bring forward proposals to effect this in its annual Budget Reports."

LOST: **Pour: 15** **Contre: 25** **Ne vote pas: 0** **Absent: 7**

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **C**
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **P**
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **C**
 Deputy Roger Domaille **P**
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois **P**
 Deputy Robert A. Jones **P**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **P**
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop **P**
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **A**
 Deputy Richard Conder **C**
 Deputy Martin J. Storey **A**
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb **C**
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel **C**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **P**
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **P**
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson **C**
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **A**
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier **C**
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **C**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **P**
 Deputy David B. Jones **C**
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **C**
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe **C**
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **C**
 Deputy Anthony Spruce **P**
 Deputy Garry M. Collins **P**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **A**
 Deputy Christopher J. Green **C**
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey **C**
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **C**
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **C**
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **P**
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam **A**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **P**
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **C**
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **C**
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle **C**
 Deputy Yvonne Burford **A**
 Deputy David A. Inglis **P**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **C**
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars **C**
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon **P**
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **C**
 Deputy Francis W. Quin **C**
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **A**

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **C**
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **C**

*Date of Vote: 8th April, 2015*

Billet d'État: IV of 2015
Article: I
Subject: Treasury & Resources Department and
Social Security Department
Planning a Sustainable Future -
The Personal Tax, Pensions and Benefits Review
Proposition: 38

"38. To agree that the States shall not introduce a broad-based consumption tax as described in that Report."

CARRIED: Pour: 21 Contre: 19 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 7

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **C**
Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **C**
Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **P**
Deputy Roger Domaille **C**
Deputy Allister H. Langlois **C**
Deputy Robert A. Jones **P**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **C**
Deputy John A. B. Gollop **C**
Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **A**
Deputy Richard Conder **P**
Deputy Martin J. Storey **A**
Deputy Elis G. Bebb **P**
Deputy Lester C. Queripel **P**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **C**
Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **C**
Deputy Peter L. Gillson **C**
Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **A**
Deputy Scott J. Ogier **P**
Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **P**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **C**
Deputy David B. Jones **P**
Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **P**
Deputy Mary M. Lowe **P**
Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **P**
Deputy Anthony Spruce **C**
Deputy Garry M. Collins **P**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **A**
Deputy Christopher J. Green **P**
Deputy Mark H. Dorey **P**
Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **C**
Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **C**
Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **C**
Deputy A. Hunter Adam **A**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **C**
Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **P**
Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **P**
Deputy David de G. De Lisle **C**
Deputy Yvonne Burford **A**
Deputy David A. Inglis **C**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **P**
Deputy Robert W. Sillars **P**
Deputy Paul A. Luxon **C**
Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **P**
Deputy Francis W. Quin **C**
Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **A**

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **P**
Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **P**