



Date of Vote: 24 November, 2015

Billet d'État: XX of 2015
Article: 10
Department: Health and Social Services Department
Subject: Arrangements for Secondary Healthcare
Proposition: Amendment
Proposed by: Deputy M P J Hadley
Seconded by: Deputy P A Sherbourne

To replace the propositions as follows:

1. To direct the Health and Social Services Department and the Social Security Department to enter into negotiations to renew the Secondary Healthcare Contract with the Medical Specialist Group.
2. To approve the transfer of £174,000 from the Budget Reserve to the 2015 revenue expenditure budget of the Health and Social Services Department and direct the Treasury and Resources Department to include £335,000 in the recommended Cash Limit for the Health and Social Services Department to fund the project.
3. To approve the payment of £165,00 to the Medical Specialist Group, subject to the approval of the detailed business case by Treasury and Resources Department, the Health and Social Services Department and the Social Security Department, for helping design and develop a future healthcare model for Guernsey in accordance with the agreement reached in the 2012 5 year financial review.”.

LOST: **Pour: 5 Contre: 40 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 1**

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **C**
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **C**
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **C**
 Deputy Roger Domaille **C**
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois **C**
 Deputy Robert A. Jones **C**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **C**
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop **C**
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **P**
 Deputy Richard Conder **C**
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb **C**
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel **C**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **C**
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **C**
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson **C**
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **C**
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier **C**
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **C**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **C**
 Deputy David B. Jones **A**
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **C**
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe **C**
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **C**
 Deputy Anthony Spruce **C**
 Deputy Garry M. Collins **C**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **C**
 Deputy Christopher J. Green **P**
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey **C**
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **C**
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **C**
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **C**
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam **C**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **C**
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **C**
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **C**
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle **C**
 Deputy Yvonne Burford **C**
 Deputy David A. Inglis **C**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **C**
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars **C**
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon **C**
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **C**
 Deputy Francis W. Quin **C**
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **P**

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **P**
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **P**



Date of Vote: 25 November, 2015

Billet d'État: XX of 2015
Article: 10
Department: Health and Social Services Department
Subject: Arrangements for Secondary Healthcare
Proposition: Amendment
Proposed by: Deputy A H Adam
Seconded by: Deputy A R Le Lievre

1. To delete Proposition 1 and replace it with a new Proposition 1 as follows:

"1. To agree that the Health and Social Services Department and the Social Security Department shall enter into negotiations with the Medical Specialist Group for the provision of secondary health care on a five year rolling contract based on the objectives set out in paragraph 15(a) of that Policy Letter and to agree that, subject to those negotiations leading to an acceptable contract based on the objectives set out in paragraph 15(a) of that Policy Letter, such a five year rolling contract should have effect from 1st January 2018 or sooner if possible."

2. To delete Proposition 3 and replace it with a new Proposition 3 as follows:

"3. To direct the Health and Social Services Department to report to the States with any recommendations it considers necessary in relation to the future provision of secondary healthcare if by the end of 2016 it appears to the Department that negotiations with the Medical Specialist Group are unlikely to lead to an acceptable five year rolling contract based on the objectives set out in paragraph 15(a) of that Policy Letter."



LOST: **Pour: 21 Contre: 24 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 1**

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood	C
Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher	P
Deputy Barry L. Brehaut	C
Deputy Roger Domaille	C
Deputy Allister H. Langlois	C
Deputy Robert A. Jones	P

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc	C
Deputy John A. B. Gollop	C
Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne	P
Deputy Richard Conder	C
Deputy Elis G. Bebb	C
Deputy Lester C. Queripel	P

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier	C
Deputy Kevin A. Stewart	C
Deputy Peter L. Gillson	C
Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley	P
Deputy Scott J. Ogier	C
Deputy Lyndon S. Trott	P

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize	P
Deputy David B. Jones	A
Deputy Laurie B. Queripel	P
Deputy Mary M. Lowe	P
Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre	P
Deputy Anthony Spruce	P
Deputy Garry M. Collins	P

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin	C
Deputy Christopher J. Green	P
Deputy Mark H. Dorey	P
Deputy Barry J. E. Paint	P
Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq	C
Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE	C
Deputy A. Hunter Adam	P

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot	C
Deputy Alvord H. Brouard	C
Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie	C
Deputy David de G. De Lisle	P
Deputy Yvonne Burford	C
Deputy David A. Inglis	C

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby	C
Deputy Robert W. Sillars	C
Deputy Paul A. Luxon	C
Deputy Michael G. O'Hara	C
Deputy Francis W. Quin	P
Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley	P

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean	P
Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE	P



Date of Vote: 25 November, 2015

Billet d'État: XX of 2015
Article: 10
Department: Health and Social Services Department
Subject: Arrangements for Secondary Healthcare
Proposition: Amendment
Proposed by: Deputy E G Bebb
Seconded by: Deputy M H Dorey

To add a further proposition 4 as follows:

4. To direct the Health and Social Services Department to investigate the creation of a company for the provision of services at the Princess Elizabeth Hospital; such a company will be a professionally managed, single organization responsible and accountable for the administration, clinical, and financial management of all hospital services; which either employs or contracts all staff including consultants, clinical, technical and management; and has a robust system for reporting on governance including clinical governance and complaints.

LOST: **Pour: 4 Contre: 40 Ne vote pas: 1 Absent: 1**

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **C**
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **C**
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **C**
 Deputy Roger Domaille **C**
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois **C**
 Deputy Robert A. Jones **C**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **C**
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop **P**
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **C**
 Deputy Richard Conder **C**
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb **P**
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel **P**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **C**
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **C**
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson **C**
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **C**
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier **C**
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **C**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **C**
 Deputy David B. Jones **A**
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **C**
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe **C**
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **C**
 Deputy Anthony Spruce **C**
 Deputy Garry M. Collins **C**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **C**
 Deputy Christopher J. Green **C**
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey **P**
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **C**
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **C**
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **C**
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam **C**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **C**
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **C**
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **C**
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle **C**
 Deputy Yvonne Burford **C**
 Deputy David A. Inglis **C**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **C**
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars **C**
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon **C**
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **C**
 Deputy Francis W. Quin **C**
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **N**

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **C**
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **C**



Date of Vote: 25 November, 2015

Billet d'État: XX of 2015
Article: 10
Department: Health and Social Services Department
Subject: Arrangements for Secondary Healthcare
Proposition: Propositions 1 & 2 (as amended)

1. To endorse the intention of the Health and Social Services Department and Social Security Department, on behalf of the States of Guernsey, to enter into negotiations, and subject to those negotiations leading to an acceptable form of contract based on the seven objectives set out in paragraph 15(a) of that Policy Letter, delivering the key benefits of the redesigned contract set out in Part II of that Policy Letter, including a single governance model with an additional independent complaints process beyond the existing internal complaints process, and for the MSG to report on all complaints as part of that single governance model, with the direct and indirect costs of handling and investigating complaints to be borne by the Medical Specialist Group, and subject to the flexibility of future service delivery being agreed by the parties, enter into a rolling contract from year to year subject to the right for either the HSSD or MSG to give to the other party not less than five years notice to terminate the contract, with the termination to take effect on an anniversary of the commencement date of the new contract. By way of example, with the expected contract commencement date of 1st January 2018, the first notice option would be on or before the 31st December 2018 with an expiry date of 1st January 2024.

2. To approve the transfer of £174,000 in 2015 and £335,000 in 2016 from the Budget Reserve to revenue expenditure budget of the Health and Social Services Department to fund the project.



CARRIED: **Pour: 44** **Contre: 1** **Ne vote pas: 0** **Absent: 1**

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **P**
Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **P**
Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **P**
Deputy Roger Domaile **P**
Deputy Allister H. Langlois **P**
Deputy Robert A. Jones **P**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **P**
Deputy John A. B. Gollop **P**
Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **P**
Deputy Richard Conder **P**
Deputy Elis G. Bebb **P**
Deputy Lester C. Queripel **P**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **P**
Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **P**
Deputy Peter L. Gillson **P**
Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **P**
Deputy Scott J. Ogier **P**
Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **P**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **P**
Deputy David B. Jones **A**
Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **P**
Deputy Mary M. Lowe **P**
Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **P**
Deputy Anthony Spruce **P**
Deputy Garry M. Collins **P**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **P**
Deputy Christopher J. Green **P**
Deputy Mark H. Dorey **P**
Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **P**
Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **P**
Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **P**
Deputy A. Hunter Adam **P**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **P**
Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **P**
Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **P**
Deputy David de G. De Lisle **P**
Deputy Yvonne Burford **P**
Deputy David A. Inglis **P**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **P**
Deputy Robert W. Sillars **P**
Deputy Paul A. Luxon **P**
Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **P**
Deputy Francis W. Quin **P**
Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **C**

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **P**
Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **P**



Date of Vote: 25 November, 2015

Billet d'État: XX of 2015
Article: 10
Department: Health and Social Services Department
Subject: Arrangements for Secondary Healthcare
Proposition: Proposition 3

3. That if negotiations with Medical Specialist Group do not lead to an acceptable form of contract generally in accordance with the proposals contained in that Policy Letter, to endorse the intention of the Health and Social Services Department to proceed to set up the direct internal provision of secondary healthcare and to directly provide secondary healthcare by no later than 1st January 2018.

CARRIED: Pour: 33 Contre: 12 Ne vote pas: 0 Absent: 1

St. Peter Port South

Deputy Peter A. Harwood **P**
 Deputy Jan Kuttelwascher **P**
 Deputy Barry L. Brehaut **P**
 Deputy Roger Domaillie **P**
 Deputy Allister H. Langlois **P**
 Deputy Robert A. Jones **C**

St. Peter Port North

Deputy Michelle K. Le Clerc **P**
 Deputy John A. B. Gollop **P**
 Deputy Peter A. Sherbourne **C**
 Deputy Richard Conder **P**
 Deputy Elis G. Bebb **P**
 Deputy Lester C. Queripel **P**

St. Sampson

Deputy Gavin A. St. Pier **P**
 Deputy Kevin A. Stewart **P**
 Deputy Peter L. Gillson **P**
 Deputy Paul R. Le Pelley **P**
 Deputy Scott J. Ogier **P**
 Deputy Lyndon S. Trott **P**

Vale

Deputy Matthew J. Fallaize **C**
 Deputy David B. Jones **A**
 Deputy Laurie B. Queripel **P**
 Deputy Mary M. Lowe **C**
 Deputy Andrew R. Le Lièvre **C**
 Deputy Anthony Spruce **C**
 Deputy Garry M. Collins **C**

Castel

Deputy Darren J. Duquemin **P**
 Deputy Christopher J. Green **C**
 Deputy Mark H. Dorey **C**
 Deputy Barry J. E. Paint **C**
 Deputy Jonathan P. Le Tocq **P**
 Deputy Sandra A. James, MBE **P**
 Deputy A. Hunter Adam **C**

West

Deputy Roger A. Perrot **P**
 Deputy Alvord H. Brouard **P**
 Deputy Arrun M. Wilkie **P**
 Deputy David de G. De Lisle **P**
 Deputy Yvonne Burford **P**
 Deputy David A. Inglis **P**

South-East

Deputy Heidi J. R. Soulsby **P**
 Deputy Robert W. Sillars **P**
 Deputy Paul A. Luxon **P**
 Deputy Michael G. O'Hara **P**
 Deputy Francis W. Quin **P**
 Deputy Michael P. J. Hadley **C**

Alderney Representative Louis E. Jean **P**
 Alderney Representative S. D. Graham McKinley, OBE **P**